



ESP Discussion Paper Series

17677

Donor Coordination for Education: The Case of Jamaica

**Marlaine Lockheed, Linda Larach
and
Theresa Moran**

April 1995

**Education and Social Policy Department
Human Resources Development and Operations Policy
The World Bank**

ESP Discussion Papers reflect work in progress. They are intended to make lessons emerging from the current work program available to operational staff quickly and easily, as well as to stimulate discussion and comment. They also serve as the building blocks for subsequent policy and best practice papers. The views expressed here are those of the authors and should not be attributed to the World Bank or its Board of Executive Directors or the countries they represent.

ABSTRACT:***Donor Coordination for Education: The Case of Jamaica***

The past several decades have witnessed changes in development coordination. There has been a shift in emphasis in aid programs from bilateral to multilateral assistance and an overall increase in donor cooperation in development programs and policies. Donor coordination has especially been significant in maximizing diminishing resources and promoting greater efficiencies.

Donor support for the Jamaican education sector provides a good example of relatively strong donor coordination. This paper (a) provides an overview of recent donor support for education in Jamaica, (b) describes donor coordination for education under a broad social-sector umbrella program, the Human Resources Development Program (HRDP), and (c) indicates how the HRDP provided a structure for further donor coordination.

The paper illustrates how donors are cooperating to improve Jamaica's educational system. Whether formally or informally, donors are overcoming barriers impeding donor cooperation. Through programs such as the HRDP, a co-ordinated attempt is being made to maximize diminishing resources and promote greater efficiencies. The GOJ and nine different agencies, through nineteen different projects, are assisting all levels and areas of the educational system. Their efforts are characterized by:

- an emphasis on primary education, in accordance with Government efforts to improve the quality of Grades 1-6;
- more frequent support for teachers, instructional materials, and construction and civil works than for educational management, testing and assessment, planning and policy, and other areas; and
- being guided by a seemingly coherent sector policy approach and by the agencies' areas of specialization and financial capacities.

Table of Contents

	Page
I. Introduction	1
II. Donors to Education in Jamaica, 1990-1993	1
Level of financing	1
Educational Levels	2
Pre-primary and Primary	2
Secondary	2
Vocational/Technical/Higher	2
General Management and Administration	2
III. The Human Resource Development Program (HRDP)	3
HRDP Management	3
Secretariat	3
MOE Project Implementation Units	3
Table 1: Donor Support for Education in Jamaica (including GOJ), 1990-1993	5
Policy Matrix	6
Parallel Financing	6
World Bank	7
Jamaica: Human Resources Development Program Policy Matrix for Education (1989)	8
UNDP	9
ODA	9
WFP	9
GOJ	9
Annual Reviews	10
IV. Other Donor Coordination	10
Coordination around the HRDP	10
Textbooks and Instructional Materials	11
Testing and Assessment	11
New Areas Identified for Coordination	11
Teacher Training	11
Construction and Civil Works	12
Educational Management	12
Curriculum Development	12
Planning and Policy	12
Others	13
Summary	13
V. Lessons Learned	14
References	15
Principal Abbreviations and Acronyms Used	16
Annexes	17

Donor Coordination for Education: The Case of Jamaica

I. Introduction

1. The past several decades have witnessed significant changes in development coordination. Emphasis in the total aid package has shifted from bilateral to multilateral assistance. This has been combined with an overall increase in donor cooperation in development programs and policies. Donor coordination has been especially important for promoting efficiencies in grant and loan programs.

2. In the education sector, donors have coordinated their interventions through parallel financing, co-financing and cooperation for world-wide endeavors such as the World Conference on Education for All. Co-financing in World Bank education projects, for example, rose from 7% of projects from 1968-1972 to 37% of projects in the 1988-1992 period.

3. Donor support for education in Jamaica provides a good example of relatively strong donor coordination. This paper (a) provides an overview of recent donor support for education in Jamaica, (b) describes donor coordination for education under a broad social-sector umbrella program, the Human Resources Development Program, and (c) indicates how the HRDP provided a structure for further donor coordination.

II. Donors to Education in Jamaica, 1990-1993

4. In Jamaica, from 1990-1993, 18 donor-funded projects and one project that is solely funded by the Government of Jamaica (GOJ)¹ have supported education. The eighteen donor projects have been funded by nine different agencies: World Bank, Inter-American Development Bank (IDB), United Nations Development Program (UNDP), Canadian International Development Agency (CIDA), Overseas Development Agency (ODA), United States Agency for International Development (USAID), Organization of American States (OAS), UNESCO and World Food Program (WFP). All but two projects -- the World Bank-financed Social Sector Development Project (SSDP) and the IDB-financed Rural Township Development Program (RTDP) -- are specific to education. The SSDP also supports the health sector and the RTDP supports education only indirectly, by financing civil works to upgrade secondary schools in selected towns damaged by the 1988 Hurricane Gilbert.

Level of Financing

5. Larger donors provide more support for a larger number of projects than do smaller donors. Across all 19 projects (including the GOJ project) approximately US\$397 million supported education for projects with total costs which ranged from US\$0.2 million to US\$80 million. Excluding the RTDP (US\$45 million), a total of about US\$350 million was committed for these education projects, of which approximately 63% was donor financed, 7% was formally co-financed, and 30% was provided by the Government of Jamaica (GOJ). Details are provided in Annex 1.

¹ For all acronyms and abbreviations, please refer to the list on page 16.

6. The World Bank and the IDB, the largest donors, support four projects each and provide together about 84% of the total amount of available donor funds (US\$247-626 million). USAID provides about 9% of total donor funds through two projects. UNDP and CIDA fund two projects each, totaling together only about 1% of donor funds. ODA, OAS, UNESCO, WFP each support one project and together provide approximately 7% of total donor funds.

Educational Levels

7. Although donors have supported all levels of the educational system, major emphasis has been placed on primary education, motivated by Government efforts to improve the quality of Grades 1-6 and by the evolving world-wide concern for the quality of basic education, stemming in large part from the World Conference on Education for All. Nonetheless, support for secondary education is coming into focus, as exemplified by the recently approved Reform of Secondary Education (ROSE) project. The Government's major reform of secondary education, which was officially adopted in May 1991, guides donor support for this area. Support for technical/vocational education, tertiary education, and general management and administration is less frequent yet these levels are not neglected.

8. *Pre-primary and Primary.* Most donor activity concentrates on primary education, reinforcing the government's policies regarding improving education quality in Grades 1-6. Two agencies (World Bank and WFP) support pre-primary education through two separately funded projects, and five donors (World Bank, IDB, USAID, CIDA, and OAS) support primary education through eight different projects. Three of these eight projects (two successive IDB-financed projects and the USAID-financed Primary Education Assistance Project II) are directed entirely at primary education.

9. *Secondary.* At the secondary education level, donor interventions are of a smaller scale. Six different donors (World Bank, IDB, CIDA, UNDP, ODA, and UNESCO) finance projects for secondary education; the GOJ also has one project at this level. Although there are about as many donors supporting secondary education as there are supporting primary education, only one project supported by the World Bank, comprehensively addresses the GOJ's policies for secondary education reform. The other eight projects that support secondary education are smaller and focus only on narrow issues, such as textbooks, civil works or graduate tracer studies. All projects, nevertheless, advance the Government's major reform of secondary education, which was officially adopted in May 1991.

10. *Vocational/Technical/Higher.* Support for vocational/technical education has been scanty but substantial resources have been directed toward higher education. USAID financed a US\$59.9 million Basic Skills Training Project that was targeted at vocational education. In contrast, for tertiary education, the IDB, the Caribbean Development Bank and the University of West Indies (UWI) joined funds to finance a \$80 million ten-year development plan for the UWI. Furthermore, the World Bank, through the Reform of Secondary Education (ROSE) project, also indirectly supports higher education.

11. *General Management and Administration* Three agencies (World Bank, IDB and UNDP) have financed projects to strengthen general education management and administration. Only one project -- the UNDP-supported Education Sector Management project (US\$500,000) -- was designed specifically for this purpose; it assists the MOEC's Projects Division to improve its project management capability.

III. The Human Resource Development Program (HRDP)

12. In 1987, the GOJ conceived the Social Well-Being Program (SWP) in order to renew investments in the neglected and rapidly deteriorating social services. By addressing investments in health, education, nutrition and employment programs simultaneously, the SWP offered a social dimension to the major Jamaican economic adjustment process. In 1990, the SWP was modified and launched as the Human Resources Development Program (HRDP), with support from the World Bank. Presently, the HRDP coordinates, facilitates and monitors the implementation of 19 projects in health, education² and nutrition, and institutional and policy reforms in the social sectors. While the HRDP program is modest in size, with donor support to education under the HRDP amounting to only about 15% of all donor support to education in Jamaica, 1990-1993, it has played an important role in strengthening donor cooperation.

HRDP Management

13. Management responsibilities for the HRDP is divided between the Secretariat and Project Implementation Units (PIUs) in each ministry. The Secretariat is responsible for the general management and monitoring of the HRDP and each PIU is accountable for more specific sectorial issues. An important characteristic of the system is its monitoring system, which includes the annual progress reviews and the Survey of Living Conditions. These monitoring tools not only provide donors with information on progress towards project targets and on project impact, but guide improvements that respond to new needs or circumstances. Regular meetings of donors in connection with the HRDP annual review has resulted in increased informal contact among donors. This has resulted in greater coordination in areas not formally part of the HRDP.

14. *Secretariat.* The Secretariat in the PIOJ performs a central management coordinating function, works closely with the ministerial units in a facilitating and trouble-shooting capacity, and is responsible for monitoring the impact of the HRDP on socioeconomic conditions. It monitors the progress of all project components, processes all disbursement claims for the SSDP, and reports regularly to the World Bank on the progress of the overall HRDP. For the effective execution of its program coordination and monitoring role, the HRDP Secretariat has in place a monitoring system which provides regular and detailed information on HRDP and also serves as an early warning system for dealing with potential problems. Furthermore, the Secretariat also monitors the HRDP by collecting institution based statistics (Institution Based Monitoring System - IBMS) and by periodically carrying out household surveys (the Survey of Living Conditions - SLC). The statistics from the IBMS serve as preliminary measures of the efficiency of the HRDP and indicate the status of program implementation, whereas the SLC measures the impact of HRDP implementation on socioeconomic conditions and forms the basis for periodic adjustments in the focus and design of the HRDP.

15. *MOE Project Implementation Units.* The Project Implementation Unit (PIU) in the Ministry of Education falls under the umbrella of the already existing Projects Management Division (PMD). The Director of the PMD has the overall responsibility for monitoring and reporting on projects. However, the director receives strong support from the Project Manager of the SSDP, who also is the manager of the

² There are 7 HRDP projects in education: the UNDP supported Education Sector Management Project (ESMP), the World Bank's SSDP, the GOJ's Secondary Schools Upgrading, the WFP's school feeding project, the Bank-financed Education Preparation Program and ROSE studies, the ODA financed Secondary School Textbooks, and the Bank-financed PACE.

UNDP-financed ESMP, in tasks related to overall HRDP project monitoring and coordinating. The Director of Projects is also responsible for liaising with the PIOJ and presenting reports to the Secretariat and the HRDP's Steering Committee.

16. The HRDP coordinates donor efforts in three ways: (a) under an umbrella program focused on policy changes (the "policy matrix"), (b) through parallel financing of projects, and (c) through annual reviews of progress. The World Bank has played a central role in these efforts. In 1989, the GOJ asked the World Bank to participate in the financing of its HRDP and to take the lead in securing further external support. Consequently, the Bank project preparation process included meetings with potential donors. Before project negotiations, the GOJ and the World Bank had already met with other potential donors in June, November, and March of 1989. Initially, eleven bilateral and multilateral agencies were committed to supporting the HRDP, although only four non-GOJ institutions have formally participated to date. To monitor progress and sustain cooperation, the GOJ agreed to conduct annual donor coordination meetings in conjunction with annual progress reviews.

Table 1: Donor Support for Education in Jamaica (including GOJ), 1990-1993

	Donors, HRDP Projects	Donors, Non-HRDP Projects
HRDP Policy Matrix Areas for Support		
1. Textbooks (9)*	(2) WB, ODA	(7) WB, IDB, USAID, CIDA, OAS, GOJ
2. Monitoring impact of education (5)	(2) WB, UNDP	(3) WB, IDB
3. Evaluating change in social indicators (1)		(1) WB
4. Budget increase		
5. Community involvement in school maintenance		
6. Incentives for key MOE personnel		
Areas for Support Outside HRDP Policy Matrix		
7. Teacher Training (11)	(5) WB, UNDP, ODA	(6) WB, IDB, USAID, OAS, GOJ
8. Civil Works (9)	(3) WB	(6) WB, IDB, USAID, GOJ
9. Management (7)	(3) WB, UNDP	(4) WB, USAID, GOJ
10. Curriculum Development (6)	(2) WB	(4) WB, USAID, IDB
11. Planning and Policy (5)	(1) WB	(4) WB**, UNDP, USAID, Unesco
12. Other (5)	(3) WB, WFP	(2) WB, IDB

Notes: * the number in parentheses is the number of projects; ** the Social Policy Analysis component is supported entirely by a grant from the Government of the Netherlands

Policy Matrix

17. The HRDP education component has been guided by a coherent but modest sector development plan, summarized in a "policy matrix." The underlying philosophy of the GOJ's Five Year Development Plan (1990-1995) is that education should be the right of all citizens and not the privilege of a few, and that the quality of educational inputs should be such as to enhance personal, social and economic development and prepare citizens for changing roles in a dynamic socioeconomic environment (Davis 1992). The plan emphasizes improvements in the overall quality of the educational system; more specifically, its policy objectives are to: (a) increase budgetary provisions for pre-primary and primary education; (b) encourage community participation in school activities and maintenance; (c) improve the availability of textbooks, contain primary level textbook costs and recover costs for textbooks at the secondary level; (d) monitor better the impact of education programs; (e) evaluate change in social indicators through household and institutional surveys, and (f) provide incentives for key MOEC personnel (See HRDP policy matrix).

18. Donors chose to support programs designed to meet the HRDP policy objectives for education. Three of those objectives were not donor supported: (a) increase budgetary provisions, (b) encourage community participation, (c) incentives for key MOEC personnel. The activities that qualified for external financing included: (a) strengthening MOEC by supporting evaluation/monitoring, technical assistance, training and equipment; (b) contributing to quality improvements in primary education by financing the provision of textbooks for all students, student and teacher guides, basic school materials for needy students, incentives for teachers, and a national assessment program; (c) upgrading basic schools by supporting salary supplements for teachers and building materials for school construction and/or improvements; (d) contributing to upgrading primary and all-age schools by renovation and refurbishment; and (e) upgrading new secondary schools by supporting improvements to physical facilities, and curriculum and teacher upgrading. They also supported school feeding programs.

19. The HRDP policy matrix reflects narrow and limited education objectives and offers incomplete guidance for investment in the education sector, especially with respect to the wide range of opportunities provided by the donors in Jamaica. The question then arises: has the policy matrix influenced donors, and if so, how? It has, in two ways. First it provided a general stimulus and overall framework for donor coordination in Jamaica, with the donors then providing funding in those areas in which they have done so traditionally.

20. Second, the program has also had great value as a yearly forum, bringing together donors working in Jamaica. An unintended by-product of this annual gathering has been informal donor coordination, in contrast to HRDP government sponsored coordination. This donor coordination, guided by an expanded vision of education, supports a broader range of projects than those outlined in the HRDP policy matrix, and has helped to reduce duplication in funding across the sector.

Parallel Financing

21. The seven programs and projects that provide support for education under the HRDP are supported by five different institutions, each providing assistance which has reflected the institution's comparative advantage. Having the easiest access to funds and much multisectoral expertise, the World Bank took an active role in cooperating with the GOJ to develop the HRDP; it finances the largest number of projects,

supports the most variety of activities, and addresses all three educational levels: pre-primary, primary, and secondary. With fewer funds available, the GOJ and ODA-financed projects are targeted at secondary education. The ODA-supported project specializes in textbook provision and the GOJ SSUP project concentrates on upgrading secondary schools. The World Food Program is highly specialized in nutrition programs as defined by its particular mandate. The UNDP particularly assists the government in areas of management and planning.

22. *World Bank.* The World Bank funds three of the seven HRDP projects: (a) the SSDP overall, (b) Program for the Advancement of Childhood Education (PACE)³, and (c) the Education Program Preparation and Student Loan Project (EPP&SL). The SSDP is the central HRDP project and in education, it supports four activities: (a) early childhood activities through the PACE program, which concentrates on pre-primary education--and supports construction and civil works, teacher training and professional development, teacher salary subsidies, recognition grants, instructional materials, equipment, furniture and other goods for this educational level; (b) upgrading primary and all-age schools; (c) provision of textbooks for primary schools; and (d) education sector decentralization and institutional strengthening through training for professional MOE staff and teachers; and a pilot test of an incentive scheme to improve school level administration.

23. In contrast to the SSDP which emphasizes pre-primary and primary education, the EPP&SL project supports activities and studies needed to prepare at lower secondary education. The EPP&SL provides for the consolidation of grades 7-9 of twenty small all-age schools into Grades 7-9 of four larger central schools and for teacher training in the use of textbooks, multigrade teaching, student evaluation, curriculum content and development, educational administration, and use of community resources for school activities. The EPP&SL also attempts to improve MOE's capabilities in education planning and administration by providing training and fellowships for education and managerial staff of MOE and by funding the acquisition and utilization of microcomputer systems⁴.

³ PACE is supported through SSDP overall.

⁴ The student loan aspect of the EPP&SL provides support for strengthening the financial mechanisms for student loans at the tertiary level.

JAMAICA
Human Resources Development Program
Policy Matrix for Education (1989)

**POLICY OBJECTIVES/
PROGRAMS**

ACTIONS TO BE TAKEN AND TIMING¹

Increased budgetary provisions for pre-primary and primary education

Relative share of pre- primary and primary education out of the MOE recurrent expenditures to reach 36% by April 1, 1990 and 38% by April 1, 1992.

Community involvement in maintenance of schools

Study on the decentralization of school administration and the creation of local community committees to support school maintenance completed by December 31, 1989; dependent on study outcome and pilot experience, set up committees in no fewer than 50 schools by December 31, 1990 and in at least 200 schools by December 31, 1991. Thereafter, extend to all primary and all-age schools.

Improved availability of textbooks and containment of primary level textbook costs and recovery of secondary level textbook costs.

(i) By September 1, 1992, provide to all primary students textbooks on core subjects.

(ii) Introduce secondary level textbook rental scheme for four core subjects (grades 7-11) by September 1, 1991.

(iii) Complete the ongoing study on the feasibility of cost containment for primary textbooks by September 30, 1990 and, if judged feasible, introduce by September 30, 1991, measures for cost containment and thereafter analyze the impact.

Better monitoring of impact of education program

(i) Prepare by December 31, 1989 proposals satisfactory to the Bank, to improve the quality of the NAP tests, their administration and dissemination of their results. Implement agreed action plan by September 1, 1990.

(ii) Following two administrations of achievement tests, conduct curriculum evaluation review by December 31, 1991.

Use of Living Standards Measurement System (LSMS) and other institution-based monitoring systems, as relevant, to evaluate change in key social indicators.

The Government will conduct semiannual surveys to evaluate changes in key social sector indicators. Second survey scheduled for June/July 1989.

¹ Indicative dates, subject to review and confirmation at annual HRDP Progress Reviews and planning meetings between the Government of Jamaica and the Bank.

24. The functions the World Bank executes in the HRDP reflect some of the comparative advantages the Bank has as a donor agency. First, the Bank has, and is playing a leading role in assisting the GOJ in planning and executing the HRDP, including the implementation of necessary policy reforms. Such participation in the HRDP process reflects the World Bank's recognized strength in sectoral analysis and research capacities, and its unique multi-sectoral ability to assist the government with policy development. Second, for the three projects, the World Bank has financed a total of US\$19.9 million (45%). Only institutions such as the World Bank, the IDB, and USAID have easy access to substantial amounts of resources, thus making them better candidates to support a larger number of programs, particularly those that are resource intensive.

25. *UNDP.* UNDP also complements the SSDP through the Education Sector Management Project (ESMP). As mentioned above, the ESMP aims at helping the MOE improve its capacity to plan, implement, manage, and evaluate projects under the HRDP and at supporting the institutionalization of an on-going program of in-service training for the professional development of education personnel. The project provides for: (a) the establishment of a Project Implementation Unit, (b) a management audit and proposal for rationalization of the Projects, Construction and Maintenance Division; (c) the establishment of systems and procedures for the collection, updating, storage, retrieval and dissemination of data; (d) the procurement of communication equipment for the decentralization process; (e) the production of instruments to record the impact of primary education (the National Assessment Program); and (f) the development of terms of reference and program documents for the Professional Development Unit and for identifying materials for the Education Media Services Unit. UNDP's support for the Project Implementation Unit, a key agency in the implementation process, is particularly important for the HRDP.

26. The choice to finance these managerial areas coincides with UNDP's comparative advantage in the education sector. As UNDP is not a specialized agency, its capacity to support technical educational areas such as curriculum development or textbook production is limited. Nevertheless, UNDP's experience as the designated coordinator of UN agencies at the country level made it a logical agency to provide support for the establishment and development of the Project Implementation Unit.

27. *ODA.* Although the SSDP supports the provision of textbooks to 350,000 primary school students, it does not support textbook provision for secondary education. Thus, the ODA-financed Secondary Textbooks Project (STP) concentrates its efforts in this area. The STP provides for: (a) textbooks in math, social science, biology, chemistry, English, integrated science, geography, history, and for some technical/vocational schools; (b) textbooks for over 60,000 low ability children; (c) writers workshops on text development for low ability children; (d) training for 6,000 teachers in the effective use of textbooks and preparing students for SSC and CXC exams. Since ODA is a smaller institution, with fewer funds available than, for example, the World Bank, it has, in Jamaica, maximized its available resources and expertise by concentrating on one specific area. Furthermore, ODA has had numerous experiences in supporting textbook development programs.

28. *WTP.* Unlike the education-specific programs financed by other donors, the World Food Program (WTP) supports a cross-sectoral nutrition program. The program packages milk centrally and produces fortified buns for daily distribution among school children. Through the HRDP project, the WTP is assisting the GOJ to progressively improve the targeting of this school feeding program towards poor children in the earlier years of schooling and to broaden its scope to cover more students.

29. *GOJ.* The GOJ is involved in all projects but also has a project that is only GOJ financed: the Secondary Schools Upgrading Project (SSUP). This project provides financing for the upgrading of secondary schools, one of areas not fully covered in the World Bank-financed SSDP. The SSUP attempts

to: (a) refurbish new secondary schools; (b) equip the schools with the necessary equipment and teaching aids; (c) conduct management workshops for principals and bursars of the reclassified schools; (d) upgrade the skills of teachers of grades 7 through 10 in various subject areas; and (e) award scholarships for courses at the University of the West Indies to teaching staff of these schools.

Annual Reviews

30. A unique element of the HRDP program is the annual review meeting, which brings the GOJ and the donors together to review progress against the "policy matrix." The annual review is a formal meeting lasting two to three days; it comprises both working sessions and a special session on donor coordination. Donors are invited to most of the working sessions, as well as to the donor coordination session. The topic of the meeting varies annually, but typically addresses both policies and project implementation. At the policy level, the review evaluates progress made against the contents of the HRDP policy matrix, including targets for intrasectoral budget allocations which reflect the priorities contained elsewhere in the matrix. With regard to the implementation of individual social sector projects, attention has been paid to the availability -- or lack thereof -- of funds made available to the MOEC. Despite the success of the HRDP in mobilizing additional external resources for rebuilding the social sectors, actual expenditures using these resources have been constrained.

31. Donors others than those officially under the HRDP are included in the annual review meetings. In part, this is because the seven projects initially identified as supporting the HRDP are at various stages of completion, and there is considerable uncertainty regarding how new projects are incorporated under the HRDP umbrella. For example, three projects USAID-supported PEAP-11, World Bank-supported ROSE and IDB-supported PPII would all be appropriate for identification with HRDP, but formal incorporation has not occurred to date. Formal incorporation would require the preparation of an "additional layer" of reporting forms as well as having all financial reports monitored through the HRDP secretariat. In the absence of formal incorporation, the face-to-face discussion of these issues among donors and the GOJ during the annual HRDP review has improved coordination among donors as illustrated in the following section.

IV. Other Donor Coordination

32. Seven education projects fell under the Jamaica Human Resource Development Program and twelve fell outside the HRDP. Four donors⁵ participate formally in the HRDP, while another five do not. Non-HRDP donor activity has converged around two areas covered by the HRDP policy matrix -- textbooks and testing and assessment -- and five areas outside this matrix. Areas not covered by the matrix are those much more often associated with education sector projects and -- with two exceptions, management and planning and policy-- are more central to teaching and learning.

Coordination around the HRDP

33. Donors not a part of the HRDP donor group have provided support for textbook projects and projects to monitor education impacts, both elements of the HRDP policy matrix. Projects supporting

⁵ The GOJ is not, of course a donor and therefore GOJ support for education does not figure in this section although mention on the areas in which the GOJ has been active is included.

textbooks, however, have been conceived more broadly to include a range of instructional materials, and monitoring the impact of education programs has included testing activities restricted to the classroom.

34. *Textbooks and Instructional Materials.* Nine projects support textbooks and instructional materials; among HRDP "policy matrix" topics, this is the area with the most donor involvement. In addition to the World Bank and ODA projects under the HRDP, seven projects supported by six donors (including the GOJ) finance textbooks and instructional materials. CIDA has provided paper needed to produce over 2.5 million primary school textbooks through two projects and is extending its textbook support activities to lower secondary level through additional provision of paper. OAS has supported the development and distribution of teaching aids for mathematics, language, science and social studies. The IDB has supported library services for primary schools. Other instructional materials have been provided by USAID, which has equipped technical high schools with appropriate institutional technology, materials and teaching aids, and OAS, which has provided 30 primary schools with equipment and materials.

35. *Testing and Assessment.* Five projects support testing and assessment activities. World Bank and UNDP projects support educational testing as a method for monitoring the impact of educational programs, one of the HRDP "policy matrix" topics. In addition, three other projects outside the HRDP support testing. The World Bank is supporting the development of an evaluation system to monitor the impact of the reform lower secondary curriculum on student achievement, the development of an appropriate grade 9 test for this purpose, and the rationalization of the examination system in Jamaica. The IDB has supported the establishment and continued development of the National Assessment System, particularly at the primary level.

New Areas Identified for Coordination

36. Both HRDP donors and non-HRDP donors have concentrated much of their support for education in Jamaica on areas not covered by the HRDP: teacher training, civil works, management, curriculum development, and planning and policy.

37. *Teacher Training.* Eleven projects have supported teacher training, with support provided about equally by HRDP projects and non-HRDP projects. Although teacher training is not part of the HRDP "policy matrix," HRDP projects have supported it. The World Bank has supported tertiary training for 125 pre-primary teachers and 200 secondary teachers, teacher upgrading for 2,000 primary teachers, and in-service training for 4,000 basic school teachers and secondary teachers implementing the new lower secondary curriculum and provided about 100 staff months of consultancy in specific areas of in-service teacher education and career education. The UNDP has established the Institution of Professional Development for teachers. The ODA has supported teacher workshops for 6000 secondary teachers in the effective use of textbooks and on preparing students for secondary certification examinations. In addition, through non-HRDP projects, the Bank will provide pre-service and in-service training of teachers and school administrators related to the introduction of the reform lower secondary curriculum.

38. Non-HRDP donors have also supported teacher training. The IDB has provided training and upgrading support for primary teachers, USAID has provided in-service training for project personnel and has upgraded lecturers in the Industrial Education Training Program at CAST, and the OAS has trained primary school educators in multi-grade teaching. The GOJ has supported subject specialist training for all teachers of grades 7-10 at 17 upgraded secondary schools and has awarded secondary teachers with scholarships for tertiary education.

39. *Construction and Civil Works.* Nine projects have supported civil works, with twice as many non-HRDP projects as HRDP projects providing support for this activity. Under the HRDP, the World Bank refurbished and extended 20 primary and all-age schools, refurbished or replaced 66 basic schools, upgraded three and constructed one all-age school, and constructed and equipped 6 regional MOEC offices. In addition, outside HRDP projects, the World Bank will improve all-age schools adopting the new reform lower secondary curriculum. USAID has upgraded and equipped a resource center for the Technical and Vocational Unit of the MOEC. The IDB has built or renovated 543 primary schools, providing about 29,000 new student places, and upgraded secondary schools in selected towns damaged by Hurricane Gilbert. The GOJ has upgraded 79 new secondary schools and equipped 36 schools undergoing upgrading.

40. *Educational Management.* Seven projects have supported strengthening educational management, three under the HRDP and four outside the HRDP⁶. Most of the support in the area of educational management is directed at the level of general management and administration, more specifically at the MOE, regional offices and project implementation units. Under the HRDP, the World Bank provided twenty-two man-months of technical assistance for: (a) education administration and management, (b) MIS and computer applications for personnel and financial management; and (c) a school award incentive program. It also provided: (a) 191 staff-months of fellowships to education officers, building officers, and principals, and (b) pre-service and in-service training of school administrators in issues related to the introduction of a common curriculum in grades 7-9. Finally, it supported educational decentralization, the establishment of a PIU and postgraduate training for 20 professional staff in the MOEC. The UNDP also has supported decentralization and a MIS system.

41. Projects outside the HRDP have supported education sector management as well, through both training and support for decentralization. With World Bank funding, a strengthened management team will ensure that the lower secondary reforms are adequately supported and integrated into all relevant MOE functional units. USAID supported principal training for school management and provided other support to the MOEC to facilitate decentralization. It also supported the development of a MIS for technical high schools and the Technical and Vocational Unit of the MOEC. The GOJ supports management improvement specific to secondary education and is providing general management training for all administrative staff and principals of 17 new secondary schools which have been upgraded to high schools or comprehensive higher schools.

42. *Curriculum Development.* Six projects provide support for curriculum evaluation and development. The World Bank supported the upgrading and development of pre-school curriculum and the development and pilot testing of the reform lower secondary curriculum under HRDP projects. Outside the HRDP, the Bank will support the introduction and continuous assessment of this curriculum in seventy-two all-age and new secondary schools. Also outside the HRDP, USAID is standardizing technical and vocational programs and is assisting the MOEC to improve delivery of mathematics education in Grades 1-6. The IDB is evaluating and revising the non-mathematics primary curriculum. In higher education, the World Bank (with grant funding from the Government of the Netherlands) is supporting the upgrading of graduate training in policy analysis at the University of the West, Indies.

43. *Planning and Policy.* Five projects have supported strengthening planning and policy analysis, but with one important exception, most donor support in this area has been in the form of studies. The World Bank supported Reform of Secondary Education (ROSE) Project is the only donor-supported project that includes a comprehensive component to improve the capacity of the Government to undertake social

⁶ Improved management for the MOEC was not part of the policy matrix, although significant support for this topic was provided by the SSDP, the EPP&SL and the ESMP.

policy analysis and integrate the findings to formulate more effective and targeted social sector programs. Although the ROSE project is mostly World Bank-financed, this specific component is funded by the Netherlands.

44. The World Bank, UNDP, and UNESCO have supported studies that aim at aiding the planning and development process for secondary education. The World Bank under HRDP has supported studies on unit costs of secondary education, school administration and maintenance, and secondary education reform and studies and pilot programs for improving upper secondary education, Grades 10-13. The UNDP has financed a survey of 250 graduates of a representative sample of secondary schools to determine the placement and suitability of these graduates for the labor market or tertiary education. UNESCO has financed the preparation of school maps for each parish in anticipation of rationalizing the secondary school network.

45. *Others.* Five projects support other miscellaneous activities. These include: (a) nutrition, (b) student loans, (c) public awareness, (d) recognition grants for newly recognized pre-primary schools; (e) institutional development components specifically related to improving and/or expanding teaching and research at UWI; and (f) regional component to strengthen UWI outreach services to non-campus countries and off-campus students. Nutrition programs are supported by the WFP and by the World Bank. The World Bank also funded recognition grants for pre-primary schools and a public awareness campaign to inform key stakeholders and the general public about the benefits of the secondary education reform. The UWI strengthening activities are all financed by the IDB.

46. *Summary.* Teacher training, textbooks and instructional materials, and construction and civil works are the areas supported by the largest number of projects and donors. This is not surprising, considering their scope, complexity and importance. Ensuring that teachers are trained, students have available appropriate instructional materials, and physical space is sufficient to accommodate all students and all schools receive adequate maintenance, is a costly and intricate task. The immensity of this task demands donor coordination and cooperation. Only one of these three high-priority areas -- textbooks and instructional materials -- however, is addressed by the HRDP policy matrix and is, therefore, subject to the stringency of formal donor cooperation and review. However, recognizing the importance of teacher training and construction and civil works, informal donor coordination has converged to support these areas.

47. Ensuring that schools are adequately supplied with necessary inputs and that the MOEC has the capacity to monitor the impact of its programs -- both elements of the HRDP policy matrix -- requires strengthened educational management, testing and assessment, and policy and planning. Although donor support in these areas has been less frequent, donor coordination in these areas is just as important, for two reasons. First, the amount of resources available for these areas is smaller and Jamaica has been reluctant to borrow for them. Thus, co-financing, such as between the World Bank and the Government of the Netherlands for the Social Policy Analysis component of the Reform of Secondary Education project, is an important strategy. Second, these are areas in which, historically, the absence of donor cooperation has led to redundancy in the provision of support. In order to maximize available resources, donors need to cooperate to avoid duplication of efforts and focus their assistance efficiently in accordance with their areas of expertise.

V. Lessons Learned

48. In conclusion, donors are cooperating to improve Jamaica's educational system. The GOJ and nine different agencies, through nineteen different projects, are assisting all levels and areas of the educational system. Their efforts are characterized by:

- improve the quality of Grades 1-6; an emphasis on primary education, in accordance with Government efforts to
- more frequent support for teachers, textbooks and instructional materials, and construction and civil works than for educational management, testing and assessment, planning and policy, and other areas; and
- being guided by a seemingly coherent sector policy approach and by the agencies' areas of specialization and financial capacities.

49. The HRDP is an excellent example of a formal attempt to coordinate donor interventions under a common umbrella program. Donor assistance for the HRDP is:

- distributed among five different institutions, each supporting projects which reflect their comparative advantage.
- managed through a centralized and integrated management system, including central project implementation units in the Ministries of Health and Education, as well as the central HRDP Secretariat located in the PIOJ.
- monitored by tools that provide information on progress towards project targets and on project impact, which, in turn, inform recommendations for improvement.

50. However, the scope of the HRDP is modest in the education sector and there are three areas of the "policy matrix" for education which have not been supported by donors. Nevertheless, donors have responded to the HRDP's overall goal of improving the education sector. They have coordinated their assistance outside the formal framework of the HRDP, while utilizing the HRDP annual review as a vehicle for exchanging experience and a mechanism for discussion regarding future programs of support.

51. In short, donor support for education in Jamaica shows extensive coordination. The existence under the HRDP of a regular forum for donor and government exchanges has been a key element in promoting this coordination. It has helped to:

- avoid duplication in funding;
- maximize resources and promote greater efficiencies;
- increase trust and cooperation among donors and between donors and GOJ.

References

- Aarons, A., Denning, C., Mace, J., & O'Connor Millwood, P. (1992). *Report on the mid-term Evaluation of the Secondary Schools Textbook Project*. Jamaica: Ministry of Education.
- Davies, R. (1992). *Final Report Prepared for The Planning Institute of Jamaica: The Review of the Human Resources Development Program Part I* Unpublished manuscript.
- Davies, R. (1992). *Final Report Prepared for The Planning Institute of Jamaica: The Review of the Human Resources Development Program Part I*. Unpublished manuscript.
- Inter-American Development Bank. (1991). *Jamaica Comprehensive Rural Township Development Program (Corlowns III): Loan proposal* (Report JA-0101). Washington, D.C.: IDB.
- Inter-American Development Bank. (1992). *Jamaica Primary Education Improvement Program II.- Loan proposal* (Report JA-0016). Washington, D.C.: IDB.
- USAID (1990). *Primary Education Assistance II: Draft Project paper Amendment*. Unpublished manuscript.
- World Bank. (1989). *Staff Appraisal Report: Jamaica Social Sectors Development Project* (Report No. 7573-JM). Washington, D.C.: World Bank.
- World Bank. (1989). *Staff Appraisal Report: Jamaica Reform of Secondary Education* (Report No. 11534-JM). Washington, D.C.: World Bank.
- World Bank. (1989). *Staff Appraisal Report: Jamaica Education Program Preparation and Student Loan Project*. (Report No. 6933-JM). Washington, D.C.: World Bank.

Principal Abbreviations and Acronyms Used

- Basic Skills Training Project (BSTP)
- Education Program Preparation and Student Loan Project (EPP&SL)
- Education Sector Management Project (ESMP)
- Enhanced Textbooks Project (ETP)
- Ministry of Education (MOE)
- Primary Education Assistance Project II (PEAP)
- Primary Education Project I (PPI)
- Primary Education Improvement II (PPII)
- Primary School Textbook Project 11 (PTPII)
- Program for the Advancement of Childhood Education (PACE under SSDP)
- Reform of Secondary Education (ROSE)
- Rural Township Development Program (RTDP)
- School Mapping and Microplanning project (SMMP)
- School Feeding Program (SF)
- Secondary Textbooks Project (STP)
- Secondary Schools Upgrading Project (SSUP)
- Social Sector Development Project (SSDP)
- Tracer Study of Graduates of Secondary Education (TSGS)
- Training of Educational Personnel in Multigrade Teaching Techniques (TEPMTT)
- University of West Indies Development Program (UWDP)

Annexes

GOJ and Donor Agencies	Project(s)	Funds provided (US\$millions)				Years
		Total	Donor	GOJ	Other	
GOJ only	• Secondary Schools Upgrading Project (SSUP)	2.6 ¹	---	2.6	---	90-94
World Bank	• Social Sector Development Project (SSDP)	27.2 ²	7.4 (27%)	19.8 (73%)	---	89-94
	• Education Program Preparation and Student Loan Project (EPP&SL)	11.1	8.3 (75%)	2.8 (25%)	---	88-92
	• Program for the Advancement of Childhood Education (PACE under SSDP)	6.2	4.2 (68%)	2.0 (32%)	---	89-94
	• Reform of Secondary Education (ROSE)	39.7	32 (81%)	4.9 (12%)	2.8 (7%) ³	93-98
IDB	• Primary Education Project I (PPI)	44.7	36.5 (82%)	8.2 (18%)	---	84-91
	• Primary Education Improvement II (PPII)	35.9	28 (78%)	7.9 (22%)	---	93-97
	• Rural Township Development Program (RTDP)	45	36 (80%)	9 (20%)	---	89-94
	• University of West Indies Development Program (UWDP)	80	56 (70%)	---	24 (30%) ⁴	90-2000
UNDP	• Education Sector Management Project (ESMP)	.5	.4 (99.9%)	.009 (.002%)	---	89-93
	• Tracer Study of Graduates of Secondary Education (TSGS)	.238	.235 (99%)	.003 ⁵ (1%)	---	90-93
CIDA	• Primary School Textbook Project II (PTPII)	3 ⁶	1.1 (37%)	.8 (27%)	1.1 ⁷ (37%)	87-90
	• Enhanced Textbooks Project (ETP)	2.6	NA	NA	NA	92-?
ODA	• Secondary Textbooks Project (STP)	14.2 ⁸	9.3 (65%)	4.9 (35%)	---	89-92
USAID	• Primary Education Assistance Project II (PEAP)	7.5	5.6 (75%)	1.9 (25%)	---	90-94
	• Basic Skills Training Project (BSTP)	59.9	13.4 (22%)	46.5 (78%)	---	84-90
OAS	• Training of Educational Personnel in Multigrade Teaching Techniques (TEPMTT)	.242	.242 (100%)	---	---	90-91

¹ Conversion done at 1990 rate of US\$1.00 = J\$11.435.

² Total only includes SSDP support for education. The total SSDP project cost is US\$67 million.

³ Co-financed by The Netherlands.

⁴ Co-financed by University of West Indies and Caribbean Development Bank.

⁵ Conversion done at 1990 rate of US\$1.00 = J\$11.435.

⁶ Conversion done at 1987 rate of US\$1.00 = £1.326.

⁷ Co-financed by USAID/RDOC and AIDE Allemande.

⁸ Conversions done at 1989 rate of US\$1.00 = £611.

Annex 4: Levels of Education Supported by Donors in Jamaica, 1990-1993

		Pre-Primary	Primary	Secondary	Higher & Vocational/ Technical	General Management and Administration
GOJ only	SSUP			X		
World Bank	SSDP	X	X	X		X
	EPP&SL			X		X
	PACE (under SSDP)	X	X			
	ROSE			X	X	X
IDB	PPI		X			
	PPII		X			
	RTDP			X		
	UWDP				X	
USAID	PEAP		X			X
	BSTP				X	
CIDA	PTPII		X			
	ETP		X	X		
UNDP	ESMP					X
	TSGS			X		
ODA	STP			X		
OAS	TEPMTT		X			
WFP	SF	X				
UNESCO	SMMP			X		

Annex 3: Areas in Education Supported by Donors in Jamaica, 1990-1993

		Educational Management	Teachers	Instructional Materials (includes textbooks)	Curriculum Development	Testing/ Assessment	Planning & Policy	Construction & Civil Works	Others
GOJ only	SSUP	X	X	X				X	
World Bank	SSDP	X	X	X		X		X	
	EPP&SL	X	X		X		X	X	X
	PACE (under SSDP)		X		X			X	X
	ROSE	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X
IDB	PPI		X			X		X	
	PPII		X	X	X	X		X	
	RTDP							X	
	UWDP								X
USAID	PEAP	X			X				
	BSTP	X	X	X	X		X	X	
CIDA	PTPII			X					
	ETP			X					
UNDP	ESMP	X	X			X			
	TSGS						X		
ODA	STP		X	X					
OAS	TEPMTT		X	X					
WFP	SF								X
UNESCO	SMMP						X		

Annex 4: Donor Contributing to Education Component of Human Resource Development Programme in Jamaica

		Donor Agency				
		World Bank	GOJ only	UNDP	WFP	ODA
Project(s)		• Social Sector Development Project (SSDP) • Education Program Preparation and Student Loan Project (EPP&SL) • Program for the Advancement of Childhood Education (PACE under SSDP)	• Secondary Schools Upgrading Project	• Education Sector Management Project	• School Feeding Program	• Secondary Textbooks Project
Funds provided (US\$ millions)		TOTAL WB = 19.9 (45%) SSDP: WB = 7.4 (27%) GOJ = 19.8 (73%) EPP&SL: WB = 8.3 (75%) GOJ = 2.8 (25%) PACE: WB = 4.2 (68%) GOJ = 2.0 (32%)	GOJ = 2.6 ¹ (100%)	UNDP = .4 (99.9%) GOJ = .009 (.002%)	WFP = 8.8 (53%) GOJ = 7.9 (47%)	ODA ² = 9.3 (65%) GOJ = 4.9 (35%)
Training		YES	YES	NO	NO	YES
Construction/Civil Works		YES	YES	NO	NO	NO
Equipment, Furniture, and other goods.	Equipment, Furniture, & Vehicles	YES	YES	YES	NO	NO
	Textbooks	YES	NO	NO	NO	YES
	Others (e.g. nutrition)	YES	NO	NO	YES	NO
Technical Assistance and Institutional Strengthening		YES	NO	YES	NO	NO

¹ Conversion done at 1990 rate of US\$1.00 = J\$11.435.

² Conversions done at 1989 rate of US\$1.00 = £.611.