Public Disclosure Authorized

Public Disclosure Authorized

Document of
The World Bank

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY

Report No: 24199

IMPLEMENTATION COMPLETION REPORT
(SCL-39690; IDA-28030)

ON A

LOAN and CREDIT

IN THE AMOUNT OF US$6.14 MILLION

TO THE GOVERNMENT OF

DOMINICA

FOR A

DM- BASIC EDUCATION REFORM PROJECT

05/17/2002

This document has a restricted distribution and may be used by recipients only in the performance of their official duties. Its contents may not otherwise be disclosed without World Bank authorization.

CURRENCY EQUIVALENTS

(Exchange Rate Effective March 31, 2002)

Currency Unit	=	Eastern Caribbean Dollar
EC 1	=	US$ 0.37
US$ 1	=	EC 2.70

FISCAL YEAR

July 1 June 30

ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS

ACEO	Assistant Chief Education Officer
BERP	Basic Education Reform Project
CAS	Country Assistance Strategy
CDU	Curriculum Development Unit
CEE	Common Entrance Examination
CEO	Chief Education Officer
CXC	Caribbean Examinations Council
DEO	District Education Office
DFID	Department of International Development
EMIS	Education Management Information System
EPU	Education Planning and Statistics Unit
EU	European Union
EXT	Education Testing and Examinations Unit
GCE	General Certificate of Education
GOCD	Government of the Commonwealth of Dominica
IBRD	International Bank For Reconstruction and Development
ICB	International Competitive Bidding
ICR	Implementation Completion Report
IDA	International Development Association
JSP	Junior Secondary Program
MOESYA	Ministry of Education, Sports and Youth Affairs
MPU	Materials Production Unit
NCB	National Competitive Bidding
OAS	Organization of American States
OECS	Organization of the Eastern Caribbean States
PHRD	Policy and Human Resource Development (Japanese Government Grant)
PMU	Project Management Unit
PS	Permanent Secretary
SAR	Staff Appraisal Report
SDR	Special Drawing Rights
SEO	Senior Education Officer
TTC	Teacher Training College

Vice President:	David de Ferranti
Country Director:	Orsalia Kalantzopoulos
Sector Director:	Ana Maria Arriagada
Task Team Leader/Task Manager:	Cynthia Hobbs

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY

DOMINICA
DM- BASIC EDUCATION REF

CONTENTS

This document has a restricted distribution and may be used by recipients only in the performance of their official duties. Its contents may not otherwise be disclosed without World Bank authorization.

economic transition in Dominica. The BERP supported the first stage of a substantial reform of the basic education sector, aimed at improving the efficiency and effectiveness of the education system, and at enhancing equity of access to educational opportunities.

3.2 Revised Objective:

The objective was not revised.

3.3 Original Components:

The total project costs were estimated at US$7.9 million equivalent (US$3.1 million IBRD loan and SDR2.10 million IDA credit or US$3 million equivalent and a Government's contribution of US$1.8 million equivalent). The BERP was structured into three main components:

1 - Strengthening Management and Planning (US$1.1 million, or 14% of total project costs). The objective of this component was to improve the organization, procedures, and functions of the Ministry of Education, Sports and Youth Affairs (MOESYA), in order to increase its efficiency to guide and manage the national education system. The component financed consulting services, fellowships and studies in the areas of project management, education reform, educational planning and education management (including statistics, economics, financial analysis and operational research). This component also financed civil works to expand office space, office furniture and supplies.

2 - Qualitative Improvement of Basic Education - (US$2.8million, or 35% of total project costs). This component aimed to increase access to secondary education and improve quality of primary education, particularly in core subjects. Activities financed included fellowships, expert services, studies and local trainings in six specific and interrelated areas: (i) school supervision; (ii) educational testing and measurement; (iii) educational materials development; (iv) curriculum development; (v) teacher training; and (vi) school library service. In addition, this component financed civil works, furniture and equipment to create a library in the Portsmouth area, and a vehicle to establish a mobile library service.

3 - Expansion of Access - (US$4.0 million, or 51% of total project costs). This component aimed to expand access to secondary education in under-served districts through the construction of a new secondary school in Castlebruce and rehabilitation of selected schools with serious infrastructure deficiencies. The component financed civil works, furniture and equipment, equipment maintenance and supplies.

3.4 Revised Components:

The project components were not revised.

3.5 Quality at Entry:

The overall quality of the project at entry can be considered **satisfactory.**

The project aimed to help the Government of the Commonwealth of Dominica (GOCD) to address critical education development needs by accelerating the expansion of secondary school places and enhancing primary students' basic skills in preparation for further education and employment. The project was diligently prepared during 1993-1995 and benefited from close consultation with the Secretariat of the Organization of Eastern Caribbean States (OECS) and financing from a Policy and Human Resource Development (PHRD) grant from the Government of Japan. Project design incorporated inputs provided

Project ID: P006969	*Project Name:* DM- BASIC EDUCATION REF
Team Leader: Cynthia Hobbs	*TL Unit:* LCSHE
ICR Type: Core ICR	*Report Date: May 20, 2002*

1. Project Data

Name:	DM- BASIC EDUCATION REF	*L/C/TF Number:*	SCL-39690; IDA-28030
Country/Department:	DOMINICA	*Region:*	Latin America and Caribbean Region
Sector/subsector:	EP - Primary Education		

KEY DATES

			Original	*Revised/Actual*
PCD: 02/23/94		*Effective:*	06/17/96	10/28/96
Appraisal: 10/30/95		*MTR:*	05/01/98	05/25/98
Approval: 12/21/95		*Closing:*	06/30/2001	12/31/2001

Borrower/Implementing Agency: GOVERNMENT/MINISTRY OF ED. (DOMINICA)
Other Partners:

STAFF	Current	At Appraisal
Vice President:	David de Ferranti	Javed Burki
Country Manager:	Orsalia Kalantzopoulos	Paul Isenman
Sector Manager:	Ana Maria Arriagada	Julian Schweitzer
Team Leader at ICR:	Cynthia Hobbs	Karen Lashman
ICR Primary Author:	Massimiliano Paolucci; Maria R. Puech Fernandez	

2. Principal Performance Ratings

(HS=Highly Satisfactory, S=Satisfactory, U=Unsatisfactory, HL=Highly Likely, L=Likely, UN=Unlikely, HUN=Highly Unlikely, HU=Highly Unsatisfactory, H=High, SU=Substantial, M=Modest, N=Negligible)

Outcome: S

Sustainability: L

Institutional Development Impact: SU

Bank Performance: S

Borrower Performance: S

	QAG (if available)	ICR
Quality at Entry:		S
Project at Risk at Any Time:	No	

3. Assessment of Development Objective and Design, and of Quality at Entry

3.1 Original Objective:

The Dominica Basic Education Reform Project (BERP) was designed with the overall objective of accelerating human resource development to ensure that the requisite manpower exists to attain the desired through extensive consultations with government officials, teachers, unions and civil society.

The project design reflects the priorities indicated in the Country Assistance Strategy (CAS) prepared for the OECS countries in 1995. The CAS targeted human development, and particularly education, as a priority intervention leading to the achievement of four main objectives: (i) fostering economic transition from traditional agriculture to more competitive economic activities; (ii) improving efficiency in the allocation and use of public resources at national and regional levels; (iii) promoting human capital development and poverty alleviation; and (iv) promoting sustainable natural resource management. The project objectives were also in line with the recommendations from the OECS Education Reform Strategy (1993) and from the World Bank report "Access, Quality, and Efficiency in Caribbean Education: A Regional Study" (1992), both of which emphasized improved quality and expanded coverage of basic education as prerequisites for the socioeconomic development in the country.

Though project design was appropriate, it was challenging for a Ministry with no previous experience in implemention of a Bank-financed project.

4. Achievement of Objective and Outputs

4.1 Outcome/achievement of objective:
Overall ICR Rating: Satisfactory

The BERP achieved most of its immediate objectives, in particular those related to improvements in the quality of primary education and increase of access to secondary education. However, there are not enough elements to assess the long term impact of the BERP on the quality and adequateness of the local manpower with regards to the process of economic transition of the country.

Strengthening management and planning capacity

The project contributed to strengthening the planning and institutional capacity of the Ministry of Education. It succeeded in creating and staffing four new technical units in the areas of planning, project management, curriculum development and learning achievement testing, thus enhancing the Ministry's capacity to deliver quality education services, though it did not achieve a reorganization of the Ministry or a substantial improvement in the coordination among key units.

Efficiency gains, measured in terms of student/teacher ratios and salary share of the sector budget, were unevenly achieved. In primary schools, student/teacher ratios remained nearly the same, changing from 1:21.8 in 1994 to 1:21.4 in 2000 or about 18 percent below the target of 1:26. Although the number of teachers decreased by about 10 percent (from 679 to 602), the number of students decreased by 12 percent (from 14,796 to 12,885), thus offsetting the positive results associated with the reduction in the number of teachers.

In secondary schools, student/teacher ratios improved by about 8 percent (from 1:16.6 in 1994 to 1:17.9 in 2000). The improvement was largely due to a 40 percent enrollment expansion (from 4,465 to 6,270 students), while the number of teachers expanded only by 30 percent (from 269 to 350). Further attempts by the Government to improve student/teacher ratios met with strong opposition from the teachers' union and lack of consensus on the issue at the Cabinet level.

These less than satisfactory efficiency gains in the management of teachers pose concern regarding the capacity of the Government to sustain the burden of teachers' salaries in the medium and long run. This is particularly worrisome in view of the current deterioration of the economic situation of the country and the continuous outflow of adult migrants, both of which have a negative impact on fiscal resources.

Improvement of quality of education

The project achieved significant improvements in the quality of basic education as a result of support provided to strengthen the technical departments of the MOESYA, especially the Curriculum Development and the Testing and Measuring Units. This was combined with quality enhancing activities at schools, such as provision of new textbooks, personal computers and educational materials. Quality improvements are reflected in the 40 percent increase in the number of sixth-grade students who were selected to attend secondary school, based on the Common Entrance Examination (CEE); the share of selected students increased from 34.3 percent in 1994 to 76.2 percent in 2000, although the absolute number of students who sat for the exam decreased during that period (from 2,080 in 1994 to 1,673 in 2000). In addition, there was an increase in the percentage of primary students who passed five subjects or more on the CXC, which rose from 40.5 percent in 1997 to 52.9 percent in 1998.

Quality improvements are also reflected in reduction of dropout and repetition rates, particularly in primary schools. At the primary level, dropout rates declined by about 70 percent (from 0.54 in 1994 to 0.16 percent in 2000) and repetition rates were reduced from 5.4 percent to 3.4 percent from 1996 to 1999. Improvements at the secondary school level were less striking: dropout rates declined by 28 percent (from 3.9 percent in 1996 to 2.8 percent in 1999) and repetition rates actually increased from 9 to 9.9 percent in the same period.

The third important quality measure is given by the percentage of teachers that are certified. At primary schools, the share of certified teachers increased by about 20 percent (from 43.2 percent in 1994 to 63.9 percent in 1999). Nevertheless, at secondary schools, the share of certified teachers declined by almost 5 percent (from 30.7 percent in 1996 to 25.9 percent in 1999).

The education quality indicators suggest that while the project effectively improved quality in primary schools, there is still room for improvement in secondary schools.

Increase in enrollment in secondary

Enrollment in secondary schools increased significantly from the school year 1994-95 to the year 2000-2001, reaching an average growth rate of 7.3 percent per year. In 2000, gross enrollment in secondary education was 88 percent.

4.2 Outputs by components:

Component 1 - Strengthening Management and Planning: Satisfactory. (US$ 0.74 million or 10 percent of total project cost). The BERP successfully strengthened the MOESYA's institutional capacity by: (i) building planning and analytical capacity; (ii) establishing permanent project management capacity; (iii) initiating the development of an integrated education data system to support sector analysis and policy making; and (iv) establishing the technical capacity for curriculum development and learning achievement testing. The project fell short in its efforts to reorganize the MOESYA, to review its legislation and procedures and to significantly improve efficiency in the management of personnel. Thus, in spite of considerable advances, problems must still be addressed with respect to sector policy and leadership.

The BERP was very successful in supporting the establishment of an Educational Planning Unit (EPU) and a Project Management Unit (PMU), which are staffed with competent professionals, largely trained overseas, and working in the same building.

During the project implementation, the EPU produced: (i) an " Education Development Plan for 1999-2005 and Beyond" which provides the goals for the education system in future years; and (ii) a statistical digest, "Indicators 2000", which includes a thorough analysis of the evolution of quality, efficiency, and access indicators for the Dominica educational system. This document represents an important policy-making and budget tool for the MOESYA. The EPU is also playing an important role in the preparation of the forthcoming Education Reform Project, in collaboration with the OECS, which will be partly financed by the World Bank.

The PMU represents one of the most successful achievements of the BERP. Through study tours and continuous on-the-job training, the PMU developed impressive project management capacity, especially in the areas of procurement and financial management. The PMU's dedicated team is now able to assist the MOESYA in the implementation of complex sector projects financed by different development institutions. The team has been a source of guidance and mentoring for other project units in the Caribbean region. Although the PMU is fully institutionalized within the MOESYA, the current organizational structure of the Ministry does not favor smooth coordination and creates some hierarchical problems that will need to be addressed as the education sector reform progresses.

Although the project planned the construction of office space for all new technical units and for some existing units, construction plans were modified during implementation. The MOESYA, based on budget considerations, decided to rehabilitate an existing building rather than construct a new one. The building now houses the PMU, the EPU, and the remaining technical units. Although this arrangement has fostered better collaboration and integration among the technical units, it is not conducive to fluid and improved communication with the MOESYA management, as the offices of the Minister and the Permanent Secretary are located in a separate administrative complex in another part of town.

This component financed a total of 19 fellowships in regional and international institutions. The staff who benefitted from these fellowships expressed satisfaction with the training. However, because the official appointment of the fellows did not occur immediately upon the completion of their training, the application of the newly acquired skills in the MOESYA was delayed.

***Component 2 - Qualitative Improvement of Basic Education*: *Satisfactory* -** (US$ 2.07 million or 28 percent of total project cost). The BERP successfully supported improvements in the quality of teaching and learning through: (i) improvement of school supervision; (ii) creation of student achievement testing and measurement capacity to monitor student and system performance; (iii) strengthened capacity to design, produce, select, procure and distribute textbooks and educational materials; (iv) curriculum improvement in core subjects; (v) updating of teacher training methodologies; and (vi) improvements in the school library service.

- School Supervision

  Two fellows were trained in school supervision and are now committed to increasing school effectiveness through the continuous assessment of teachers, principals and schools, and the dissemination among teachers and principals of new concepts and methodologies about the most appropriate and cost-efficient use of school resources, teachers, funding and physical plant. It is unclear how many teachers have benefitted from the cascade training sessions provided by these supervisors.

Although planned in the SAR, no civil works or furniture purchases took place for the District Education Office (DEO) in Castle Bruce due to problems in locating and buying a suitable site at a reasonable price.

- Educational Testing and Materials

BERP supported the establishment of an Educational Testing and Examination Unit (EXT). The EXT is staffed with two professionals who received appropriate training in prestigious overseas universities. The unit is responsible for administering the CEE and the Junior Secondary Program (JSP) examinations. Although the SAR intended for the integration of all tests under the new unit, the administration of external tests, such as the CXC and the General Certificate of Education (GCE), is done by the Local Registrar Office.

The EXT created the National Assessment Program, which, at present, is limited to a comprehensive annual diagnostic test of the skills and attitudes for grade 2 students. The results of these tests are used to prepare in-service training modules for teachers focusing on the deficiencies detected by the test. The EXT is currently working on the preparation of a similar kind of diagnostic test for students from grades 4 and 6. The EXT is also carrying out an interesting study on gender differences in learning achievements. The planned study to establish achievement norms and standards, school evaluation, and development of curriculum evaluation methodologies was not carried out due to a lack of agreement on the definition of common norms and desired achievement standards.

- Educational Materials Development

The project supported the strengthening of the MOESYA to prepare, produce, and procure educational materials. A General Editor was trained overseas and hired as MOESYA permanent staff, although she was not formally appointed for almost two years. Additionally, consulting services were contracted to carry out a study on Educational Materials and Production, and Desktop Publishing. As a result, the MOESYA has been able to produce several interesting publications, such as Core Curriculum Guides for Forms 1-3, and a useful newsletter, *"Education Matters"*, which is circulated widely among teachers and principals. Furthermore, the MOESYA has improved its methods of selection of textbooks per subject, appropriate both for their number and content, as testified by the high quality of textbooks currently in use around the country.

Under this sub-component, the MOESYA provided books to selected primary schools located in the disadvantaged areas, and in particular, in the Carib territories. The project also financed the acquisition of basic textbooks for teachers of grades 1-9, in each primary and secondary school, as well as supplementary educational materials (mostly to support teaching of technical subjects) for selected secondary schools.

It is important to add, mainly for the implication on the future sustainability of this kind of initiative, that the GOCD implemented a policy of free provision of textbooks to all primary schools which was financed through counterpart funds.

- <u>Curriculum Development</u>

  The BERP supported the strengthening of the Curriculum Development Unit (CDU) by sponsoring four fellows for training programs at the master's level in Language Arts, Mathematics, Social Studies and Science. Upon their return, the CDU was formally established and properly equipped, although, as in other cases, the appointment of returned fellows as permanent staff was delayed. Due to the retirement of the first CDU director, the unit has been recently placed under the responsibility of the EXT. While this arrangement has promoted better communications and integration between two key technical units, it has increased substantially the workload of EXT, forcing EXT staff to reduce time allocated to technical tasks, including sector studies.

  To support curriculum development, the BERP financed local training for teachers and principals conducted by the returned fellows. This training complemented similar initiatives sponsored by other projects, such as those funded by the Organization of American States (OAS) and the Department of International Development (DFID). The provision of training responded to requests from schools or focused on training needs detected by evaluations made by the DEO and the Senior Education Officer (SEO). Only a small number of teachers were trained, mostly those from grades 1, 2 and 3, suggesting that the initiative might deserve expansion in the future.

  Some preliminary studies on the evaluation of the syllabi and curricula were carried out, although mostly at the secondary level. Similar efforts at the primary school level were frustrated by the lack of consensus within MOESYA on the opportunity and scope of a curriculum reform.

  This component also financed the acquisition of 30 science kits for primary schools, in lieu of 50, as planned in the SAR. No kits were bought for math and social science, since they proved to be too expensive. At present, there is little concrete evidence of the impact of the use of the science kits on teaching and learning practices, since an assessment has not yet been done.

- <u>Teacher Training</u>

  As planned in the SAR, three fellows from the Teachers' Training College (TTC) were trained to improve their skills in design, research and evaluation in Science, Mathematics, and Language Arts. Additionally, DFID sponsored another fellow for a one-year master's degree in General Education. Furniture, office equipment, and supplies at the TTC for educational and audio-visual material were also purchased under the project.

  This sub-component also included resources for the financing of in-service training programs during the summer holidays for approximately 300 teachers on content and teaching methods/pedagogy. After establishing a fledgling permanent in-service training scheme, the TTC then strived to guarantee its continuity throughout the years. Teachers selected by schools for training at the TTC were not always the same, thus reducing the overall impact due to lack of continuity. The limited impact of this sub-component is also reflected in the low disbursement rate, which did not reach 43% of the original amount budgeted in the SAR.

- <u>School Library Service</u>

  This sub-component financed the construction and furnishing of a new School Library Center in Portsmouth to serve both the surrounding area and the nearby secondary school district. In addition, a van was acquired to establish a bookmobile which covers schools in the northern part of Dominica, thus benefitting the more rural communities. The BERP also financed a three-year program in library sciences and two additional fellowships in library technology. Preliminary observations show a marked increase in the use of library resources by local students, as confirmed by the results of interviews conducted with users, as well as library staff. However, since a systematic study has not yet been done, it is still early to assess the impact of this sub-component on the students' performance.

Component 3 - Expansion of Access to Schools: Satisfactory - (US$4.6 million or 62 percent of the project baseline costs). The BERP succeeded in increasing access to secondary schools and was able to provide a more equitable distribution of school places at the secondary level among regions. Given the higher access rate, the BERP was also able to provide considerable improvement in the transition rate between primary and secondary education. In fact, the SAR transition target of 63% was surpassed by 21% as it reached 76.2 percent in 2000.

Some 1,050 new school places were created under the project, exceeding the original SAR targets. As planned at appraisal, the BERP financed the construction of a new secondary school in Castle Bruce, where access was limited, especially for children of Carib descent. During project implementation, 525 new school places were added and the school was furnished and equipped. In total, 13 new classrooms were built (7 to replace unsuitable pre-existing classrooms) and a science laboratory and sanitary facilities were added to the existing Portsmouth Secondary School. At the primary education level, 15 seriously deteriorated primary schools were rehabilitated. With regard to the design of the Castle Bruce school, some reservations were voiced as it did not include an area for plenary meetings. Community maintenance courses are being developed to guarantee the sustainability of the infrastructure investment, and an established maintenance plan will be a condition of effectiveness for the proposed new loan to support a follow-on Education Reform project.

The original budget for this component was exceeded by 14 percent. This was due primarily to the fact that cost estimates made during the preparation of the project were based on preliminary designs and not on construction design at the chosen site. As a result, the actual cost of the Portsmouth School exceeded the original estimate by 30 percent.

In spite of the overall success in the implementation of this component, the schools built or rehabilitated through the project show evident signs of deterioration. This is a situation that calls for immediate corrective action. Although the project provided training in preventive maintenance of school facilities to principals and vice-principals, maintenance activities were not, in fact, carried out. In order to ensure the sustainability of the infrastructure investments, attention should given to: (i) specific appropriation of funds by the MOESYA to pass to the schools for maintenance; (ii) training in preventive maintenance directed to school officials, parents and students; and (iii) the establishment of appropriate community-based organizations to carry out the preventive maintenance plan for each school.

4.3 Net Present Value/Economic rate of return:

The SAR did not include an economic analysis of the project costs and benefits. Nevertheless, the marked increase in secondary school enrollment and the significant improvements in the quality of primary education suggest that the project was cost-effective in reaching its development objectives.

4.4 Financial rate of return:

N/A

4.5 Institutional development impact:

The BERP laid the initial foundation for the education reform program and through its support, MOESYA has built a respected and solid core of professionals whose knowledge and dedication are contributing to improvements in the education sector and to progress towards the sought reform. However, the context in which this modernization reform has taken place is still characterized by some inconsistencies that the Government needs to address.

In the case of the PMU, although staff work in strict cooperation with the Chief Education Officer (CEO), they do not report to him, as envisaged in the SAR. Instead, they report directly to the Permanent Secretary (PS), while other MOESYA staff report to the CEO who then reports to the PS. This has created the impression among MOESYA staff of the existence of two competing, rather than complementary, powers within the same institution.
The causes of such a distortion are to be found in the incomplete reform of the MOESYA's structure and functions. As originally planned at the time of project negotiation, two important consulting studies were funded in order to provide the Ministry with clear and immediately operational proposals to rationalize its functioning, which reflected the suggestions made in the SAR. In practice, only the Assistant Chief Education Officer (ACEO) post for School Operations was created; the one for Planning and Development was not. The two new posts were meant to deconcentrate functions at the CEO level and improve efficiency and responsiveness, especially to schools, through functional specialization. The studies recommended establishment of a functional relation between the CEO and the PMU, rather than one of dependency, to improve the translation of Cabinet policies into administrative decisions and strategies and, subsequently, into implementation decisions. These proposals were never fully endorsed by the MOESYA, mainly in light of the frequent reshuffling it went through during the past six years. This made any consolidation of the organizational chart difficult to envisage. As a result, all technical departments continued to work on the basis of poorly defined terms of reference and without a clear understanding of the structure and relations with senior management.

The role of the returning fellows within the MOESYA is another factor of concern. Upon completion of their studies, mostly at the Masters level, all returning fellows were integrated within the MOESYA, although their appointments as permanent MOESYA staff were delayed for some time for a combination of budgetary and bureaucratic reasons. At present, these professionals are still working without clear terms of reference which creates duplication of tasks, efforts, and resources among and across teams.

It is of utmost importance for the MOESYA to achieve an internal consensus on some basic key decisions to advance the education sector reform. The Education Act was approved in 1997 and defines the principles inspiring the Dominican education system, as well as the rights and duties of both the Government and the beneficiaries. Approved relatively quickly on the basis of the need to comply with the recommendations made in the OECS Education Reform Strategy and in the 1996 GOCD Education Strategy Letter, this important Act was not complemented by any regulation, thus condemning the reform to an uncertain future.

5. Major Factors Affecting Implementation and Outcome

5.1 Factors outside the control of government or implementing agency:

- ***Delays and overruns in the implementation of civil works***

  Civil works were delayed and cost overruns were incurred, especially in the construction and rehabilitation of schools. At the time of project preparation, costs were miscalculated and field site investigations were poorly conducted. Additionally, the BERP was confronted with higher than expected bids and the loss of IDA credit funds in dollar terms due to the depreciation of the Yen. The combined effect of both factors not only slowed down the whole procurement process, but it also induced the GOCD to forego the construction of the new MOESYA's building, opting instead to rehabilitate an existing building that now houses the PMU and other technical departments of the MOESYA.

5.2 Factors generally subject to government control:

- ***The GOCD's commitment to reform the MOESYA***

  Overall project impact, mainly with respect to the management and planning component, could have been higher had the GOCD showed more commitment to: (a) appoint a Change Manager to lead the MOESYA's rationalization efforts; and (b) formalize the immediate appointment of returning fellows. In the latter case, the returning fellows were not formally appointed for a long period of time, and terms of reference for the different technical and operational units composing the Ministry of Education are yet to be finalized. Such anomalies have fostered a sense of great uncertainty among those affected. These issues slowed down, albeit not markedly, the pace of the change process.

- ***Timely allocation of counterpart funds***

  The GOCD made a remarkable effort to provide timely allocation of counterpart funds for the implementation of the BERP, especially in the last two years when the country entered a period of economic recession. However, on some occasions, mainly during FY98, the GOCD was unable to comply with Art. 3.01(b) of the Credit Agreement that required the Government to maintain a balance in the Project account equivalent to three months of project expenditures. As a result, some contractors experienced delayed payments due to insufficient funds in the credit account.

- ***Lack of Consensus on the Rationalization of the Teacher - Student Ratio***

  Although perceived as an important measure to adopt in the reform of the education sector, the adjustment of the teacher - student ratio to 1:30 at the primary level, and 1:20 at the secondary, was never achieved, mainly due to lack of consensus within the government and to teacher union opposition. Interestingly enough, these targets were opposed by both parties on the basis of the same argument, i.e. the lack of realism, especially when taking into consideration the reality of many remote rural communities, where the aggregation of several classrooms through relocation of students in hub schools would result in higher costs, due to the resulting transportation costs.

- ***Continuity of PMU staff***

  The MOESYA's policy to preserve the PMU staff at all levels represented a fundamental factor in guaranteeing the BERP's satisfactory implementation performance. Throughout the years, the core group that managed the BERP since inception developed a set of skills they now apply to manage sector projects financed by other donors as well.

5.3 Factors generally subject to implementing agency control:

- ***Communication within the MOESYA, and with other governmental institutions***

  In the vacuum created by the lack of MOESYA's institutional reorganization, there were times when the communication was not fluid between the PMU and other MOESYA units involved in project execution. This left some technical units puzzled about the reasons for some decisions related to project implementation, while fostering at the same time some degree of antagonism within the MOESYA. The PMU could have promoted better information sharing. However, the excessive work load, due to the responsibility for implementation of DFID and European Union (EU) funded projects, did not allow the PMU to allot much time to this important activity.

5.4 Costs and financing:

Disbursements from IBRD Loan 39690 and IDA Credit 28030 total US$5.73 million equivalent as of April 23, 2002 and US$0.21 million equivalent remain undisbursed and are expected to be cancelled at the final closing of the accounts. The less than full utilization of loan and credit funds reflect the fact that some contracts had to be cancelled during the last year of project implementation because providers could not guarantee the delivery of goods by the closing date of December 31, 2001.

After loan and credit effectiveness in late October 1996, disbursements during the first three years of project implementation reached 78.8 percent of total credit and loan funds. This indicated remarkable performance, considering that this was the first Bank-financed education project in Dominica, and especially excellent with respect to financial management, procurement and availability of counterpart funds. The relatively slower pace of disbursements during the last two years of project implementation indicates that most investments have been completed.

6. Sustainability

6.1 Rationale for sustainability rating:

ICR Rating: **Likely**

It is **likely** that the project will maintain the achievements generated during its implementation period. The assessment is based on the following considerations:

- The Government has shown commitment to the project's development objectives throughout project implementation, despite some mixed signals at times from lack of broad consensus (i.e. adjustments in teacher/student ratio). The GOCD has expressed its willingness to continue working to deepen the education sector reform and has requested the collaboration of international institutions in these endeavors;

- The policy environment is supportive of the education sector, as shown by the efforts undertaken to define a long term comprehensive strategy for the sector;

- The project has built significant local expertise and capacity through the technical assistance provided under the project. All returning fellows have been appointed and are now working actively in the units created and/or strengthened through the project to implement the country's education reform;

  - The PMU was established and is functioning well. It has coordinated management of several internationally financed projects simultaneously and has operated procurement and finance systems with full accountability and considerable level of expertise. The PMU staff have trained staff in neighboring OECS countries at the Bank's request.

  - The Education Planning and Statistics Unit was also established and personnel were trained in top tertiary degree programs in the United States and Europe. A national statistics digest was published last year, and efforts are being made to establish baseline statistics and quantitative and qualitative indicators to measure student and school performance. This will lay the groundwork for the future implementation of the Education Management Information System (EMIS).

  - The Testing and Measurement Unit has initiated national assessments for grade two students, while plans to implement similar tests for grades 4 and 6 are being developed. Additionally, awareness training has been offered at the school level to improve data collection and validity.

- The MOESYA units involved in the BERP have moved to the new Education, Science and Technology Building, financed under the project, and are collaborating to implement the country's education reform. This has facilitated better day-to-day cooperation among the units.

- The project brought incentives to stakeholders to support the efforts in the sector: (i) materials are increasingly more available to teachers, including texts and library resources; (ii) the Curriculum and Education Materials units have been combined as one, and the General Editor, trained under the BERP, has contributed to improved quality of texts and educational materials; and (iii) community-managed maintenance courses are being developed to help preserve the new infrastructure created under the project.

Some challenges remain ahead to ensure that the project activities realize their full benefit and become sustainable. As previously indicated, the proposed adjustments in the teacher/student ratios were not achieved. Thus, the savings planned to offset the increased recurrent cost caused by the project were not realized by project closing. The GOCD will need to focus on this issue to alleviate pressures on the national budget. Another factor to affect sustainability is the need to more dramatically improve the management and institutional effectiveness of the MOEYSA, a sought reform not achieved through the project.

6.2 Transition arrangement to regular operations:

In order to maximize the benefits of the project, the MOESYA would need to:

- ***Achieve better coordination among its technical units:*** Although proximity has assisted in improving collaboration among the MOESYA units, the lack of clarity in the MOESYA structure led to difficulties in implementing clear policies and fully utilizing human resources trained under the projects. The MOESYA is currently engaged in restructuring of the Ministry, including the establishment of roles and responsibilities and the articulation among MOESYA units. This will be a condition for effectiveness for the proposed new loan to support the Education Reform project.

- ***Improve students' basic skills:*** While access has increased, results from the grade two tests have indicated a need for dramatic measures to improve literacy and numeracy. A new National Literacy Plan has already been drafted in order to support the efforts in such a direction.

- ***Increase quality of teachers' skills:*** Statistics show a higher than predicted percentage of uncertified teachers still working in the classrooms. Traditional training schemes have not worked. Alternative modalities and improved training in pedagogy and content will have to be explored.

7. Bank and Borrower Performance

Bank

7.1 Lending:

Satisfactory. The Bank's performance during preparation was satisfactory. A multi-disciplinary Bank team engaged in thorough consultations with government officials, unions members, and civil society representatives at large. The BERP's design was fully in line with the 1992 World Bank report "Access, Quality, and Efficiency in Caribbean Education: A Regional Study"; the 1993 OECS Education Reform Strategy, and the 1995 OECS Country Assistance Strategy. More attention should have been devoted to the definition of appropriate key performance indicators. Some of those included in the SAR (in particular, those related to quality and efficiency of education) appear too general and, therefore, difficult to measure, as well as to link to specific outputs.

7.2 Supervision:

Satisfactory. The Bank worked closely with the Borrower throughout project implementation. An appropriate mix of technical skills was guaranteed for all supervision missions, and the dialogue with the PMU was always open and frank. This helped to adopt swift resolutions when bottlenecks arose, thus preserving a steady implementation pace. The Bank's favorable response to the GOCD's request to extend the original closing date by six months allowed the PMU to complete some important project activities that were still outstanding (such as the purchase of a last stock of books). Finally, the Bank task teams always compiled all required project documents in a timely manner and according to Bank requirements.

7.3 Overall Bank performance:

Satisfactory. Overall Bank performance is rated satisfactory for:

- Excellent technical expertise provided throughout the project life cycle;
- Engagement in thorough discussions with all major project stakeholders;
- Open and frank communication established with the PMU, as well as with the Government;
- Flexible and swift response to the country's needs;
- Continuous support provided to strengthen the fiduciary aspects related to project implementation.

Borrower
7.4 Preparation:

Satisfactory. The MOESYA led the process of project preparation by coordinating the execution of all required preparatory studies that were funded through a PHRD grant. Project design was supported by the main recommendations made in the OECS CAS and sector work (*see section 3.5 on quality at entry*).

7.5 Government implementation performance:

Satisfactory. The rating is based on the following considerations:

- The Borrower demonstrated a high sense of ownership and commitment to successfully implement the project and achieve its development objectives. Loan and credit agreements were observed scrupulously;
- All critical staff was maintained throughout project implementation, especially at the level of the PMU.
- With the only exception of the period December 1997 - June 1998, the GOCD provided adequate counterpart funds;
- Dialogue between different GOCD Ministries and the Bank was always open and fluid;
- However, project impact, especially with respect to the strengthening management and planning component, could have been more significant had the Government: (a) reached an earlier consensus with respect to the appointment of the returning fellows within MOESYA's structure; and (b) pursued a much needed institutional reform of MOESYA's structure, with clear lines of responsibilities and terms of references for its units and personnel.

7.6 Implementing Agency:

Satisfactory. The rating is based on the following considerations:

- High sense of responsibility and commitment to achieve project development objectives;
- Thorough knowledge of fiduciary requirements, in spite of the initial lack of familiarity with Bank project management requirements;
- Proactiveness and adherence to the Bank's recommendations to improve project performance;
- Willingness to undertake a difficult dialogue with different stakeholders, as well as other MOESYA departments to enhance project impact.

7.7 Overall Borrower performance:
Satisfactory. The rating is based on the factors mentioned in sections 7.4, 7.5, and 7.6 and hereby summarized:

- GOCD's commitment to support the reform of the education sector;
- Continuity of the core personnel in the PMU during the life of the project;
- Achievement of project targets and objectives in almost all sub-components;
- Strict adherence to credit and loan agreements;

8. Lessons Learned

Sectoral reforms need Government's commitment at all levels to succeed: In the case of Dominica, key aspects for the education sector reform should have been framed in the broader context of a civil service reform to achieve the desired reforms in organization and management of the Ministry of Education. In addition, the lack of stronger coordination between the Ministry of Finance and the MOESYA prevented the construction of a new building for the education ministry, which was determined key to achieving the objective of strengthening the management and efficiency of MOESYA.

Communication with the stakeholders on project's objectives and implementation status needs to be guaranteed throughout the project life: Despite initial and extensive consultations with stakeholders, most of the stakeholders emphasized how project objectives and design were not fully understood, thus creating throughout the implementation period many unrealistic and unfulfilled expectations about its final outcome. During project preparation, stakeholders were consulted, but the project failed to adequately incorporate some of their inputs. Better collaboration and dialogue with stakeholders during implementation could have strengthened ownership and helped overcome some difficulties (i.e. teacher union position on adjustment of teacher/student ratios).

Project design should be as thorough as possible and land site issues should be addressed before project negotiation when possible: Though the project benefited from solid preparation, there were aspects that could have been improved to prevent implementation problems. This is the case of the quality of design of infrastructure works. During the preparatory phase of the project, much emphasis was put on the elaboration of preliminary drawings for all facilities to be financed by the project by a renowned international architectural firm with experience in Bank-funded projects. In theory, this should have reduced the delays deriving from assigning this complex task to the Ministry, which did not have the required expertise. Although necessary, this measure did not prove to be sufficient, given the delays that the civil work-related activities indeed experienced, which, in turn, resulted in considerable cost overruns.

Implementation management capacity is crucial to achievement of development objectives: Dominica trained the core PMU staff, who remained involved and led project implementation from inception to completion. This was a positive element that contributed to the achievement of the development objectives, despite initial implementation delays and difficulties.

9. Partner Comments

(a) Borrower/implementing agency:
The Ministry of Education contributed with a report, assessing project implementation and outlining projects outputs and lessons learned from the Borrower's perspective. This is included in Annex 8.

(b) Cofinanciers:
N/A

(c) Other partners (NGOs/private sector):
N/A

10. Additional Information

None.

Annex 1. Key Performance Indicators/Log Frame Matrix

Outcome/impact indicators:

Indicator	Target in SAR/Mid term review	Actual/latest Estimate
Improved management and planning capacity of the MOE.		
- MOE reorganized	Creation of 4 new units which will be fully operative by 2000. Strengthening of the Curriculum Development Unit (CDU).	- Four new units established: Project Management Unit (PMU), Educational Planning and Statistical Unit (EPU), Educational Testing and Exams Unit (ETX), and Educational Materials Unit (EMU). - Strengthening of the CDU.
- Adjust teacher/student ratio	<u>Baseline 1995</u> Primary: 1/21.6 Secondary: 1/17 <u>End project target</u> Primary: 1/30 Secondary:1/25	<u>Actual 2000</u> Primary: 1/18.3 Secondary: 1/18
Improved quality of secondary education		
- Increase percentage of students selected through the CEE to attend secondary school	<u>1994</u> Percentage of passes: 34.2%	<u>Actual 2000</u> Percentage of passes: 76.2%
- Increase general performance at the CXC examinations	<u>1997</u> Percentage of students passing five or more subjects 40.5%	<u>Actual 1998</u> Percentage of students passing five or more subjects: 52.9%
- Reduction of repetition rates:	<u>1996</u> Primary : 5.4% Secondary: 9%	<u>Actual 1999</u> Primary : 3.3% Secondary: 9.9%
- Reduction of drop out rates:	<u>1996</u> Primary: 0.54% Secondary: 2.0%	<u>Actual 1999</u> Primary: 0.16% Secondary: 2.8%
- Availability of instructional materials and equipment	Improved	Improved
Increase enrollment in secondary schools	700 new places created	1,015 new places created

Output Indicators:

Indicator	End of Project Target in SAR/Mid term review	Actual Output
1. Strengthening Management Capacity and Planning		
New Ministry of Education constructed and occupied by 1999	Construction completed by project closing.	A new building for the MOESYA was not built. An existing building was rehabilitated and is fully occupied.
MOE reorganized. Establishment of 4 units, fully operational by project closing	Units established and fully operational.	The MOESYA was not reorganized, but EXT, PMU, EPU and MPU Units were established and are fully operational.
PMU manages the project efficiently and develops new projects.		Accomplished. The PMU is at present preparing a new project with the World Bank as well as with other development institutions.
Staff trained in key MOE units	Fellowships for 25 staff	19 fellowships concluded
Long term development plan for the education sector completed	Strategic Plan finished by 1996	An Educational Development Plan for 1999-2005 and beyond was concluded in 1999 and is under implementation.
Appointment of 5 additional posts in Administration	Five new positions created: 2 Assistant Chief Education Officers, 1 Senior Education Officer and 2 Executive Officers.	Three new positions created under the project: Assistant Chief Education Officer, Senior Administrative Officer and Executive Officer.
Studies on planning and policy related issues	Minimum of three studies	Five studies carried out.
2. Qualitative Improvement of Basic Education		
Strengthening of CDU	Four staff trained	Accomplished
Supply of textbooks in core areas for teacher training in 22 disadvantaged schools		Accomplished
Supply of Science, Mathematics and Social Science kits to 50 primary schools	-	Accomplished
Upgrading of 300 teachers through summer workshops		Accomplished
3. Expand Access to Schools		
New secondary school constructed in an under-served area	Construction finished by project closing.	New school fully operational by March 1998 and no expansion of the other secondary school
Expansion of an existing secondary school		Accomplished by October 1998
Refurbishing of 15 selected primary schools		Accomplished by 2000. According to the school mapping exercise (1994-95), 15 selected primary schools refurbished

Annex 2. Project Costs and Financing

Project Costs by Component (in US$ million equivalent)

Component	Appraisal Estimate	Actual	Percentage of Appraisal
A. Strengthening Management and Planning	1.10	0.74	67.3
B. Qualitative Improvement of Basic Education	2.80	2.07	73.9
C. Expansion and Conservation of School Places	4.00	4.59	114.8
Total Project Costs	7.90	7.40	
Total Financing Required	7.90	7.40	

Project Costs by Procurement Arrangements (Appraisal Estimate) (in US$ million equivalent)

	Procurement Method [1]				
Expenditure Category	ICB	NCB	Other [2]	N.B.F.	Total Cost
1. Works	2.40 (1.70)	1.00 (0.70)	0.80 (0.50)	0.00 (0.00)	4.20 (2.90)
2. Goods	0.30 (0.30)	0.00 (0.00)	1.40 (1.30)	0.00 (0.00)	1.70 (1.60)
3. Technical Assistance	0.00 (0.00)	0.00 (0.00)	1.80 (1.50)	0.00 (0.00)	1.80 (1.50)
4. Maintenance	0.00 (0.00)	0.00 (0.00)	0.00 (0.00)	0.20 (0.00)	0.20 (0.00)
Total	2.70 (2.00)	1.00 (0.70)	4.00 (3.30)	0.20 (0.00)	7.90 (6.00)

Project Costs by Procurement Arrangements (Actual/Latest Estimate) (in US$ million equivalent)

Expenditure Category	Procurement Method [1]				
	ICB	NCB	Other [2]	N.B.F.	Total Cost
1. Works	3.80 (3.80)	0.00 (0.00)	0.90 (0.04)	0.00 (0.00)	4.70 (3.84)
2. Goods	0.53 (0.53)	0.00 (0.00)	0.78 (0.66)	0.00 (0.00)	1.31 (1.19)
3. Technical Assistance	0.00 (0.00)	0.00 (0.00)	1.35 (0.70)	0.00 (0.00)	1.35 (0.70)
4. Maintenance	0.00 (0.00)	0.00 (0.00)	0.00 (0.00)	0.04 (0.00)	0.04 (0.00)
Total	4.33 (4.33)	0.00 (0.00)	3.03 (1.40)	0.04 (0.00)	7.40 (5.73)

1/ Figures in parenthesis are the amounts financed by the Bank. All costs include contingencies.

2/ Includes civil works and goods procured through national shopping, consulting services, services of contracted staff, training, technical assistance services, and incremental operating costs related to managing the project.

Project Financing by Component (in US$ million equivalent)

Components	Appraisal Estimate			Actual/Latest Estimate			Percentage of Appraisal		
	Bank	GOCD	Total	Bank	GOCD	Total	Bank	GOCD	Total
A. Strengthening Management and Planning	0.90	0.20	1.10	0.70	0.04	0.74	77.8	20.0	67.3
B. Qualitative Improvement of Basic Education	2.30	0.50	2.80	1.19	0.88	2.07	51.7	176.0	73.9
C. Expansion and Conservation of School Places	3.00	1.00	4.00	3.84	0.75	4.59	128.0	75.0	114.8
Total Project Costs	6.20	1.70	7.90	5.73	1.67	7.40	92.4	98.2	93.7

Annex 3. Economic Costs and Benefits

N/A

Annex 4. Bank Inputs

(a) Missions:

Stage of Project Cycle	No. of Persons and Specialty (e.g. 2 Economists, 1 FMS, etc.)		Performance Rating	
Month/Year	Count	Specialty	Implementation Progress	Development Objective
Identification/Preparation				
Oct./Nov 1993	2	Educ. Specialists		
May 1994	1	Educ. Specialist		
Appraisal/Negotiation				
April 1995	2	Team Leader, 1 Educ. Specialist		
June 1995	3	Team Leader, 2 Educ. Specialists		
October/Nov. 1995	2	Team Leader, Educ. Specialist		
Supervision				
June 1996	2	Team Leader, Educ. Specialist	S	S
April 1997	1	1 FM Specialist	S	S
May 1997	2	Team Leader, 1 Educ. Consultant	S	S
Nov. 1997	6	Team Leader, 2 Educ. Consultants, 1 FMS, 1 Procurement Analyst,1 Operations Assisstant	S	S
May 1998	6	Team Leader, 2 Educ. Consultants, 1 FMS, 1 Procurement Analyst,1 Architect	S	S
Dec. 1998	4	Team Leader, 2 Educ. Consultants, 1 Procurement Analyst	S	S
June 1999	2	Team Leader, 1 Educ. Consultant	S	S
Dec. 1999	2	Team Leader, 1 Educ. Spec.	S	S
June 2000	3	Team Leader, 1 Educ. Spec.	S	S
Oct. 2000	2	Team Leader, 1 Country Sector Leader	S	S
May 2001	3	Team Leader, 1 Educ. Consultant, 1 Procurement Analyst	S	S
ICR				
Nov. 2001	1	1 Educ. Consultant	S	S
Feb. 2002	3	Team Leader, 1 Econ., 1 Curriculum Consultant	S	S

(b) Staff:

Stage of Project Cycle	Actual/Latest Estimate	
	No. Staff weeks	US$ ('000)
Identification/Preparation	n.a	197,000*
Appraisal/Negotiation	n.a	187,000*
Supervision	n.a	195,000*
ICR	4.81	40,000
Total	n.a	619,000*

* These table is based on the information currently available on SAP. The figures for identification/preparation and appraisal negotiation are an estimate. The information system provides a total amount for these categories. Amounts are not disagregated before FY98.

Annex 5. Ratings for Achievement of Objectives/Outputs of Components

(H=High, SU=Substantial, M=Modest, N=Negligible, NA=Not Applicable)

	Rating
☐ *Macro policies*	○ *H* ○ *SU* ○ *M* ○ *N* ● *NA*
☐ *Sector Policies*	○ *H* ○ *SU* ● *M* ○ *N* ○ *NA*
☐ *Physical*	○ *H* ● *SU* ○ *M* ○ *N* ○ *NA*
☐ *Financial*	○ *H* ○ *SU* ● *M* ○ *N* ○ *NA*
☐ *Institutional Development*	○ *H* ● *SU* ○ *M* ○ *N* ○ *NA*
☐ *Environmental*	○ *H* ○ *SU* ○ *M* ○ *N* ● *NA*
Social	
☐ *Poverty Reduction*	○ *H* ○ *SU* ○ *M* ○ *N* ● *NA*
☐ *Gender*	○ *H* ○ *SU* ○ *M* ○ *N* ● *NA*
☐ *Other (Please specify)*	○ *H* ○ *SU* ○ *M* ○ *N* ● *NA*
☐ *Private sector development*	○ *H* ○ *SU* ○ *M* ○ *N* ● *NA*
☐ *Public sector management*	○ *H* ○ *SU* ○ *M* ○ *N* ● *NA*
☐ *Other (Please specify)*	○ *H* ○ *SU* ○ *M* ○ *N* ● *NA*

Annex 6. Ratings of Bank and Borrower Performance

(HS=Highly Satisfactory, S=Satisfactory, U=Unsatisfactory, HU=Highly Unsatisfactory)

6.1 Bank performance	*Rating*
☐ *Lending*	○ *HS* ● *S* ○ *U* ○ *HU*
☐ *Supervision*	○ *HS* ● *S* ○ *U* ○ *HU*
☐ *Overall*	○ *HS* ● *S* ○ *U* ○ *HU*

6.2 Borrower performance	*Rating*
☐ *Preparation*	○ *HS* ● *S* ○ *U* ○ *HU*
☐ *Government implementation performance*	○ *HS* ● *S* ○ *U* ○ *HU*
☐ *Implementation agency performance*	○ *HS* ● *S* ○ *U* ○ *HU*
☐ *Overall*	○ *HS* ● *S* ○ *U* ○ *HU*

Annex 7. List of Supporting Documents

Bank preparation documents

- Consultants report on : Education Management and Planning; Basic Education Program; Curriculum Development; Civil Works; Inventory of School Resources and Access to Basic Education (1994).
- Pre-Appraisal mission terms of reference, Aide-Memoire and Back to Office report. World Bank. 1995.
- Appraisal mission terms of reference, Aide-Memoire and Back to Office report. World Bank. 1995.
- Staff Appraisal Report. World Bank. November 1995.

Bank project implementation documents

- Aide-Memoires of Supervision missions. World Bank. 1996-2001
- Project Status Reports (PSR). World Bank. 1996-2002

List of studies financed by the Project and Documents prepared by the Borrower

- "Indicators 2000 ". MOESYA 2000.
- "Education Development Plan for 1999-2005 and Beyond". MOEYSA, 1999.
- Impact Review of the Basic Education Reform Project and Secondary Education Support Project. MOEYSA 2001.
- "Teacher Effectiveness and Efficiency" . MOESYA. 1998.
- " Structural integrity Assessment of the Dominica Grammar School". MOESYA. December 2001.

Additional Annex 8. Borrower's Contribution

Project Implementation Completion Report

1. Assessment of the Objective

The overall objective of the project was to accelerate human resource development to ensure that the requisite manpower exists to attain the desired economic transition. The project was in support of the first stage of a major reform of basic education aimed at

i) Improving the efficiency and effectiveness of the education system
ii) Enhancing equity access to educational opportunities.

The overall objective of the project was consistent with the priorities outlined in the 1994 medium term strategy paper. It also reflected attempts to respond to issues outlined in the officially endorsed proposal for education reform within the OECS subregion namely "Foundation for the Future: OECS Education Reform Strategy" (1991). With respect to Dominica, this blue print for educational reform identified the main issues as access, equity, efficiency, wastage, quality and effectiveness. Therefore, it is reasonable to conclude that the project objective was consistent with the priorities that were identified at both the national and subregional levels.

2. Assessment of the Design

BERP was structured around three main components. These were:

i) Strengthening Management and Planning
ii) Qualitative Improvement of Basic Education
iii) Expansion and Conservation of School Places

The selection of these components was based on the assumption that the improvement of the MOE's technical capacity was a prerequisite for improved planning and management of the sector. At the same time, it recognized that urgent measures were needed to address system-wide qualitative problems and the expansion needs at the secondary level. In addition, the project was intended to be the first stage of what was expected to be a major reform program for which it would serve as a catalyst. In particular, it was designed to improve efficiency, quality, access and equity.

The design was consistent with the objectives and, while it attracted some criticism in terms of the limited allocation for learning inputs and the relatively minuscule provision for teacher training, the project positioned the ministry to optimize the opportunities for further development of the sector. The strategies for subsequent projects were fashioned to complement the BERP. For example, the Secondary Education Support Project (DFID funded) contributed to the expansion of access in under-served areas and offered BERP-trained curriculum specialist to develop curriculum guides for forms 1 to 3 of the secondary subsystem. The strengthened capacity for leadership and technical support within the MOE and the extent to which this newly established capacity has been deployed to help reverse the problems within the sector, attest to the success of the design.

3. Assessment of Project Outcomes

a) Planning and Management of the Sector.

By establishing the PMU, the project secured for the MOE a permanent capacity for planning and managing projects, and the extension of its responsibilities to other donor supported initiatives commenced less than a year after effectiveness. Throughout the life of the project, the borrower maintained the PMU in accord with the terms of the Loan and Credit Agreements. All members of staff are on the permanent establishment.

The Education Planning and Statistics Unit followed the establishment of the PMU as a condition for Project effectiveness (09/96) and has been maintained with configuration and functions that are consistent with the Loan and Credit Agreement. It established an invaluable system for educational statistics, and with the assistance of technical experts (BERP- and SESP-sponsored), it detailed the Education Development Plan. While sections of the EDP are being implemented, at the time of writing it had not yet received ratification from the new administration.

b) Qualitative Improvement of Basic Education

The procurement of training programs was staggered throughout the lifetime of the project, but on return of the trained fellows, the borrower demonstrated commitment towards the establishment of new posts and the necessary appointments. This allowed for the development of the Curriculum Unit, strengthened capacity for supervision, capacity for general editing, improvement in school library services, the establishment of measurement and evaluation capacity and enhanced capacity for teacher education.

The strengthening and establishment of the various units and the wide range of training have all had a positive impact on improvement of quality in the education system. Additionally, the improvement in working conditions with the new administrative offices, computers and other tools and equipment, along with relevant reading materials, have enhanced the quality of operations of the MOE.

Despite repeated attempts, successful recruitment of a trainee for graphic arts proved very difficult and in the end this fellowship was abandoned. But the potential impact of this change was mitigated by advances in computer software technology. Other changes in appointments which were not related to fellowships were the borrower's decision to appoint one Assistant Chief Education Officer as opposed to two and to forego the appointment of a Senior Education Officer for primary schools.

Currently, not enough information exists to assess the impact of the BERP on the development objectives, specifically on the more long term issues of quality improvement in human resource development. Baseline studies and national assessments conducted by the Measurement and Evaluation Unit over the past two years of the project life indicate that less than desirable levels of literacy and numeracy pervade the system. However, improved access to secondary schooling, the strengthening of institutional management and advances in teacher preparation are areas of growth.

c) Implementation of Efficiency Measures

There have been declines in both the dropout and repetition rates for primary school during the project life, indicative of the improvement in the efficiency of the education system. However similar rates for the secondary level have increased slightly (<1%). The strengthening of the Teachers' College has seen an increase in the number of trained teachers, particularly in the secondary cycle. However, teacher attrition continues to be of concern to the sustainability of gains made in this respect.

One area of concern the BERP has been its inability to reduce the pupil-teacher ratio as projected. The ratio for primary school had declined by 0.4 to 1:21.4.; although the total number of teachers have declined from 679 to 602 during the life of the project, the projected pupil-teacher ratio was 1:30.

While the secondary schools did not achieve the projected pupil-teacher ratio of 1:18.6, there has been a noted increase from 1:16.6 to 1:17.9. There has also been a 40% increase in student enrollment over the period under review and a 30% increase in staff. At the same time, Trade Unions have not responded favorably to attempts to increase the pupil teacher ratio. Moreover, the reduction of teachers could not be accompanied by a corresponding increase in instructional and other related resources, so as to negate the negative impact of larger class sizes. The level of improvements in equity to access has not been followed by similar improvements in equity of scarce resources available to education. The reduction in the primary school enrollment continues to create conditions for the implementation of equity protocols, but the necessary leadership at both the administrative and political level, along with stakeholder discussions, will continue to be critical to the realization of the goals of efficiency within the education system. Given the current economic downturn, the need to improve efficiency in education should be a priority.

d) Civil works:

(d.i) New construction and rehabilitation works

Planned new construction works were designed to expand access to secondary education, improve school library services, build a district education office and provide office facilities for the staff of the MOE. Together this accounted for US$4,213,942 or 53.1% of original estimated project cost.

The project delivered the Castle Bruce Secondary School, the expansion of the Portsmouth Secondary School, the Portsmouth School Library and the Ministry of Education Administrative Complex. In addition, the Borrower and the Bank agreed that the need for the construction of a new toilet block at the Portsmouth Secondary School had been overlooked during project preparation and this was added as a new item. The schools and library were built according to the original specifications. Alterations were made to the original design and proposed site for the office space for new MOE management and technical units. The construction of the district education office was cancelled and office space was allocated to these officers in the MOE administrative complex. On the whole, civil works were front-loaded, and for their implementation the PMU was fairly well supported by architectural engineering services contracted under the project. The consultants were based in Trinidad and Tobago.

In general, actual cost exceeded SAR estimates but these were within contract sum. The disparity between SAR estimates and actual cost may be attributed to time lags between project preparation stage and implementation as well as inaccuracies in the costing process.

With the exception of the Castle Bruce Secondary School on which there was a 9-month delay, all new works were completed within the projected construction time frame. The delay on Castle Bruce was the result of inadequate site investigation and management issues. The delays in the preparation of the MOE administrative building meant that the offices were not available for use at the time of return of the first group of trained fellows.

(d.ii) Rehabilitation

The project provided for the rehabilitation of selected primary schools. This sub-component was implemented in three phases leading to the rehabilitation of 13 primary schools and one secondary school. While US$100,000 was established as a ceiling for any particular school, agreement was reached on rehabilitating the secondary school at a cost of US$261,709.65 (EC$706,607.95). This necessitated an increase in the budgetary allocation for rehabilitation from a SAR estimate of US$633,766 to US$947,319.99 Throughout the implementation of civil works, the Borrower was supported by architectural and engineering services procured under a project-sponsored contract.

e) Fellowships

A total of 25 fellowships were envisioned under the project over a period of 253 person months. The first 4 fellowships were financed under a DFID-supported facility and balances within the Japanese Project Preparation Grant (PHRD) supported the first 8 study tours. These facilities allowed the borrower to increase training by the addition of a fourth fellowship in teacher education with a focus on Language Arts (See Appendix 1).

Long-term training was procured from regional and international institutions. Programs were delivered within budgetary projections, and on completion of this sub-component there were overall budgetary saving of US$195,876.78

For the most part, fellows indicated strong satisfaction with the programs they received. The MOE's readiness to utilize the newly acquired skills and knowledge was constrained by the delayed completion of the new office space and the attendant protracted procurement of critical equipment for which alternative office space was unavailable. In addition, the delay in the availability of the office space made it more challenging for the MOE to secure the coordination of work programs among newly trained personnel and established units.

f) Procurement of goods

Under this category, the project provided for school and office equipment, furniture, vehicles, textbooks and other educational materials, office supplies, computer hardware and software. While original specifications for goods were in some cases upgraded, all items were procured in accordance with the terms of the Loan and Credit Agreements. The procurement plans for the Castle Bruce and Portsmouth Secondary Schools and the Portsmouth School Library were detailed so that the delivery coincided with completion of the civil works. Instructional inputs for rehabilitated schools were procured within the second year of the project and school furniture was procured through four contracts.

The procurement of office furniture and equipment was conducted through a series of small contracts that were awarded throughout the lifetime of the project, thus resulting in multiple contracts for similar items. This was as a direct result of the delayed completion of the new office space.

Under the life of the project, the price of computers declined, thereby allowing the borrower to purchase additional computers without exceeding the projected SAR cost. In particular, changes in the procurement plans were made to procure complete sets of computers and peripherals for the Castle Bruce Secondary and Portsmouth Secondary expansion. Each institution received 25 computers. Additionally, significant savings were also realized on the mobile library. In general, suppliers adhered to the terms and conditions of the agreement.

g) Expert Services

Expert services were designed to strengthen the institutional capacity of the MOE through skills transfer to the newly established units. Project provisions were made for consultancy services in education management, education planning, project management, procurement, educational testing and production of reading materials and auditing. Without exception, contracts were awarded in all these areas.

(g.i) Education Administration

The first contract was awarded in education administration. While a very useful report was delivered after a period of intense collaboration, implementation of the recommendations was negatively affected by the non-appointment of a change manager within the ministry and the frequent changes within the office of the Permanent Secretary. The end result is that restructuring is still ongoing with the terms of reference of some new units awaiting formal adoption.

(g.ii) Education Planning and Statistics

The consultancy on Education Planning entailed the strengthening of the establishment of an Education Planning and Statistic Unit, which was established about four months prior. It resulted in training of 6 members of staff, and the first draft of the education sector plan was prepared during that consultancy. This was a highly effective consultancy during which the technician actively engaged in transfer of skills and knowledge.

(g.iii) Procurement

The consultancy for procurement services involved three phases and focused on the procurement of goods. On hindsight, the TOR could have been improved to ensure that skill transfer with regards to the procurement of civil works and services were provided for. Nonetheless, the consultant for procurement services was among the most effective with regards to the delivery of his obligations.

(g.iv) Project Management

This was the fourth consultancy to be awarded and was fairly effective in its attempts to help strengthen the work of the PMU.

(g.v) Educational Testing

This consultancy helped to strengthen the capacity of the Testing and Measurement Unit and was delivered in two stages. It also assisted in designing the specification for equipment and material needs and offered recommendations on policy with respect to system-wide testing and the development of the Testing and Measurement Unit. This consultancy satisfied the requirements of the TORS and met the expectations of the staff of the Testing and Measurement Unit.

(g.vi) Preparation, Publishing and Distribution of Education Materials

This consultancy was intended to strengthen the capacity of the MOE to produce, edit and publish educational materials. It also offered recommendations on production and procurement policies. Broad-based and extensive hands-on training was provided in the preparation and production of materials and two readers were actually delivered. These were for Social Studies and Language Arts.

Because of the difficulty associated with selection and placement of a fellow in editing, this consultancy was staged within the last year of the project. This was because the presence of the general editor as the counterpart for this consultancy was considered critical for effective skill transfer. However, the hands on approach and the involvement of a wide cross-section of MOE officials, primary teachers, all curriculum officers, learning support personnel, tutors of the Teachers College and personnel from other ministries made the consultancy extremely successful in terms of its overall impact and the potential for permanent capacity in desk top publishing, general editing and materials production within the MOE.

(g.vii) Audit

Six annual audits were conducted in compliance with the terms and conditions of the Loan and Credit Agreement. Throughout the project a single audit firm was contracted. While the procedures proved a bit challenging at the onset, in general the final product was satisfactory.

(g.viii) Overall Assessment of Consultancies

Three of the six contracts involved one person teams while the others consisted of three (3) persons on average, with varied skills and background which reflected the needs of the special assignments. One-person teams proved to be extremely effective and were among the most successful in the delivery of requisite technical assistance. In all cases, TORS were prepared using a collaborative approach and with expert inputs where necessary. In general, they proved appropriate. The actual cost for these consultancies was within SAR estimates and the savings under this category were eventually reallocated.

h) Studies

The project provided for a number of studies designed to address data gaps and inform policy decisions. Specifically, the SAR listed the following:

- Organizational and expenditure efficiency under Senior Management and Administration;
- Selected sector planning and policy related studies and surveys;
- Selected project evaluation studies;
- Studies on the impact of books and materials on student performance;

- Studies on the impact of reading on student performance;
- Studies related to testing and measurement as well as curriculum related studies.

By project completion, the following studies were realized: teacher effectiveness and efficiency, summative evaluation of the BERP and the SESP and a Structural Integrity Assessment of the Dominica Grammar School. The latter was a project preparatory study for future plans. Additionally, similar exercises were done for literacy and for the smooth transition of students from the primary to the secondary level. While the number of project-financed studies was limited, a number of such complimentary activities were conducted by MOE staff or by use of other funding. Among these were studies on male underachievement, evaluation of the school feeding program, evaluation of the textbook provision scheme and salary expenditure ratios.

i) Training

Budgetary allocations were made for training in planning and statistics, curriculum, supervision, testing and measurement, teacher training, educational materials development and use of the library. Project sponsored training was delivered in all of the areas (see Appendix 2). In all cases, these were planned and managed by the units or other interested entities. The organizers worked closely with the staff of the PMU. In some cases, returned fellows served as facilitators.

The achievement of planned works in teacher education was limited by parallel activities that pursued teacher education objectives. Notable among these is the Primary Education Program. The result was that the SAR estimates for teacher education were underutilized and eventually reallocated. But local training served as a successful strategy for useful skill transfer and capacity growth, particularly in newly established areas such as testing and measurement, school library services, planning and educational statistics and supervision.

4. Assessment of Operational Experiences

While a Project Advisory Committee was proposed, it ceased to function after two meetings within the first quarter of project implementation. It would appear that the officials from outside the MOE found it difficult to give the necessary time.

The borrower allowed the PMU to manage the implementation of the project. The Project Manager worked very closely with the Chief Education Officer and the Permanent Secretary and liased with the officials of the Ministry of Finance. Regular quarterly reports were prepared and monthly financial statements were submitted to all high profile stakeholders. In addition, from the outset, the Project Manager was added to the MOE's Senior Management team. This involvement at the policy level of the MOE ensured the continuation of strong political support and proved advantageous with regards to timely resolution of challenges.

5. Evaluation of Borrower's performance

- The Borrower maintained a PMU with critical staff responsible for the implementation of the project, including the Project Manager, Procurement Officer, Project Accountant. This proved to be an effective approach.
- The political commitment to the provision of counterpart funding for the project is commendable since the project survived three successive political administrations. Each remained committed to the objective and intent of the project.
- Every effort was made to provide timely counterpart funds as required for smooth implementation.
- Openness and transparency characterized the operation of the project.
- The Borrower remained committed to ongoing dialogue with the Bank during implementation.
- In general, strict adherence was maintained with regards to the terms and conditions of the Loan and Credit Agreement.

6. The Bank's Performance

During the preparatory stages of the project, the Bank collaborated with the MOE to ensure a consultative approach to the identification of project objectives and the selection of project strategies. These included meetings with a wide range of government officials particularly from education and the Ministry of Finance, as well as representatives of the teaching service and unions.

There were eleven (11) Bank supervision missions and two pre-appraisal missions by Bank staff, and on two occasions, staff of the implementing agency and other MOE officials were invited to travel to Washington D.C. The missions included an education specialist who was usually the task manager, a financial management analyst and a procurement specialist.

During those supervision missions, the Bank assessed progress with project objectives and changes in Government's education policy, reviewed accounting practices, financial budgets, procurement activities and compliance with the Loan and Credit Agreements. By working closely with the Borrower's implementing agency, Bank missions provided counseling and technical support.

In general, the Bank responded in a timely manner to the Borrower's request for assistance. A positive and timely response was given to the Borrower's application for one amendment to the Development and Credit Agreements and subsequent to this, there were positive responses to two applications for reallocations of category balances and a six month extension of the project.

Generally, withdrawal applications were processed within two weeks. However, in general, responses to the audited annual reports were delayed and the same may be said for feedback on the quarterly financial reports.

7. Project Sustainability

The deliverables of the project have all been incorporated into the normal operations of the Ministry of Education. All fellows have been appointed to predetermined posts on the Establishment and all new units are in pursuit of the functions for which they were designed. In addition, adequate budgetary provisions have been made for the payment of salaries and the operations of the new and expanded school, the MOE Administrative complex and the Portsmouth School Library Center.

8. Future Operations

The MOE will need to continue its efforts at restructuring. Although progress on this goal was accelerated by the establishment of the new and strengthened units, formal adoption of terms of reference is still outstanding. The same is true of the learning support and counselling capability of the MOE that was established under the Secondary Education Support Project. More importantly, ongoing efforts are needed to optimize the benefits to the school system and to secure a cohesive and adequately coordinated approach to the planning and delivery of work programs. There is also scope for use of the newly found expertise in areas of tertiary education.

The Borrower needs to continue efforts to secure a more equitable distribution of resources within the school system. At the same time, measures at improved efficiency and qualitative gains across the sector should be rigorously pursued. Teacher education, continued expansion and improvement of secondary school places in the southeast and the capital and deficiencies in the curricular provisions are visible areas for additional investment.

Additional areas are completion of a preventive maintenance strategy for school plans and the operationalization of plant maintenance schedules.

9. Lessons Learned

The project was designed with successor projects in mind, as such complementarity with other initiatives was very easily secured.

- While a participatory approach was used in project preparation and continued during the first two years of implementation, this waned with time and might have contributed to a limited understanding of the purpose and objectives of the project.
- Public awareness should be sustained throughout the project cycle.
- Strong political support was required for early appointment to newly established posts and timely provisions of counterpart funding
- Early participation and continued involvement of the Ministry of Finance is critical to successful implementation.
- A willingness to engage the Bank in ongoing dialogue is essential for timely resolution of challenges.
- Future operations must ensure that the MOE establishes the mechanism for transforming project output into areas of project impact.
- Successful organizational restructuring requires the appointment of a change manager and a clearly defined implementation strategy and plan.
- The MOE should establish end user policies and training programs prior to procurement of equipment.
- The selection of indicators should be reviewed so that they are reasonable, achievable and politically acceptable.

APPENDIX 1 -Fellowships under the BERP

Fellowships	Recipients	Institution/University
Planning and Development		
Economics of Education	Max Andrew	University of London
Statistician	Vanya Jones	University of The West Indies
Planner	Ted Serrant	University of Pittsburg
Curriculum Development		
Language Arts	Nisbertha Buffong	University of the West Indies
Mathematics	Simon Sharplis	New Mexico State University
Social Studies	Edward Lawrence	University of the West Indies
Science	Frank Newton	New Mexico State University
School Supervision		
School Supervision	Arundell Thomas	New Mexico State University
School Supervision	Stephen Hyacinth	University of the West Indies
Testing and Measurement		
Testing Specialist	Nicholas Goldberg	University of Toronto (OISE)
Testing Specialist	Rock Bruno	Manchester University
Educational Materials		
Art Editing	-	
General Editing	Rachel Panthier	Pace University
Teacher Training		
Science	Rosette Prince	University of the West Indies
Mathematics	Adrien Durand	University of the West Indies
Teacher Training Cont.		
Education	Steve Joseph	University of the West Indies
Language Arts	Erma Alfred	University of Sussex
School Library System		
Library Technician	Monique Matthew	Excelsior
Library Technician	Jennifer Joseph	Excelsior College
Librarian	Davina Jones	
Study Tour		
Accountant Attachment	Dorella Williams	St. Lucia
Workshop/Meeting	David Edwards	Trinidad
Workshop/Meeting	David Edwards	St.Lucia
World Bank Mission	David Edwards	Washington
World Bank Mission	Dorella Williams	Washington
Senior Management		
Workshop/Meeting	Hon. Ronald Green	France
Workshop/Meeting	Merille Matthew	France
Workshop/Meeting	Patsy Letang	France
Workshop/Meeting	Anthony Lockhart	Trinidad
Workshop/Meeting	Anthony Lockhart	St.Lucia
World Bank Mission	Felix Gregoire	Washington

APPENDIX 2 - Local Training under the BERP

Component	Training	Beneficiaries
Education Planning Unit	Training in Statistics for Assistant Statistician	1 person
Education Planning Unit	Training in Statistics for Assistant Statistician	1 person
Curriculum	Workshops in Language Arts, Science Mathematics and Social Studies	162 Teachers 64 principals
Teacher training	Workshop on the use of Science and Mathematics kits	67 Teachers
Teacher Training	Summer Workshop for Teachers conflict resolution Process of Science Management & Supervision	21 Teachers 41Teachers 34 teachers
Testing & Measurement	Training activities for National Assessment Test	60 principals 55 teachers 30 Staff Moe
Teacher training	Summer Workshop for Teachers In-Service Training	34 Teachers
Curriculum Development	Workshop in Educational Materials Production	18 Teachers
School Library Systems	Workshops on School Libraries: a resource full option	81 teachers
Testing & Measurement	Training activities for National Assessment Test	
Teacher training	Summer Workshop for Teachers In-Service Training	35 teachers
	Readers purchase for teacher training	
Educational Materials	Training in Art Design for General Editor	1 person
Senior Management	Retreat for School Supervision	
Teacher Training	Summer Workshop for Teachers	35 Teachers
Testing & Measurement	National Assessment	

IMAGING

Report No.: 24199
Type: ICR