

Document of
The World Bank

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY

Report No. 18751

IMPLEMENTATION COMPLETION REPORT
TRINIDAD & TOBAGO
YOUTH TRAINING AND EMPLOYMENT PARTNERSHIP PROJECT
(YTEPP)

[LOAN 3328-TR]

December 28, 1998

Sector Management Unit
Human Development
Latin America and the Caribbean Regional Office

This document has a restricted distribution and may be used by recipients only in the performance of their official duties. Its contents may not otherwise be disclosed without World Bank authorization.

Currency Equivalent

Current Unit = Trinidad & Tobago Dollar (TT\$)
US\$1.00 = TT\$6.29

Fiscal Year

January 1 - December 31

GLOSSARY OF ACRONYMS

CEO	Chief Executive Officer
GORTT	Government of the Republic of Trinidad & Tobago
IBRD	International Bank for Reconstruction and Development
LLC	Limited Liability Company
LMIS	Labor Market Information System
MOE	Ministry of Education
NGO	Non-Governmental Organization
NTA	National Training Agency
NTB	National Training Board
SAR	Staff Appraisal Report
SBDC	Small Business Development Company
YESS	Youth Enterprise Support System

Vice President	Shahid Javed Burki
Country Unit Director	Orsalia Kalantzopolous
Country Sector Leader	Jamil Salmi
Task Manager - Proj.	Joel Reyes
Task Manager - ICR	Jennifer Leach

Table of Contents

PREFACE	i
EVALUATION SUMMARY	ii
PART I. PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION ASSESSMENT	1
PROJECT OBJECTIVES AND DESCRIPTION	1
ACHIEVEMENT OF PROJECT OBJECTIVES	2
IMPLEMENTATION RECORD AND MAJOR FACTORS AFFECTING THE PROJECT	4
PROJECT SUSTAINABILITY	6
BANK PERFORMANCE	7
BORROWER PERFORMANCE	8
ASSESSMENT OF OUTCOME	8
CURRENT AND FUTURE OPERATIONS	9
KEY LESSONS LEARNED AND RECOMMENDATIONS FOR FUTURE OPERATIONS	9
PART II. STATISTICAL ANNEXES	11
<i>Table 1: Summary of Assessments</i>	<i>11</i>
<i>Table 2: Related Bank Loans/Credits</i>	<i>12</i>
<i>Table 3: IBRD Project Timetable</i>	<i>12</i>
<i>Table 4: Loan Disbursements: Cumulative Estimated and Actual</i>	<i>13</i>
<i>Tables 5-6: Key Indicators for Project Implementation and Operation</i>	<i>13</i>
<i>Table 7: Studies Completed</i>	<i>23</i>
<i>Table 8B: Global Project Financing</i>	<i>24</i>
<i>Table 9: Economic Costs and Benefits</i>	<i>25</i>
<i>Table 10: Status of Legal Covenants</i>	<i>26</i>
<i>Table 11: Compliance with Operational Manual Statements</i>	<i>27</i>
<i>Table 12: Bank Resources: Staff Inputs (SW, Actual)</i>	<i>27</i>
<i>Table 13: Bank Resources: Missions</i>	<i>28</i>

This document has a restricted distribution and may be used by recipients only in the performance of their official duties. Its contents may not otherwise be disclosed without World Bank authorization.
--

IMPLEMENTATION COMPLETION REPORT
TRINIDAD AND TOBAGO
YOUTH TRAINING AND EMPLOYMENT PARTNERSHIP
PROJECT (LOAN 3328 TRINIDAD AND TOBAGO)

PREFACE

This is the Implementation Completion Report (ICR) for the Youth Training and Employment Partnership Project (YTEPP), for which Loan 3328-TR in the amount of US\$20.7 million was approved on May 21, 1991, signed on August 29, 1991, and declared effective on October 18, 1991. The Loan was closed on June 30, 1998. It was not fully disbursed: US\$1.50 million was canceled; the last disbursement took place on August 19, 1998.

The ICR was prepared by Jennifer Leach, Consultant, with extensive input from Joel Reyes, Operations Officer, and able assistance from Ada Rivera, Task Assistant. The ICR was reviewed by Jamil Salmi (LCSHD) and Raj Nallari (LCC3C). The Borrower prepared a separate report in two parts: one prepared by the Ministry of Education, the other by Project staff. Both are included as an appendix to the ICR; further technical appendices, listed on page 30, are available in the project files.

Preparation for this ICR is based, *inter alia*, on the Bank's final supervision/ICR mission, which took place in June, 1998; the Loan Agreement; supervision reports; interviews with relevant Bank staff; the mid-term review; correspondence between the Bank and the Borrower; tracer studies (conducted each year of the project); and YTEPP reports.

YOUTH TRAINING AND EMPLOYMENT PARTNERSHIP PROJECT
(LOAN 3328-TR)

TRINIDAD & TOBAGO

EVALUATION SUMMARY

Introduction

i. This project was approved by the Board on May 21, 1991, signed on August 29, 1991, and declared effective on October 18, 1991. At the time of appraisal total project costs were estimated at US\$31.9 million equivalent, of which US\$20.7 million was to be financed by the IBRD loan, with the balance to be financed by the Government of Trinidad & Tobago. This project required 6 years and 9 months for completion, which is somewhat longer than the average completion period for social projects. The final disbursement was effected in August, 1998.

Project Objectives

ii. The project was to assist the Government to improve the design, delivery and effectiveness of YTEPP, which offers education and training and other support services to youth to enhance their employability and self-employment prospects. This was achieved by pursuing four key objectives: (i) to improve the quality and relevance of education and training for employment through the development of curriculum, training of instructors and provision of equipment for training facilities and various training programs; (ii) to increase the opportunities offered to youth to acquire work experience in private enterprises or public agencies to facilitate their first entry into the labor market; (iii) to promote self-employment initiatives of youth through self-employment and small business training and the linking of a network of credit institutions capable of providing loans for small businesses; and (iv) to strengthen the management of the YTEPP Program to enhance the effectiveness of its training activities and capacity to program, monitor and evaluate training and post-training support operations and their impact on youth employment.

iii. Project Content: To achieve the objectives described above, the project included three core components: (i) "Education and Training" (US\$19.0 million), to assist YTEPP in improving the design of its education and training courses, upgrading the quality of its teaching staff, and providing supplementary instructional equipment and materials; (ii) "Post-training Assistance" (US\$3.3 million), to support, with parallel co-financing by the private sector, work experience placements for trainees in order to facilitate their first entry into the labor market, and promote youth self-employment initiatives; and (iii) "Program Management Strengthening" (US\$9.6 million), to strengthen management of YTEPP's training programs, establish project monitoring and evaluation systems and support a labor market information system (LMIS) to assist with planning of training.

Implementation Experience and Results

iv. During its implementation, and as a result of the mid-term restructuring of the project, YTEPP fully met its quantitative targets. Over the course of the project, YTEPP established 29 part-time centers, plus 5 full-time centers and various community-based programs on both Trinidad and Tobago. On average, 5,000 students per cycle were accepted, with between 3,000-4,000 graduating. A total of 49,064 clients graduated over the life of the project, 41,066 from center-based programs, 5,203 from community-based, and 2,726 in microentrepreneurship (of which 69 were trained in community-based centers). 2,076 clients received work experience placements, or about 5 percent of all graduates. Of the total number of vocational skills graduates, 35,446 also graduated from the Career Enhancement training subcomponent; 6,566 received special tutoring in literacy and numeracy over the life of the project. In addition, the management capacity of YTEPP increased steadily over the course of the project, and its programming, monitoring and evaluation activities were consistently of high quality. The other two development objectives were partially met—the shortfall is primarily due to the fact that these objectives were out of the control of the project. Despite these shortcomings, the project's record of success led to an overall rating of satisfactory.

v. As indicated by Table 1 in the Statistical Annexes, the overall outcome of the project was rated satisfactory in every major area. The project maintained satisfactory or highly satisfactory ratings since its approval. The project was well targeted to the neediest clients (80 percent of participants have been drawn from uneducated/unskilled groups), and has been largely demand-driven and locally executed. The technical operation of the project management and the training centers was good and largely free from political interference (see below for discussion of local political pressures). YTEPP was well managed, with highly qualified and dedicated staff, and a very active Board of Directors under the Limited Liability Company structure that has kept the YTEPP Company outside of the normal political channels. Despite early, stringent targets for project performance, the design of the project appears to have been appropriate to achieve the stated objectives. This statement is further supported by the results of the four tracer studies carried out by the project, which provide evidence to the project's success. Nonetheless, the project started slowly and required two extra years to reach its objectives.

vi. Four tracer studies were carried out over the course of the project, beginning in 1991, the results of which further indicate the successes of YTEPP's efforts. The studies' findings include the following: (i) unemployment rates of YTEPP graduates are consistently lower than the rate in the same cohort of the general population; (ii) 58 percent of YTEPP graduates aged 15-19 participate in the labor market, as opposed to 32.4 percent of the same group in the general population; (iii) the absorption rate of female YTEPP graduates increased 46.7 percent between 1993-96, a 32.8 percentage point gain over the 13.9 percent rate of the control group; (iv) likewise, over the same period, the absorption rate of male YTEPP graduates increased 51.8 percent, a 20.3 percent gain over the control group's increase (31.5 percent); (v) post-YTEPP earnings

are directly linked to participation in the program (with the most significant impact on the least educated and least skilled group); (vi) a higher proportion of YTEPP graduates opt for self-employment as compared to the control group; (vii) YTEPP's gains are especially notable given that the average YTEPP applicant has a marginally lower academic background as compared to the control group; and (viii) YTEPP has been successful in attracting two of the most vulnerable groups in society and enhancing their employability: women and incarcerated men.

vii. With the combination of government and private sector interest in the future of the project, prospects for the sustainability of the YTEPP are good. YTEPP has developed very good managerial capacity, and has proven its ability to diversify training to cater to market needs without a major increase to recurrent expenditures. It is able to service a range of different groups in a variety of sectors. The GORTT has apparently recognized YTEPP's success, and the continuing demand for its services, with the inclusion of YTEPP in the newly-created NTA under the newly-created Ministry of Information, Communication, Training and Distance Learning. Despite the importance given to training by the government, the future success of YTEPP as part of the NTA will depend on the extent to which the government retains the most successful aspects of the project. Key among these is the institutional structure of the YTEPP as an LLC, providing a great deal of necessary independence and flexibility to adjust to a changing market, new technologies, and new management practices.

viii. Bank performance was satisfactory at every stage of the project cycle, despite a certain optimism in the project design, in terms of targets set. It should be noted, however, that strong performance and collaboration by YTEPP facilitated Bank involvement. The relevant technical assistance was provided as needed, and a very cordial relationship has been maintained with project staff and with the GORTT. Particular mention is due to the mid-term mission, which provided a thorough, balanced, and constructive analysis of the project's past performance and options for the future. Despite the fact that YTEPP had not met original targets, the mission found the project to be successful; building on the positive aspects identified, the joint actions of the mission and the GORTT sparked a restructuring of the project. It was on the basis of this work done by the Bank and the project that YTEPP was positioned for the continued growth of its success.

ix. Borrower performance was satisfactory for both identification/preparation and implementation. YTEPP staff has been consistently highly qualified and dedicated, and its managerial capacity has steadily increased over the course of the project. Despite the lack of a formal framework in which the project could operate, the GORTT proved a reliable supporter of YTEPP and its activities. Most remarkable is that, in spite of political pressure, YTEPP was allowed to remain a corporate body outside the normal governmental and ministerial channels. Audits, monitoring indicators, and evaluation reporting were generally complete and punctual. Visiting missions were given full support and extensive field visits were encouraged and well facilitated.

Summary of Key Findings and Lessons Learned

Some of the key lessons learned from YTEPP's experience and recommendations for future operations may be summarized as follows:

- The expansion of linkages with private industry, government departments, and public companies is key for project sustainability, both in terms of hiring YTEPP graduates, and in contracting YTEPP services. Coordination is also important with related line ministries (e.g., the MOE, which provided access to facilities, equipment, human resources and technical expertise).
- It is important to delineate areas of responsibility for the vocational-technical training field, particularly with the creation of the NTA and the increasing training activities of private groups. Absence of institutional framework probably limited the advances that YTEPP could have made; a national training policy would be useful in establishing the players and their respective roles.
- The YTEPP's structure as an LLC was vital to its success, allowing it to take decisive action, remain flexible and creative, and avoid the bureaucratic red tape of normal ministerial operations. Furthermore, the constant strengthening of the YTEPP management, as well as its flexible, adaptive, and creative nature, created conditions that make the sustainability of the project quite likely.
- The Career Enhancement program, with its emphasis on increasing literacy and numeracy skills, as well as lifeskills development and behavioral change, is probably the most vital aspect of the YTEPP's success. Evidence, both from employers and clients, repeatedly points to this importance. This program should be further strengthened in future projects, and the NTA should take this lesson into account when developing and implementing its training policy.
- The lack of consistent financial and technical assistance for graduates of the Microenterprise Development Program hindered the success of those graduates, as did a lack of institutional support from outside of YTEPP. Despite those hurdles, though, the program has continued to grow. Future operations, particularly in areas where self-employment is not a popular option, should allow substantial time for microenterprise development to take off.

IMPLEMENTATION COMPLETION REPORT

TRINIDAD AND TOBAGO

YOUTH TRAINING AND EMPLOYMENT PARTNERSHIP PROJECT **(LOAN 3328-TR)**

PART I. PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION ASSESSMENT

I. Project Objectives and Description

1. Project Objectives: The project was to assist the Government to improve the design, delivery and effectiveness of YTEPP, which offers education and training and other support services to youth to enhance their employability and self-employment prospects. This was achieved by pursuing four key objectives: (i) to improve the quality and relevance of education and training for employment through the development of curriculum, training of instructors and provision of equipment for training facilities and various training programs; (ii) to increase the opportunities offered to youth to acquire work experience in private enterprises or public agencies to facilitate their first entry into the labor market; (iii) to promote self-employment initiatives of youth through self-employment and small business training and the linking of a network of credit institutions capable of providing loans for small businesses; and (iv) to strengthen the management of the YTEPP Program to enhance the effectiveness of its training activities and capacity to program, monitor and evaluate training and post-training support operations and their impact on youth employment.

2. Project Components: The objectives of the project were to be attained through three components. The first component, "Education and Training" (US\$19.0 million) would assist YTEPP in improving the design of its education and training courses, upgrading the quality of its teaching staff, and providing supplementary instructional equipment and materials. The second component, "Post-training Assistance" (US\$3.3 million) would support, with parallel co-financing by the private sector, work experience placements for trainees in order to facilitate their first entry into the labor market, and promote youth self-employment initiatives. The third component, "Program Management Strengthening" (US\$9.6 million) would strengthen management of YTEPP's training programs, establish project monitoring and evaluation systems and support a labor market information system (LMIS) to assist with planning of training.

3. Linkage with Sector Strategies: IBRD's overall strategy for Trinidad and Tobago supports the Government's program of broad-based economic diversification as the basis for sustainable reductions in poverty and unemployment. The YTEPP fits nicely within the government's development agenda, which includes the challenge of strengthening the

human resource base and reducing unemployment and poverty. The IBRD strategy for assistance in the social sectors strongly emphasizes human resource development, as poverty reduction is closely related to job creation through broad-based growth and increased labor productivity. As part of this strategy, IBRD is currently financing loans for the Basic Education Project (US\$50 million), the Water Sector Institutional Strengthening Project (US\$25 million), and the Business Expansion Project (US\$27 million). YTEPP is the cornerstone institution for the GORTT's vocational-technical (voc-tech) training efforts. These efforts are being centralized under the National Training Agency (NTA), only recently launched by the newly-created Ministry of Information, Communication, Training, and Distance Learning. The Government's plan is to capitalize on YTEPP's experience to inform other levels of training, while YTEPP continues as the primary provider of Level I-II skills training.

4. Background: YTEPP was created by the Government in 1988 as an emergency, temporary program to prepare youth for employment. This program was part of a wider Government response to the economic crisis of the 1980s, which saw a decline in output, reductions in real per capita income and in Government expenditures in the social sectors, and a sharp increase in unemployment. Despite growth in the informal sector, which absorbed a large number of workers, youth employment remained one of the country's most serious social problems, with large numbers unemployed. The unemployed and idle youth were less employable than retrenched workers because of their lack of skills, experience, and poor attitudes towards work. These attitudes, as well as the high rates of youth idleness and withdrawal from the labor market, are partially explained by the poor job prospects open to youth. However, it was also widely held in Trinidad and Tobago that many youth were reluctant to do menial work for low wages. Many youth are able to hold out for better jobs because of the support given by family networks. Despite difficulties for youth in finding wage employment, many had jobs in the service, trade, agriculture and manufacturing sectors; youth also made up about 25 percent of self-employed workers in the late 1980s.

II. Achievement of Project Objectives

5. During its implementation, and as a result of the mid-term restructuring of the project, YTEPP fully met its quantitative targets. Over the course of the project, YTEPP established 29 part-time centers, plus 5 full-time centers and various community-based programs on both Trinidad and Tobago. On average, 5,000 students per cycle were accepted, with between 3,000-4,000 graduating. A total of 49,064 clients graduated over the life of the project, 41,066 from center-based programs, 5,203 from community-based, and 2,726 in microentrepreneurship (of which 69 were trained in community-based centers). 2,076 clients received work experience placements, or about 5 percent of all graduates. Of the total number of vocational skills graduates, 35,446 also graduated from the Career Enhancement training subcomponent; 6,566 received special tutoring in literacy and numeracy over the life of the project. In addition, the management capacity of YTEPP increased steadily over the course of the project, and its programming, monitoring and evaluation activities were consistently of high quality.

6. The other two development objectives were partially met—the shortfall is primarily due to the fact that these objectives were out of the control of the project. It is the YTEPP's creative initiatives in the face of these problems, though, that convert these potential problems into successes. Originally, it was intended that YTEPP graduates would be placed through the National Training Board (NTB) for work experience or internships. However, in the face of negative economic growth, the NTB was unable to place the projected number of clients. In response, YTEPP created its own Employment Bureau, seeking out linkages with public and private agencies to place an increasing number of graduates. In the case of the promotion of self-employment initiatives, the project called for the Small Business Development Company (SBDC) to provide financial and technical support to graduates through the Youth Enterprise and Support Systems (YESS). The rapid elimination of the YESS, however, required YTEPP to step into the breach and seek other ways to support graduating micro-entrepreneurs. While the activities designed to achieve these two development objectives were not carried out, the YTEPP managed to preserve the intent of the activities, providing very viable alternatives to those originally planned. These creative responses lead to a satisfactory achievement of the development objectives.

7. As indicated by Table 1 in the Statistical Annexes, the overall outcome of the project was rated satisfactory in every major area. The project maintained satisfactory or highly satisfactory ratings since its approval. The project was well targeted to the neediest clients (80 percent of participants have been drawn from uneducated/unskilled groups), and has been largely demand-driven and locally executed. The technical operation of the project management and the training centers was good and largely free from political interference (see below for discussion of local political pressures). YTEPP was well managed, with highly qualified and dedicated staff, and a very active Board of Directors under the Limited Liability Company structure that has kept the YTEPP Company outside of the normal political channels. The Chairman of the Board and the Chief Executive Officer (CEO), along with the Board and staff, have been freed of much of the bureaucratic red tape that might limit occur if the project was located under a government ministry. Despite early, stringent targets for project performance, the design of the project appears to have been appropriate to achieve the stated objectives. This statement is further supported by the results of the four tracer studies carried out by the project, which provide evidence to the project's success. Nonetheless, the project started slowly and required two extra years to reach its objectives.

8. The Mid-term Review (November 1994) concluded that original targets were too ambitious or too stringent (SAR figures, for example, did not factor attrition into its projections). While the YTEPP had not met the original targets, the mission nonetheless viewed the project as a success: demand exceeded projections; participation in YTEPP increased income of the lowest decile of income earners; over 40 percent of YTEPP graduates surveyed chose to continue their studies; and graduates improved their morale, motivation, and literacy and numeracy skills. Furthermore, project management had steadily improved, gaining greater organizational efficiency and an impressive ability to collect and analyze data. Building upon these very positive aspects of the project, the

mission sparked a restructuring of the project with its recommendations that the YTEPP address, among other things, high attrition rates, the low percentage of job placements for graduates, linkages with the public and private sectors, a strategy for sustainability, and the need to offer more market-oriented courses.

9. Four tracer studies were carried out over the course of the project, beginning in 1991, the results of which further indicate the successes of YTEPP's efforts. These studies were designed to provide the YTEPP, its Board of Directors, the GORTT and international financiers with information on the labor market absorption of YTEPP graduates as compared to a control group. (For detailed information on the methodology and results, please refer to the Appendices to this report.) The studies' findings include the following: (i) unemployment rates of YTEPP graduates are consistently lower than the rate in the same cohort of the general population; (ii) 58 percent of YTEPP graduates aged 15-19 participate in the labor market, as opposed to 32.4 percent of the same group in the general population; (iii) the absorption rate of female YTEPP graduates increased 46.7 percent between 1993-96, a 32.8 percentage point gain over the 13.9 percent rate of the control group; (iv) likewise, over the same period, the absorption rate of male YTEPP graduates increased 51.8 percent, a 20.3 percent gain over the control group's increase (31.5 percent); (v) post-YTEPP earnings are directly linked to participation in the program (with the most significant impact on the least educated and least skilled group); (vi) a higher proportion of YTEPP graduates opt for self-employment as compared to the control group; (vii) YTEPP's gains are especially notable given that the average YTEPP applicant has a marginally lower academic background as compared to the control group; and (viii) YTEPP has been successful in attracting two of the most vulnerable groups in society and enhancing their employability: women and incarcerated men.

III. Implementation Record and Major Factors Affecting the Project

Factors generally subject to government control.

10. Despite general government support to the YTEPP and its activities, the project has lacked an institutional framework, virtually since its inception. In its earliest incarnation, the YTEPP was responsible to four different ministries, which provided budget and other support. This unworkable arrangement eventually was superseded by other arrangements, and the YTEPP has spent the last several years under the Ministry of Education, for policy purposes. Only weeks prior to the end of Bank financing, the YTEPP was moved over to the Ministry of Information, Communication, Training, and Distance Learning. While the GORTT has made advances in developing a plan for its National Training Agency, of which YTEPP will be a key part, the lack of this type of infrastructure probably limited the advances that YTEPP could have made.

11. The majority of YTEPP's activity took place in part-time centers, primarily schools rented from the Ministry of Education (MOE) for TT\$500,000 per year. While the MOE facilitated the YTEPP's access to these facilities, this situation created frequent

problems, as school principals required the YTEPP to hire their staff, often in positions for which they were not qualified. While teacher-trainers may have enjoyed greater access to the facilities than an outsider may have had, given the trust that the principal put in them, the quality of instruction sometime suffered—particularly in skills training. These human resource issues became even more complicated in small communities, where it was possible to fire employees, but virtually impossible to replace them and have the replacement be able to do their job. This situation, along with the YTEPP's and the GORTT's inability to find solutions, is pushing the YTEPP to concentrate more on full-time centers (which are normally loaned to YTEPP by various private and public agencies), where they are able to have greater control over the facility and the activities within.

Factors generally subject to implementing agency control.

12. Institutional. YTEPP staff has been highly qualified, very committed to the institution and its goals, and has experienced relatively low turnover in key positions, providing critical continuity. The framework within which the YTEPP staff works, however, is particularly important. The project was set up as a limited liability company (LLC), a corporate body in its own right. In this structure, the Board of Directors, under the direction of the Chairman of the Board, provide the policy direction of the agency, which is seen as a parastatal organization. The Board also advertises, interviews, and recommends the CEO, who is the head of the management structure of YTEPP. The Board itself is appointed for a two-year term by the shareholders, and generally changes with the government; they meet monthly. Under this arrangement, YTEPP has been able to avoid the red tape normally associated with location within a ministerial department, for example. As such, YTEPP has been able to act decisively in setting its course, and making alterations when necessary. It has also been able to set its own salary scale and do its own hiring, firing, promotions—all with relatively little government intervention.

13. Skills Training. Initially, the LMIS was intended to allow the project to program its skills training to meet market demand. However, with the demise of the LMIS, YTEPP developed its own study through the Research Unit. While not foolproof, the system assisted the project in selecting courses that would nearly meet the demands of clients and the marketplace. Additionally, partially in response to the variable qualification of trainers, YTEPP developed training programs for voc-tech instructors to ensure a more uniform quality of instruction. The level of quality achieved by YTEPP was such that a number of private firms have approached YTEPP to carry out skills and career enhancement (see below) training for new and current employees. YTEPP sees both the private sector and governmental agencies as potential new clients for their activities. Furthermore, the shift from nine-month cycles to six-month cycles (both part-time with 240 contact hours) utilizing modules for training aided in the reduction of attrition from the program. Clients preferred a shorter, more intensive program of study to the longer one.

14. Career Enhancement: Training in both skills and career enhancement is provided to clients in tandem. While the skills training introduces clients to the basics necessary to

begin in their particular field, counselors in career enhancement focus on practical skills and the development of self-esteem in each client. Applicants to YTEPP are given entrance examinations to determine their educational level. Those scoring at a literacy level of 10 years or below, or those scoring less than 40 percent on the numeracy exam, are placed in the Special Version Program, which provides more intensive and individual instruction—which program also has seen large increases in the mean literacy scores of participants. Other clients are placed in the Core Program. Both focus on literacy and numeracy skills, as well as lifeskills development and behavioral change. Counselors must deal with a wide variety of social problems, including drug abuse, domestic violence, and a lack of motivation and self-esteem. Responses from employers and clients alike indicate that career enhancement training is successful, and even more important than skills training. Anecdotal evidence from those hiring YTEPP graduates reflects that employers would rather hire someone punctual and with a positive attitude, even if they had fewer skills than another employee. Skills may be taught by the employer, they indicate, but attitude cannot.

15. Microenterprise Development. There is a bias in Trinidad & Tobago towards wage employment, leaving self-employment as a last resort. YTEPP, therefore, faced an uphill battle in the development of its program to encourage microentrepreneurship. The Entrepreneur Development Service offered training in the development of business plans and in how to approach financial agencies. However, the structure intended to support and coordinate youth microenterprises, YESS, only lasted about ten months. In 1994, YTEPP named a Business Development Officer, a Support Services Officer, and a Field Project Officer to facilitate activities. Despite YTEPP's best efforts, challenges remain, particularly financing. Traditional means of financing via commercial banks are not very viable; the SBDC provides support of up to 85 percent of the cost, but it requires 15 percent up front—an impossibility for most YTEPP clients. FundAid, however, has proved to be a useful source of financing, providing group guarantees, allowing YTEPP clients to apply in groups of two. Despite weaknesses in financing, there continues to be demand for YTEPP training in microenterprise development; training is provided in two programs per year, with 144 contact hours. YTEPP has also opened this program to non-YTEPP clients, which has proven to be a successful experiment.

16. Private Sector Linkages. YTEPP has been both resourceful and creative in its efforts to develop relationships with the private sector in Trinidad & Tobago. Several companies have requested that YTEPP provide training for their staff, including the yacht-service industry in the northwest peninsula. Furthermore, several companies who have previously hired YTEPP graduates have provided the facilities for full-time training centers, frequently also providing technical support and equipment. It is in these ways that YTEPP is seeking to broaden and make more sustainable its operations.

IV. Project Sustainability

17. With the combination of government and private sector interest in the future of the project, prospects for the sustainability of the YTEPP are substantial. YTEPP has

developed very good managerial capacity, and has proven its ability to diversify training to cater to market needs without a major increase to recurrent expenditures. It is able to service a range of different groups in a variety of sectors. In fact, it has delivered customized training programs to state agencies (including the National Energy Skill Centre, for which it upgraded and operates the center), non-governmental organizations (NGOs), and other groups. The GORTT has apparently recognized YTEPP's success, and the continuing demand for its services, with the inclusion of YTEPP in the newly-created NTA under the newly-created Ministry of Information, Communication, Training and Distance Learning. Despite the importance given to training by the government, the future success of YTEPP as part of the NTA will depend on the extent to which the government retains the most successful aspects of the project. Key among these is the institutional structure of the YTEPP as an LLC, providing a great deal of necessary independence and flexibility to adjust to a changing market, new technologies, and new management practices. Given the project's survival as an LLC, however, it seems likely that the government would allow it to continue, and better still, use it as a model for other levels of training within the NTA.

V. Bank Performance

18. Bank performance was satisfactory at every stage of the project cycle, despite a certain optimism in the project design, in terms of targets set. It should be noted, however, that strong performance and collaboration by YTEPP facilitated Bank involvement. The relevant technical assistance was provided as needed, and a very cordial relationship has been maintained with project staff and with the GORTT. Particular mention is due to the mid-term mission, which provided a thorough, balanced, and constructive analysis of the project's past performance and options for the future. It was on the basis of this work done by the Bank and the project that YTEPP was positioned for the continued growth of its success.

19. The total time allocation on pre-board activities was 148.5 staff weeks (SW) during the FY 90-91 period, above the Bank-wide average of 87 for project preparation. The average time allocated to supervision from both headquarters and the field was 24 SW per year, including pre-board and completion activities (as compared to the LAC average of 19.5 in social projects). The cost of supervision was below the Bank-wide average—the average supervision cost for YTEPP was US\$25,546 per year, as compared to the Bank-wide average cost of social sector supervision of roughly US\$65,000 per year. On average, one supervision mission per year was carried out, in which the task manager was accompanied by various staff and consultants, including a financial specialist, technical and vocational education specialists, and impact evaluation specialists. Supervision missions examined an array of administrative and technical issues, though special attention was granted to the tracer studies, quality of instruction, sustainability, and coordination of the project with line ministries.

VI. Borrower Performance

20. Borrower performance was satisfactory for both identification/preparation and implementation. YTEPP staff has been consistently highly qualified and dedicated, and its managerial capacity has steadily increased over the course of the project. Despite the lack of a formal framework in which the project could operate, the GORTT proved a reliable supporter of YTEPP and its activities. Most remarkable is that, in spite of political pressures, YTEPP was allowed to remain a corporate body outside the normal governmental and ministerial channels. Audits, monitoring indicators, and evaluation reporting were generally complete and punctual. Visiting missions were given full support and extensive field visits were encouraged and well facilitated.

21. YTEPP personnel have been particularly flexible and creative, not only in response to client and market demands, but also in response to Bank recommendations. The Research Unit was a very reliable source of information on project performance, labor statistics, and even national economic information. Financial management of the project strengthened, and was able to overcome delays in reimbursements from the Special Account that had been plaguing the project for some time.

22. One primary reason for the two-year extension of the project, in addition to allowing further time for revised implementation of training activities, was to allow the development of a plan for the sustainability of tech-voc training activities. The Bank and the GORTT agreed that some of the remaining balance of the loan could be used to finance activities designed to further sustainability, and to create the NTA. This financing, however, was dependent on the GORTT, via the MOE, developing a detailed plan of action satisfactory to the Bank. Unfortunately, this plan was not developed on a schedule that allowed the Bank to provide financing, which was thus sacrificed. It appears, previous delays notwithstanding, that the GORTT is dedicated to developing the NTA and preserving the experiences of YTEPP in this new context. A Board of Directors for the NTA has now been named, including YTEPP's Chairman of the Board; the NTA Board Chairman has also been named, and the CEO position has been advertised.

VII. Assessment of Outcome

23. The outcome of this project is judged to be satisfactory. The project achieved its major development objectives with few shortcomings, albeit not always in the manner first projected and with some significant delays. Shortfalls were generally outside the control of the project, and YTEPP itself proved able to correct these in a creative manner. The project was crucial in supporting the GORTT's poverty alleviation efforts by enhancing the employability and earning potential of a segment of the market not previously considered employable. It has also increased the acceptability of self-employment as an alternative to wage employment, thus further increasing employment

opportunities. A high proportion of resources reached poor communities and individuals, due to the very nature of the training program and the location of centers. Finally, the project successfully supported the creation of stronger managerial capacity, not only for central and local project staff, but also for center managers and instructors.

VIII. Current and Future Operations

24. Trinidad and Tobago's Basic Education Project (Ln. 3956-TR) was approved in 1995, and there was a previous education sector loan for US\$20 million in 1979. Despite its clear linkages to education, and despite the fact that the responsible ministry for the project was the MOE for much of YTEPP's life, the project was never really considered an education project. Part of the reason for this may have been its nature as a Limited Liability Company, and its operational independence from the MOE. Still, according to the GORTT at the time, the MOE had responsibility for policy making for the training field. The MOE's success at this important task was limited at best, thereby placing some limitations to YTEPP's development, and losing an interesting opportunity to establish linkages between training and education—particularly secondary education. Neither did the Bank strenuously seek out these linkages with the preparation of the Basic Education Project, however. With the creation of the Ministry for Information, Communication, Training, and Distance Learning, the GORTT has again separated training from education, but the founding of the NTA provides exciting opportunities for the consolidation of the country's training efforts.

IX. Key Lessons Learned and Recommendations for Future Operations

25. Some of the key lessons learned from YTEPP's experience and recommendations for future operations may be summarized as follows:

- The expansion of linkages with private industry, government departments, and public companies is key for project sustainability, both in terms of hiring YTEPP graduates, and in contracting YTEPP services. Coordination is also important with related line ministries (e.g., the MOE, which provided access to facilities, equipment, human resources and technical expertise).
- It is important to delineate areas of responsibility for the vocational-technical training field, particularly with the creation of the NTA and the increasing training activities of private groups. Absence of institutional framework probably limited the advances that YTEPP could have made; a national training policy would be useful in establishing the players and their respective roles.
- The YTEPP's structure as an LLC was vital to its success, allowing it to take decisive action, remain flexible and creative, and avoid the bureaucratic red tape of normal ministerial operations. Furthermore, the constant strengthening of the YTEPP management, as well as its flexible, adaptive, and creative nature, created conditions

that make the sustainability of the project quite likely.

- Accurate and timely labor market information would have facilitated the selection of courses that better responded to demand from clients as well as industry.
- Alternatives to hiring unqualified secondary school teachers should be explored with the MOE to allow the continuation of some part-time YTEPP centers.
- The shift from nine-month to six-month cycles (both part-time with 240 contact hours) aided in the reduction of attrition from the program. In addition, the adoption of modules made training more flexible, and facilitated the movement from one level to another.
- The Career Enhancement program, with its emphasis on increasing literacy and numeracy skills, as well as lifeskills development and behavioral change, is probably the most vital aspect of the YTEPP's success. Evidence, both from employers and clients, repeatedly points to this importance. This program should be further strengthened in future projects, and the NTA should take this lesson into account when developing and implementing its training policy.
- The lack of consistent financial and technical assistance for graduates of the Microenterprise Development Program hindered the success of those graduates, as did a lack of institutional support from outside of YTEPP. Despite those hurdles, though, the program has continued to grow. Future operations, particularly in areas where self-employment is not a popular option, should allow substantial time for microenterprise development to take off.

PART II. STATISTICAL ANNEXES

Table 1: Summary of Assessments

A.	<u>Achievement of objectives</u>	<u>Substantial</u>	<u>Partial</u>	<u>Negligible</u>	<u>Not Applicable</u>
		(✓)	(✓)	(✓)	(✓)
	Macro policies	☐	☐	☐	☒
	Sector policies	☐	☒	☐	☐
	Financial objectives	☐	☐	☐	☒
	Institutional development	☒	☐	☐	☐
	Physical objectives	☐	☐	☐	☒
	Poverty reduction	☒	☐	☐	☐
	Gender issues	☒	☐	☐	☐
	Other social objectives	☒	☐	☐	☐
	Environmental objectives	☐	☐	☐	☒
	Public sector management	☒	☐	☐	☐
	Private sector development	☐	☒	☐	☐
B.	<u>Project sustainability</u>	<u>Likely</u>	<u>Unlikely</u>	<u>Uncertain</u>	
		(✓)	(✓)	(✓)	
	Sustainability	☒	☐	☐	
C.	<u>Bank performance</u>	<u>Highly satisfactory</u>	<u>Satisfactory</u>	<u>Deficient</u>	
		(✓)	(✓)	(✓)	
	Identification	☐	☒	☐	
	Preparation assistance	☐	☒	☐	
	Appraisal	☐	☒	☐	
	Supervision	☐	☒	☐	
D.	<u>Borrower performance</u>	<u>Highly satisfactory</u>	<u>Satisfactory</u>	<u>Deficient</u>	
		(✓)	(✓)	(✓)	
	Identification	☐	☒	☐	
	Preparation assistance	☐	☒	☐	
	Appraisal	☐	☒	☐	
	Supervision	☐	☒	☐	
E.	<u>Assessment of outcome</u>	<u>Highly satisfactory</u>	<u>Satisfactory</u>	<u>Deficient</u>	<u>Highly unsatisfactory</u>
		(✓)	(✓)	(✓)	(✓)
		☐	☒	☐	☐

Table 2: Related Bank Loans/Credits

<i>Credit Title</i>	<i>Purpose</i>	<i>Year of Approval</i>	<i>Status</i>
Preceding Operations in lending program:			
Loan 1722-TR	Education III	1979	Closed
Loan 3152-TR	SAL	1990	Closed
Loan 3153-TR	Technical Assistance Loan	1990	Closed
Following operations in lending program:			
Loan 3432-TR	Business Expansion	1991	In operation
Loan 3784-TR	Water Sector Institutional Strengthening	1994	In operation
Loan 3956-TR	Basic Education Project	1995	In operation

Table 3: IBRD Project Timetable

	<i>Date Planned</i>	<i>Date Actual</i>
Identification (Executive Project Summary)	11/14/89	02/12/90
Preparation		5/01/90
Appraisal		10/22/90
Negotiations		03/15/91
Board Presentation		5/21/91
Signing		8/29/91
Effectiveness		10/18/91
Midterm Assessment		9-10/94
Loan Closing	6/30/96	6/30/98
Final Disbursement		8/19/98

Table 4: Loan Disbursements: Cumulative Estimated and Actual
(US\$ million)

	<i>FY 91</i>	<i>FY 92</i>	<i>FY 93</i>	<i>FY 94</i>	<i>FY 95</i>	<i>FY 96</i>	<i>FY 97</i>	<i>FY 98</i>
Appraisal estimate	2.1	5.4	9.6	13.8	18.0	20.7	n/a	n/a
Actual	0	4.8	9.1	9.8	11.7	15.5	17.3	19.2
Actual as percent of estimate	0	88.9%	94.8%	71.0%	65.0%	74.8%	n/a	n/a
Date of final disbursement: August 19, 1998								

Tables 5-6: Key Indicators for Project Implementation and Operation
(Cycles IV-XII)

<i>GENERAL INDICATORS</i>	<i>Cycle IV</i>		<i>Cycle V</i>		<i>Cycle VI</i>		<i>Cycle VII*</i>	
<i>Total Number of Applicants</i>	<i>Projected</i>	<i>Actual</i>	<i>Projected</i>	<i>Actual</i>	<i>Projected</i>	<i>Actual</i>	<i>Projected</i>	<i>Actual</i>
Center-based (VST)	13000	11198	12000	12883	12000	9970	12000	10125
Community Based	1000	1701	1000	1279	1000	538	1000	-
Microentrepreneurship	2000	1047	1000	1098	2500	1747	2500	-
<i>Total Number of Trainees</i>								
Center-based (VST)	10000	8700	10000	9850	10000	8240	10000	8837
Community Based	1000	1701	1000	1279	1000	538	1000	-
Micro-entrepreneurship	1500	1252	2500	1098	2500	1747	2500	410
<i>Total Number of Graduates</i>								
Center-based (VST)	8500	5314	8500	5133	7500	5597	7500	5683
Community Based	750	897	750	336	800	290	1000	-
Micro-entrepreneurship	700	0	2000	0	2000	862	2000	151

*Data for Cycle VII are limited and unreliable, due to data lost in a change of government and management.

GENERAL INDICATORS	Cycle VIII		Cycle IX		Cycle X	
Total Number of Applicants	Projected	Actual	Projected	Actual	Projected	Actual
Center-based (VST)	6000	6062	6000	5716	6000	6749
Community Based	1120	592	1120	2029*	1120	*
Micro (Community Based)	110	n/a	110	35*	110	*
Micro-entrepreneurship (Center-based)	500	289	500	416*	500	*
Total Number of Trainees						
Center-based (VST)	5000	4674	5000	5103	5000	5229
Community Based	975	523	975	1272*	975	*
Micro (Community Based)	90	n/a	90	35	90	34
Micro-entrepreneurship (Center-based)	400	289	800	891	400	674
Total Number of Graduates						
Center-based (VST)	3500	3765	3650	3829	3750	4429
Community Based	634	132	653	238	672	957
Micro (Community Based)	59	n/a	60	35	62	34
Micro-entrepreneurship (Center-based)	300	193	616	341	316	506

*Figures represent Cycles IX and X combined

GENERAL INDICATORS	Cycle XI		Cycle XII	
	<i>Projected</i>	<i>Actual</i>	<i>Projected</i>	<i>Actual</i>
<i>Total Number of Applicants</i>				
Center-based (VST)	6000	6513	6000	5728
Community Based	1120	1539	1120	*
Micro (Community Based)	110	48	110	*
Micro-entrepreneurship (Center-based)	500	234	500	659
<i>Total Number of Trainees</i>				
Center-based (VST)	5000	5614	5000	4839
Community Based	975	1539*	975	*
Micro (Community Based)	90	-	90	740
Micro-entrepreneurship (Center-based)	800	759	400	715
<i>Total Number of Graduates</i>				
Center-based (VST)	3750	3881	4000	3435
Community Based	692	2203	712	150
Micro (Community Based)	64	0	66	0
Micro-entrepreneurship (Center-based)	648	504	332	100

*These figures represent Cycles XI and XII combined

CAREER ENHANCEMENT TRAINING AND JOB SKILLS SUBCOMPONENTS

C.E. TRAINING/JOB SKILLS	Cycle IV		Cycle V		Cycle VI		Cycle VII	
	Projected	Actual	Projected	Actual	Projected	Actual	Projected	Actual
<i>Career Enhancement Training</i>								
# of Counselors hired/trained	200	169	200	146	200	72	200	-
# of Applicants given diagnostic test	8000	8451	9000	6499	10000	7819	10000	-
# of trainees completing:								
Career Enhancement Core program	9000	5283	9000	4226	6750	3523	6800	4705
Special tutoring in literacy/numeracy	1000	175	1000	550	750	770	700	-
# of tutors hired and trained (Cycle IV-VI)	450	368	450	400	450	450	500	382
# of Graduates Career Enhancement	8500	5458	8500	4776	7500	4293	7500	4705
<i>Job Skills Training</i>								
# of tutors hired and trained (Cycles IV-VII)	570	446	580	475	580	-	n/a	-
# of new curriculum guides and job sheets produced	570	0	35	0	500	434	0	521
# of centers provided equipment (percent installation)	n/a	0	42	42	42	42	43	42
# of trainees certified	7500	4945	7500	5155	7500	1813	7500	2449
# of Graduates Vocational Skills Training	8500	5314	8500	5133	9000	5597	9000	5683

C.E. TRAINING/JOB SKILLS	Cycle VIII*		Cycle IX		Cycle X	
	<i>Projected</i>	<i>Actual</i>	<i>Projected</i>	<i>Actual</i>	<i>Projected</i>	<i>Actual</i>
<i>Career Enhancement Training</i>						
# of Counselors hired/trained						
# of Applicants given diagnostic test	5500	6062	5500	4408	5500	4565
# of trainees completing:						
Career Enhancement Core program	3080	4495	3212	3150	3300	4565
Special tutoring in literacy/numeracy	420	1349	438	945	450	1370
# of tutors hired and trained	280	232				
# of tutors hired			280	222	280	230
# of tutors trained			280	149	280	26
# of Graduates Career Enhancement	3500	3349	3650	3150	3750	3861
<i>Job Skills Training</i>						
# of tutors hired (Cycles VIII-X)	333	318				
# of tutors hired			333	331	333	296
# of tutors trained			333	289	333	58
# of trainees certified	-	1671	-	2272	-	2547
# of Graduates Vocational Skills Training	3500	3765	3650	3829	3750	4429

*Indicators were somewhat altered as of this cycle, as a result of the YTEPP's "Proposal for Unused Funds," June 1995.

C.E. TRAINING/JOB SKILLS	Cycle XI		Cycle XII	
	<i>Projected</i>	<i>Actual</i>	<i>Projected</i>	<i>Actual</i>
<i>Career Enhancement Training</i>				
# of Applicants given diagnostic test	5500	4517	5500	3278
# of trainees completing:				
Career Enhancement Core program	3300	2353	3520	1994
Special tutoring in literacy/numeracy	450	767	480	640
# of tutors hired and trained (Cycle IV-VI)	280	230	280	292
# of Graduates Career Enhancement	3750	3120	4000	2734
<i>Job Skills Training</i>				
# of tutors hired	333	341	333	292
# of trainees certified	-	2388	-	2083
# of Graduates Vocational Skills Training	3750	3881	4000	3435

COMPONENTS

COMPONENTS	Cycle IV		Cycle V		Cycle VI		Cycle VII	
<i>Community Based Training</i>	<i>Projected</i>	<i>Actual</i>	<i>Projected</i>	<i>Actual</i>	<i>Projected</i>	<i>Actual</i>	<i>Projected</i>	<i>Actual</i>
# of trainees	825	1701	1000	1279	1500	538	1000	n/a
# of projects	55	104	150	90	100	41	150	n/a
# of tutors	55	179	150	91	300	54	150	n/a
# of graduates	500	897	750	336	1125	290	800	n/a
<i>Post-Training Support: Work Experience Subcomponent</i>								
# of work experience placements	1500	307	1500	355	1500	138	1500	-
<i>Post-Training Support for Self-Employment Subcomponent</i>								
# of trainees	2000	1252	2500	1098	2500	1747	2500	151
# of tutors hired and trained	60	72	158	74	158	87	158	31
# of trainees completing course with self-employed pr???	700	955	700	994	2000	862	2000	-
# of financial institutions providing credit for youth entrepreneurs	5	2	5	0	5	0	5	0
<i>Management Strengthening</i>								
LMIS reports produced	2*	2	4	1	4	0	4	0
Tracer studies completed	2	2	1	0	1	1	0	0
Special evaluation studies completed	2	4	2	8	-	9	-	6

*The Social Sectors Unit, the responsible body, was dismantled in 1992

COMPONENTS	Cycle VIII		Cycle IX		Cycle X	
<i>Community Based Training</i>	<i>Projected</i>	<i>Actual</i>	<i>Projected</i>	<i>Actual</i>	<i>Projected</i>	<i>Actual</i>
# of trainees	975	523	975	1272	975	957
# of projects	65	35	65	41	65	37
# of tutors	195	95	195	47	195	37
# of graduates	634	656	653	1148*	672	*
<i>Post-Training Support: Work Experience Subcomponent</i>						
# of work experience placements	250	247	250	187	250	154
# of work experience placements via YTEPP Support Services	60	78	75	126	75	135
<i>Post-Training Support for Self-Employment Subcomponent</i>						
# of trainees	500	193	-			
# of tutors hired and trained	40	31	40	35	40	35
# of trainees completing course with self-employed proposals	300	-	616	715	316	482
# of trainees successfully using business incubators	-	-	50	7	60	4
<i>Management Strengthening</i>						
Full-time Managers	4	2	2	4	0	0
Project Officers	1	0	1	2	1	0
Field Supervisors	1	1	1	0	0	0
Manager, Information Technology						
<i>Monitoring and Evaluation</i>						
Tracer studies	1	1	-	-	1	1
Special evaluation studies completed	2	2	1	2	2	0
LMIS Reports	1	0	2	0	0	0

*Figure represents Cycles IX and X combined

COMPONENTS	Cycle XI		Cycle XII	
<i>Community Based Training</i>	<i>Projected</i>	<i>Actual</i>	<i>Projected</i>	<i>Actual</i>
# of trainees	975	1539*	975	*
# of projects	65	100*	65	*
# of tutors	195	200*	195	*
# of graduates	692	2203*	712	*
<i>Post-Training Support: Work Experience Subcomponent</i>				
# of work experience placements	250	-	250	-
# of work experience placements via YTEPP Support Services	75	184	85	165
<i>Post-Training Support for Self-Employment Subcomponent</i>				
# of tutors hired and trained	40	34	40	-
# of trainees completing course with self-employed proposals	648	281	332	154
# of trainees successfully using business incubators	75	1	75	1
<i>Management Strengthening</i>				
Manager, Information Technology	n/a	n/a	1	1
LMIS reports produced	0	0	0	0
Tracer studies completed	0	0	0	0
Special evaluation studies completed	-	-	-	-

*These figures represent Cycles XI and XII combined

QUALITATIVE IMPROVEMENTS

Curriculum Unit	Cycle VIII		Cycle IX		Cycle X	
	Projected	Actual	Projected	Actual	Projected	Actual
Tutor Manual:						
<i>VST</i>	84	84	4	78	-	90
<i>CE</i>	2	2	1	0	-	2
<i>MEP</i>	-	-	1	0	-	1
Safety Manuals - General	7	-	7	1	-	1
Operation Work Sheets (VST)	-	-	1680	0	-	0
Diagnostic Tests:						
<i>VST</i>	14	14	14	13	-	0
<i>CE</i>	2	2	-	0	-	0
Occupational Information - VST	42	13	42	77	-	0
Audio Visuals	10	2	10	0	10	0
Trainee Personal Record:						
<i>VST</i>	84	84	77	0	77	0
<i>CE</i>	-	-	2	0	2	0
<i>MEP</i>	-	-	1	0	1	0
Resources Guides (per course)	42	33	42	77	77	77
Performance Tests (per modular unit)	-	1	13	0	12	12
Training Centers						
Full-time Training Centers	4	2	-	4	5	5

**Table 7: Studies Completed
January 1994 - June 1997**

STUDY	INITIAL STATED PURPOSE	STATUS	OUTCOME
The Effectiveness of Promotional Strategies (June 1994)	To evaluate the effectiveness of the various promotional strategies used for the registration of Cycle V.	Study and document on most successful promotional strategies	Revised Promotional Strategy
Field Audit of the Implementation of the Continuous Assessment Instruments & Attendance Registers (June 1994)	Determination of the success of the tutors in the implementation of the continuous Assessment procedures with the correct instruments.	Utilized by Vocational Skills (VST) and Career Enhancement Departments	Instrumental in promoting accountability as it pertains to the utilization of proper Assessment Instruments.
Needs Assessment Report (Cycle VII - August 1994)	To provide a Description of the Macro-Economic Context in which the organization and the upcoming Training Cycle are located and identify the specific industries, occupation and products for training emphasis both at National and Local levels.	A supplement to the in-house Labor Market Study for Cycle VI (1993-1994)	The decision making process of the YTEPP program as it pertains to course selection proceeded to stem from responses to market signals.
Proposal for the YTEPP to continue and utilize "unused funds" for the period 1996-1998 (July 1995)	To assess the implementation of the program and chronicle the structural changes recommended by the World Bank. Furthermore, YTEPP's response to these recommendations was outlined. A case was made for accessing the unspent balance of the Bank loan.	A position paper on the status of the Educational System in Trinidad and Tobago	Extension granted.
Labor Market Information System (LMIS) (October 1994)	To determine trends in the Labor Market, employment and earnings prospects for all levels of graduates entering the job market.	The Tripartite Labor Market System was discontinued. YTEPP began conducting its own Labor Market Studies.	YTEPP's labor market studies provided key labor market information on the macro economy, advertised jobs for YTEPP trainees and graduates.
Attrition: Cycle IV (1991)	To define YTEPP's definition of "attrition" and to determine attrition levels for Cycle IV.	Facilitated the establishment of "realistic" projections for enrollment and graduates.	Established the proportions of dropouts due to the Career Factor.

STUDY	INITIAL STATED PURPOSE	STATUS	OUTCOME
Report of a Needs Assessment Study of manpower and skill requirements for YTEPP curriculum development (October 1991)	To map company manpower needs to facilitate the development of new curricula. To map national manpower requirements and survey the needs of the informal sector.	Established areas of prospective employment and compared wage and self-employment prospects.	Led to the establishment of the Curriculum Unit.

Table 8A: Project Costs

Item	Appraisal estimate (US\$ million)			Actual (US\$ million)		
	Local costs	Foreign costs	Total	Local costs	Foreign Costs	Total
Technical Assistance	0.7	0.2	0.9	0.7	0.2	0.9
Equipment/Furniture	0.6	2.6	3.2	0.5	1.6	2.1
Training	0.9	-	0.9	0.5	-	0.5
Materials and Supplies	1.4	0.8	2.2	2.3	1.3	3.6
Salaries	12.4	-	12.4	13.3	-	13.3
Administration	3.8	-	3.8	3.0	-	3.0
Supervision	2.8	-	2.8	1.6	-	1.6
Stipends	1.4	-	1.4	0.8	-	0.8
Total Baseline Costs	24.0	3.6	27.7	22.7	3.1	25.8
Prince Contingencies	3.9	0.4	4.3			
TOTAL PROJECT COSTS	28.0	4.0	31.9	22.7	3.1	25.8

Table 8B: Project Financing

Item	Appraisal estimate (US\$ million)			Actual (US\$ million)		
	Local costs	Foreign costs	Total	Local costs	Foreign Costs	Total
IBRD		20.7	20.7		15.5	15.5
Government of T&T	11.2		11.2	9.5		9.5
TOTAL	11.2	20.7	31.9	9.5	15.5	25.0

Table 9: Economic Costs and Benefits*(Cost per Enrollee presented in US\$)*

	CYCLE X		CYCLE XI		CYCLE XII		CYCLE X		CYCLE XI		CYCLE XII	
	Enrolled	Cost/Enr	Enrolled	Cost/Enr	Enrolled	Cost/Enr	Enrolled	Cost/Enr	Enrolled	Cost/Enr	Enrolled	Cost/Enr
Applied Arts	419	\$146	357	\$196	240	\$212	345	\$177	265	\$265	196	\$260
Auto Mech. & Repair	358	\$199	392	\$200	336	\$208	308	\$232	226	\$347	246	\$285
Beauty Culture	599	\$165	621	\$172	495	\$135	497	\$198	407	\$262	398	\$168
Construction	289	\$188	426	\$178	214	\$223	243	\$224	238	\$318	156	\$306
Crafts	163	\$208	166	\$253	124	\$308	144	\$236	139	\$303	85	\$449
Electronics	698	\$200	775	\$177	661	\$183	578	\$241	561	\$245	519	\$233
Family Services	160	\$106	141	\$219	32	\$697	147	\$116	103	\$300	30	\$743
Food Preparation	534	\$255	565	\$208	420	\$265	469	\$290	409	\$288	334	\$334
Garment Construction	652	\$250	762	\$188	579	\$253	538	\$303	524	\$273	472	\$310
Metal Des. & Fab.	411	\$198	476	\$147	403	\$190	352	\$232	322	\$218	304	\$251
Small Bus. Mgmt.	845	\$193	839	\$160	824	\$162	728	\$224	634	\$212	634	\$211
Tourism	99	\$137	94	\$119	79	\$161	80	\$170	53	\$212	56	\$228
Micro (post-training)	674	\$171	759	\$148	0	-	506	\$228	504	\$223	715	\$147
Career Enh: Core	4565	\$113	3750	-	2895	\$168	2900	\$178	2353	\$199	1994	\$244
Career Enh: Basic	0	-	1191	\$108	0	-	961	\$134	767	\$168	640	\$174
Career Enh: Cnslng.	605	\$84	800	\$53	937	\$51	n/a	-	n/a	-	n/a	-
Comm. Based Agric.	975	\$300	1419	\$154	1539	\$159	1900	\$154	2180	\$100	2203	\$99

Table 10: Status of Legal Covenants

**Trinidad & Tobago: Youth Training and Employment Partnership Project
Loan 3328-TR**

<i>Section</i>	<i>Covenant type</i>	<i>Status</i>	<i>Original Fulfillment date</i>	<i>Revised Fulfillment date</i>	<i>Description of covenant</i>	<i>Comments</i>
3.03	9	C	06/30/95		Semi-Annual Report	In compliance
3.04(a)	9	C	12/07/91		Report on community based training	In compliance
3.04(c)	9	C	5/12/95		Annual training report	Included in the follow-up to the Mid-Term Review Recommendation
3.05	10	C			MOE to make facilities available to YTEPP	No comments.
3.06	5	C			YTEPP to be assisted by a procurement agent	No comments.
3.07	5	C			NTB to assist YTEPP in placing 1500 graduates annually in AIM program	No comments.
3.08	5	C			Contract YTEPP/SBDC - YESS	No comments.
3.08	5	C			LMIS	No comments.
3.10(a)	9	C	09/01/91		Format and schedule for YTEPP internal reporting	No comments.
3.10(b)	9	C	09/01/91		Detailed Monitoring Indicators	No comments.
4.01	1	C			Appointment of auditor	No comments.
6.01(a)	11	C			Subsidiary Agreement entered into between Ministry of Finance and YTEPP, Ltd.	No comments.
6.01(b)	5	C			Agreement with procurement agents	No comments.

Key**Covenant types:**

- 1 Accounts/audit
- 2 Financial performance/revenue generation from beneficiaries
- 3 Flow and utilization of project funds
- 4 Counterpart funding
- 5 Management aspects of the project or executing agency
- 6 Environmental covenants
- 7 Involuntary resettlement

- 8 Indigenous people
- 9 Monitoring, review, and reporting
- 10 Project implementation not covered by categories 1-9
- 11 Sectoral or cross-sectoral budgetary or other resource allocation
- 12 Sectoral or cross-sectoral policy/regulatory/institutional action
- 13 Other

Status:

- C = covenant complied with
- CD = complied with after delay
- CP = complied with partially
- NC = not complied with

Table 11: Compliance with Operational Manual Statements

All Operational Manual Statements were complied with.

Table 12: Bank Resources: Staff Inputs (SW, Actual)

Stage	FY									Total
	90	91	92	93	94	95	96	97	98	
Preparation	83.1	25.4								108.5
Appraisal		30.8								30.8
Negotiations		5.2								5.2
Supervision		4.	15.7	8.2	4.4	13.3	1.6	3.9		74.2
Completion									23.1	51.1
TOTAL	83.1	65.4	15.7	8.2	4.4	13.3	1.6	3.9	23.1	218.7

Table 13: Bank Resources: Missions

Stage of Project Cycle	Month/ Year	Number of Persons	Days in Field	Specialized Staff Skills Represented	←Performance Rating→		Type of Problems
					Implementation Status	Development Objective	
Through Appraisal Identification/Preparation	11/89	4	10	Economist Sr. Training Spec. Consultant Sr. Country Officer			
Pre-Appraisal	No data available						
Appraisal through Board Approval	10/90	4	8	Technical Educ. Analyst Sr. Training Spec. Social Sector Consultant			
Negotiations	3/91						
Board Approval through Effectiveness	5/91						
Supervision 1	09/91	6	10	Technical Specialist Management Training Disbursement Officer Institut. Dev. Spec. Bus. Trn. Ent. Dev. Human Resource Spec.	2	1	Project launch workshop carried out.
Supervision 2	09/92	NO DATA AVAILABLE			2	1	Change of government raised concerns about commitment to the project.
Supervision 3	11/92	3	5	Technical Specialist Financial Specialist Human Resource Spec.	2	1	Preparation of 1993 workplan to focus on quality, supply and management issues.
Supervision 4	11/93	2	5	Technical Specialist Human Resource Spec.	2	1	Concern about quality, preparation of materials, curriculum development, financing of self- employment program.
Supervision 5 (Mid-Term Review)	09-10/94	5	10	Human Resource Spec. Microenterprise Spec.	S	HS	Extension of closing date recommended to allow for

Stage of Project Cycle	Month/ Year	Number of Persons	Days in Field	Specialized Staff Skills Represented	← Performance Rating →		Type of Problems
					Implementation Status	Development Objective	
				Training Specialist Evaluation Specialist Consultant			redesign and the development of a sustainability plan.
Supervision 6	05/96	4	10	Mission Leader Impact Evaluation Tech./Voc. Ed. Spec. Consultant	S	S	Review of status of the reorganized project.
Supervision 7	01/97	5	5	Mission Leader Impact Evaluation Tech./Voc. Ed. Spec. Financial Analyst Consultant	S	S	Review of 1996 operations which were satisfactory.
Supervision 8	06-07/97	2	5	Mission Leader Financial Mgmt. Spec.	S	S	Focus on project's financial management and readiness for closing.
Supervision 9	01/98	3	5	Mission Leader Financial Analyst Sr. Economist	S	S	Preparation for implementation completion evaluation; sustainability plan preparation discussed.

APPENDICES

- A. Borrower Contribution: Presented in two reports: one by the Ministry of Education, taking a more macro view of the project; and one by the YTEPP, presenting a more detailed discussion.
- B. There are no contributions by cofinanciers.
- C. Miscellaneous Appendices: there are none attached. A detailed Statistical Annex and report on the Tracer Studies (methodology and results) are available from Ms. Ada Rivera, LCSHD.
- D. Map

IMPLEMENTATION COMPLETION REPORT

**IN RELATION TO
YOUTH TRAINING AND EMPLOYMENT PARTNERSHIP PROGRAMME
(YTEPP) LIMITED**

SUBMITTED BY:

**MINISTRY OF EDUCATION
ON BEHALF OF THE
GOVERNMENT OF THE REPUBLIC OF TRINIDAD AND TOBAGO**

1998 May 28

IMPLEMENTATION COMPLETION REPORT

IN RELATION TO

**YOUTH TRAINING AND EMPLOYMENT PARTNERSHIP PROGRAMME
(YTEPP) LIMITED**

SUBMITTED BY:

MINISTRY OF EDUCATION

ON BEHALF OF THE

GOVERNMENT OF THE REPUBLIC OF TRINIDAD AND TOBAGO

1998 May 28

LIST OF CONTENTS

	Page No.
Main Findings	(i)
Executive Summary	(ii)
Background	1
Implementation Completion Report - The Ministry's Approach	2
Structure	2
Curriculum	3
Programming	5
Resourcing	6
Target Groups	7
Products	7
Linkages	8
Special Projects	8
Public Relations	8
Spin-offs	9
Conclusions and Recommendations	9

MAIN FINDINGS

The main findings are that YTEPP Ltd. has been, in the main, successful in relation to its objectives. Its area of weakness has been management of curriculum delivery and the services supportive thereof. The functions performed by YTEPP Ltd. are still required and YTEPP Ltd. in its institutional form is best placed to perform them. YTEPP Ltd. should be continued to carry out its existing remit and any other responsibilities as may be determined in the future, subject to:

- (i) review of the expertise and experience requirements of technical management staff;
- (ii) review of the technical management system with a view to improving effectiveness and internal accountability so as to impact directly on the instructor-trainee interface;
- (iii) establishment in the overall system of management the necessary feedback and other information channels to inform all levels of management regarding need for interventions

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

1. BACKGROUND

The Youth Training and Employment Partnership Programme (YTEPP) was a response in 1988 to the high levels of unemployment and unemployability which prevailed at the time among youth under 25 years of age. The loan agreement between the Government of the Republic of Trinidad and Tobago (GORTT) and the World Bank commenced in 1991 after YTEPP has existed for approximately 3 years and had become a limited liability company. Under the loan agreement the principal objectives were:

- to improve the quality and relevance of education and training for employment and self-employment provided by YTEPP through the development of curriculum, training of instructors and provision of equipment for training facilities and various training programmes;
- to increase the opportunities offered to youth to acquire work experience in private enterprises or public agencies which will facilitate their first entry into the labour market;
- to promote self-employment and small business training and the linking of a network of credit institutions capable of providing loans for small businesses; and
- to strengthen the management of the YTEP Programme to enhance the effectiveness of its training activities and capacity to programme, monitor and evaluate training and post-training support operations and their impact on youth employment.

2. IMPLEMENTATION COMPLETION REPORT - THE MINISTRY'S APPROACH

Except where the Ministry's Report indicates otherwise, the findings and conclusions of the YTEPP ICR are, by and large, endorsed by the Ministry. Beyond this, the Ministry's approach has been to identify the dimensions of YTEPP which have been exemplary or distinctive, or which YTEPP pioneered, popularized, entrenched or "perfected", and, in particular, those dimensions that lend themselves to replicability and transferability to other institutions or to the wider TVET system.

To this end, focus has been placed on structure, curriculum, programming, resourcing, target group, products, linkages, special projects, public relations and spin-offs.

2.1 Structure - The corporate structure allows for degrees of autonomy, proactivity and flexibility which have facilitated many dimensions of system organisation and operation, while the relationship with other Ministries ensures that corporate autonomy remains within the ambit of Government policies. As regards the corporate nature of a public sector training institution, YTEPP is pioneering and exemplary. The model should be considered for other institutions.

2.2 Curriculum - The curriculum employs the holistic development approach embracing vocational skills, career enhancement and micro-entrepreneurship towards the goal of producing graduates with a basket of employable skills in preparation for both wage and self-employment.

While other programmes have included non-vocational components, YTEPP has mainstreamed the attitudinal / personal development dimensions into compulsory, certifiable components. The vital ingredients of the Career Enhancement Module are personal and attitudinal development (work ethic, confidence building, financial and social life skills), numeracy and literacy skills and counselling. In addition to the positive commentary regarding benefits of the Career Enhancement Module, there is need for a systematic evaluation, employing psychometric and other rigorous methods.

The Micro-enterprise Module is delivered through methodologies including role play and experiential learning. It is required that each centre-based class and community-based project generates a micro-business. There is much to be learned and transferred to the wider TVET system.

Curriculum development for YTEPP provided an opportunity for experiencing the full curriculum development process. This capacity and experience has already benefitted the wider TVET system. Curriculum development for YTEPP has helped to advance the process of structuring the TVET system into appropriate levels.

2.3 Programming - On account of the scale and distribution of programming, there is good potential for managerial efficiency based on decentralisation and the divestment of relative autonomy to regional offices and individual centres. The system has performed well in many respects, but the full potential has not always been realised. There is evidence to suggest some extent of shortfall in achieving effective curriculum delivery, which, in the final analysis, is the ultimate determinant and indicator of programming success. The Reports of External Validators give mixed reviews in the area of curriculum delivery. The comment that some trainees have not demonstrated adequate practical skills was made in reference to some centres and courses. More stringent centre-based management (technical and administrative) may be required to ensure that tutors follow the prescribed curricula and provide adequate opportunity for trainees to repeat and reinforce competencies. The External Validators of the National Examinations Council have revealed the need for strengthening the technical supervision at all levels as well as the day-to-day administration at the level of centre managers.

YTEPP's valuable experience in the widespread use of continuous assessment as the primary basis for certification is transferable.

2.4 Resourcing - YTEPP has distinguished itself for maintaining a large stock of equipment and supplies for its training centres. In the main, the arrangement has served well, but there have been areas of weakness, suggesting the need for more efficient management. The policy of maintaining a stock of resources for training centres is worthy of emulation.

2.5 Target Group - YTEPP's policy of catering to those with no identifiable or certified educational attainment helps to salvage persons with the least hope or opportunity. This is a very valuable social contribution. So too is the provision of second chances to those who did not benefit maximally from formal school. In these respects, YTEPP has blazed a trail.

2.6 Products - A number of useful curriculum materials have come out of the Programme. Both the experience of producing them and the materials themselves can redound to the benefit of the wider TVET system. These products, being the property of the Government, should be available to Ministries and public sector institutions.

2.7 Linkages - A network of linkages and valuable synergies have been established between YTEPP and the public school system. These have been mutually beneficial. They provide sound bases and represent useful models for continued partnership.

2.8 Special Projects - YTEPP conducted a project in school furniture repair in some 62 schools, which afforded work experience to YTEPP graduates and furnished useful products for the Ministry of Education. YTEPP served as the implementing agency for the Ministry's Advanced Welding and Fabrication Programme.

2.9 Public Relations - YTEPP has successfully used the public relations medium to promote its image, profile and credibility as a training institution and this has served the Institution well. It has attracted support and requests for services and has made YTEPP a household "word". This strategy is worthy of emulation system wide.

2.10 Spin-offs - In addition to other identified benefits, YTEPP has helped to spawn the nucleus of a fledgling educational services industry through its mobilisation of curriculum and other expertise to address its needs. On the other hand, YTEPP has itself developed the capacity to provide and procure services, utilising a combination of in-house and external expertise. YTEPP has also contributed to entrenching the culture of continuing, lifelong education and training.

3. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

In addition to utilising approaches and practices inherited from existing programmes, YTEPP has pioneered, popularized, mainstreamed, entrenched and "perfected" a number of approaches and practices that have potential for useful application elsewhere, including system wide application. YTEPP has been quite successful in establishing systems for discharging its responsibilities. In many areas, performance, too, has been commendable. But the full potential of these systems has not always been realised. Performance shortfalls in the critical areas of

curriculum delivery, continuous assessment and centre-based management have resulted in some graduates not achieving Programme objectives and not demonstrating the vocational competencies required for participating in a work situation. There is a need to strengthen centre-based management (technical and administrative), including accountability of centre to regional office and regional office to head office. It must be ensured that technical managers bring to bear the expertise, experience and practice required to lead and manage the technical functions at the various levels right down to the instructor-trainee interface, which, is the final analysis, is where effectiveness matters most.

Barring the identified areas of shortfall, YTEPP has been, in many respects, a success story. The functions performed by YTEPP need to continue to be performed, the services need to be provided and the clients need to be served. Having considered alternative strategies for carrying out these responsibilities and mindful of the institutional structure, system organisation and institutional memory as well as the reservoir of acquired expertise and experience existing at YTEPP, the most plausible option is to retain YTEPP as an institution, subject to: (i) review of the expertise and experience requirements of technical management staff; (ii) review of the technical management system with a view to improving effectiveness and internal accountability so as to impact directly on the instructor-trainee interface; and (iii) establishment in the overall system of management the necessary feedback and other information channels to inform all levels of management regarding need for interventions.

It is recommended, subject to the considerations and proposals contained in this Report, that YTEPP Ltd. be continued as a company to carry out its existing remit and any other responsibilities as may be determined in the future. To this end, continued financial support by the Government will be necessary in the short-to-medium term. During this period YTEPP will be expected to assume increasing responsibility for its own funding and become less dependent on Government funding. This goal should be pursued in a manner compatible with YTEPP's responsibility in relation to target group, access, equity and quality.

It is further recommended that YTEPP be located under the technical purview of the National Training Agency and be given clear responsibilities within that system of governance.

1. BACKGROUND

YTEPP originated in 1988 as a response to high unemployment among youth under 25 years of age, a substantial percentage of whom were virtually unemployable on account of inadequate preparation for the workplace. There was clearly a need to provide, on a mass scale and in as short a time frame as practicable, basic training for wage employment and self-employment. YTEPP was part of the response.

The loan agreement between the GORTT and the World Bank in respect of YTEPP Limited commenced in 1991. By then YTEPP had existed for approximately three years and had been transformed from a project within the Ministry of Youth and Sports into a limited liability company. Under the loan agreement the principal objectives were:

- to improve the quality and relevance of education and training for employment and self-employment provided by YTEPP through the development of curriculum, training of instructors and provision of equipment for training facilities and various training programmes;
- to increase the opportunities offered to youth to acquire work experience in private enterprises or public agencies which will facilitate their first entry into the labour market;
- to promote self-employment and small business training and the linking of a network of credit institutions capable of providing loans for small businesses; and
- to strengthen the management of the YTEP Programme to enhance the effectiveness of its training activities and capacity to programme, monitor and evaluate training and post-training support operations and their impact on youth employment.

In addition, certain challenges were identified, as follows:

- improved career guidance and personal counselling for youth
- increased training in attitudinal development and basic literacy and numeracy
- improved training and support for self-employment
- improved quality and relevance of job skill training
- overcoming constraints on implementation of work experience and apprenticeships
- better labour market information to determine short-term training needs
- improved management of YTEPP.

2. IMPLEMENTATION COMPLETION REPORT - THE MINISTRY'S APPROACH

The Implementation Completion Report (ICR) prepared by YTEPP deals with YTEPP's performance in relation to a number of objectives and challenges and conforms to the format proposed at Attachment 1 of the Aide Memoire based on the Mission of 1998 January. Except where the Ministry's Report indicates otherwise, the findings and conclusions of the YTEPP ICR Report are, by and large, endorsed by the Ministry.

The Ministry's Report has not sought to follow orthodox approaches to evaluation. Rather, it has identified the dimensions of YTEPP which have been exemplary or distinctive, whether by virtue of YTEPP's having pioneered, popularized, entrenched or "perfected" such dimensions, or by virtue of the scale of the activities, their replicability or multiplier effect, and where, furthermore, such dimensions have been signally effective. Focus has been placed, in particular, on those dimensions that lend themselves to transferability to other institutions or to the wider TVET system or its sub-systems. In addition, areas of weaknesses have been identified and suggestions made for improvement.

To this end, focus has fallen on:

- > structure > curriculum > programming
- > resourcing > target group > products
- > linkages > special projects > public relations
- > spin-offs

3. STRUCTURE

The limited liability company status of YTEPP Ltd., which is unusual, if not unprecedented, for a training institution in the public sector, allows for levels, degrees and scope of autonomy, proactivity and flexibility which are not normally available to other training entities in the public sector. This includes the autonomy to establish internal policies in relation to decision making and execution, employment practice, tendering procedure, procurement practice, financial management and control, administrative and operational practice, public relations and promotion, linkages with external agencies. YTEPP's relationship with the Investment Division of the Ministry of Finance, the Ministry of Planning and Development and the Ministry of Education ensures that corporate autonomy operates within the ambit of Government policies.

The areas of autonomy, proactivity and flexibility are highly facilitative of efficiency and effectiveness in relation to client / customer satisfaction, meeting Government (shareholder) expectations, securing service contracts and other forms of business from external agencies.

These characteristics have enabled YTEPP to, among other things: (a) streamline its project teams; (b) decentralize field operations; (c) introduce full-time training; (d) adopt competency-based, modular training; (e) form partnerships with business and industry; (f) customize training.

The autonomy, proactivity and flexibility represent a welcome relief from the usual bureaucracy encountered in the Public Service and Statutory Services. As regards the corporate nature of a public sector training institution, YTEPP is pioneering and exemplary. The model should be considered for other institutions.

Features of the corporate structure which have good potential for transference purposes include: the interests, expertise, experiences and connections / networking which are brought by a Board of diverse representatives; the role and functions of the Board; the linkage and relationship between the Board and the CEO-Secretariat; the opportunity for all levels of staff to articulate views relating to policy or operations of the organisation, allowing for "buy-in" and acceptance; the culture of the organisation as to its management, decentralised operations, staffing in relation to functions, operational efficiency and financial efficiency.

YTEPP's experience has pointed to the need to strike an acceptable relationship between administrative cost and direct training costs, consistent with programme objectives. Such ratio may serve as a useful guide to human resource policy and an index of operational efficiency.

4. CURRICULUM

4.1 The YTEP Programme design is holistic in nature and embraces the following dimensions: (a) vocational skills; (b) career enhancement and (c) micro-entrepreneurship. The intention of the YTEPP training programme is to produce graduates who are capable of performing in the work situation in keeping with occupational specifications and with minimum supervision. A major goal of the Programme is to provide the graduates with a basket of employable skills in preparation for both wage and self-employment.

The core components of the YTEPP curriculum are vocational skills and career enhancement, complemented by micro-entrepreneurship, in order to address youth unemployment and youth unemployability. The integrated training curriculum provides a range of life and job skills, including preparation for the world of work, counselling and career guidance, attitudinal and personal development (confidence and self-esteem), small business skills and, where necessary (as determined by diagnostic test) remedial literacy and numeracy.

While other programmes have included non-vocational components as minor and / or optional offerings or appendages, YTEPP, through its Career Enhancement Module, has mainstreamed the attitudinal / personal development dimension into compulsory, certifiable components. Micro-entrepreneurship training, too, though pre-existing YTEPP, has experienced under YTEPP a filip in visibility, profile and popularity and YTEPP can justifiably take some

credit for micro-entrepreneurship training finding permanent root and taking hold in public sector programming.

4.2 The vital ingredients of the Career Enhancement Module are personal and attitudinal development (work ethic, confidence building, financial and social life skills), numeracy and literacy skills and counselling. While the impact of the career enhancement dimension is considered by some to be more significant than the vocational skill training, the mode of delivery of the former can benefit from greater utilisation of methodologies advantageous to affective behaviours.

In addition to the general observations and feedback indicating the benefits of the Career Enhancement Module, there is need for a systematic evaluation employing psychometric and other rigorous methods appropriate to the affective domain.

4.3 Core elements of the Micro-entrepreneurship Module include: building self-esteem, developing a business idea, identifying opportunities and constraints, writing a business plan, marketing, production, human resources, financing a business, operational aspects of running a micro-business.

Various delivery methodologies are employed, including role play and experiential learning. Support is provided by way of accessing credit and technical advice, promotion of micro-business and marketing of products.

The current requirement that a micro-business be generated from each centre-based class and community-based project will go a long way towards concretizing the impact and ensuring the appropriate outcomes of the Module.

4.4 The exercise, led by Ministry of Education personnel, of developing curricula for YTEPP courses has provided an opportunity to experience the full curriculum process through its various stages. Hitherto, the Ministry's efforts at curriculum development, by and large, ended with the production of the syllabus and some teaching-learning materials. The YTEPP exercise involved all facets of competency-based curriculum development, including the preparation of performance tests, the development of assessment strategies and related documentation, the refinement of the Certificate of Acquired Competencies derived from the Ministry's earlier version. This capacity and experience in taking the curriculum development exercise through the full gamut are very valuable resources, which are already being applied to some areas of the wider TVET system and will be put to much further use.

YTEPP has also served as a catalyst for the structuring of the TVET system into a hierarchy of levels and arrival at a national TVET model.

5. PROGRAMMING

5.1 The scale and geographic distribution of YTEPP makes it the most widespread delivery institution in the public sector. It is the largest institution operating at the introductory occupational level. The consequent distribution of authority and operational management and the degrees of relative autonomy divested to regional offices and individual centres have the potential to enhance managerial efficiency and the effectiveness of training. The scale of operations has the potential for economic efficiency.

5.2 In some respects, for instance, access to training and optimal use of resources, the decentralised operations have enhanced performance. However, there is evidence to suggest some extent of shortfall in achieving effective curriculum delivery. It is appreciated that all of the planning, organisational and management dimensions, however laudable, are, in the final analysis, inputs designed to enable the achievement of efficient and effective delivery of curricula. It is the effectiveness of the instructor-trainee interface, facilitated by utilisation of the various resources, which is the ultimate determinant and indicator of programming success. The Reports of the External Validators (National Examinations Council) give mixed reviews on that score.

It has been indicated that in respect of some courses and some centres, the management of curriculum delivery can benefit from improvement. The comment that some trainees have not demonstrated adequate practical skills was made in reference to some centres. In some cases, validation could only be partially done on account of inadequate curriculum coverage, which, in some cases, was said to be on account of inadequacy of equipment and / or consumables and in others, on account of instructor incapability or lack of diligence. More stringent centre-based management (technical and administrative) may be required to ensure that tutors follow the prescribed curricula and that they do not use the Tutor Course Guides selectively, which makes assessment difficult. The opportunity to repeat, improve and reinforce skills, which is a valuable facility of competency-based, modular systems, may need to be made more readily available to trainees. The incidence of unapproved use of home assignments as a basis for assessment, even if rare, may be enough to endanger the credibility of the entire system and should be arrested.

There seems to be a good case for improvement in, and wider practice of, direct technical supervision of instructors, which may require enforcement of technical supervision at the higher levels of the system. In this regard, the 'Guidelines' prepared in 1998 January for technical supervisors is a positive step. Furthermore, the intervention of the External Validators of the National Examinations Council (NEC) has had many beneficial effects. It has ensured not only that continuous assessment is more professionally done to meet the standards of the NEC, but it has also impacted significantly on programme delivery. Instructors have assumed a more alert and active mode. They have benefitted from training by External Validators on the use of the Tutor Course Guides, key steps in critical processes, instructional and assessment techniques, standards to be attained, documentation of assessment outcomes. External Validators have also helped to mitigate "upward pressures" on assessment scores.

5.3 There is evidence, too, to suggest weaknesses in the day-to-day administration at the level of centre managers, which perhaps point to weaknesses at the level of regional and central management. This has, for instance, allegedly resulted in occurrences, on the one hand, of over-resourcing of centres and the consequent waste and "losses", and on the other hand, under-resourcing of centres resulting in constraints to course delivery. Another alleged consequence of weaknesses in centre management is submission from time to time of marks for "ghost" trainees.

5.4 YTEPP has been very successful at the enterprise of attracting trainees to its programmes. On the output side, along with the very glowing remarks made in some quarters about YTEPP graduates and their success in gaining salaried employment or self-employment, there has been in other quarters a somewhat less complimentary perception about their skill preparation for the world of work. Some of this latter perception may be factual while some may derive from the success of YTEPP's self-promotion and the resultant exaggerated expectations of YTEPP graduates on the part of employers and the public. It has been said by some commentators that the real success of YTEPP's programming has been in the area of attitudinal development, confidence building, motivation and the engendering of hope as a result of its Career Enhancement Module.

5.5 A valuable practice that YTEPP has helped to mainstream is the use of continuous assessment as the primary basis for certification. YTEPP has taken continuous assessment to proportions of mass application singular among public sector institutions. This has been another pioneering achievement and has helped to popularize continuous assessment, concretize its merits and entrench its practice.

5.6 The Evening School mode of programme delivery of the introductory occupational level facilitates both employed and unemployed persons. It also allows for use of school plant, facilities, equipment and personnel, resulting in substantial cost saving and ready access to resource persons of the various categories. The arrangement results in higher utilisation rates of plant, facilities and equipment. The employment of staff resident at centres caters for accountability and fosters good relations and co-operation between YTEPP and its centres.

6. RESOURCING

YTEPP has distinguished itself among public sector institutions by establishing and maintaining a large stock of equipment and supplies for its training centres through a system of warehousing and inventory control. In the main, this has served as a good base for supplying centres, but has not always translated into efficient resourcing. There has been room for improvement in the management systems to facilitate timely response to the needs of centres for equipment and consumables as well as to prevent over supply. But the policy of maintaining a stock of resources for training centres recommends itself.

7. TARGET GROUPS

While most public sector training institutions have specified minimum entry requirements in terms of educational attainment, YTEPP has catered for a clientele which includes persons with no identifiable or certified attainment, poor literacy and numeracy levels, low self-esteem and little hope. Such persons have been afforded remediation and a ray of hope. They almost invariably emerge with at least rudimentary employable skills. By not insisting on entry qualification thresholds, thus reaching down to those who are otherwise excluded from training opportunities in public sector institutions, YTEPP has salvaged many a dispirited soul and redeemed many a potential social parasite and / or deviant. YTEPP has also served as a second chance institution for many who have not benefitted maximally from their opportunity in formal school. Many lives have been redirected and enabled to flower.

On both counts, that is, by catering to the needs of the low achiever / non-achiever and by providing second chances, YTEPP has blazed a trail that is deserving of emulation. The expertise developed by YTEPP for dealing with groups with diverse entry behaviours, dispositions and interests has great potential and should be documented and disseminated, as the client groups of the future will be increasingly heterogeneous.

8. PRODUCTS

8.1 A number of useful products with national currency have resulted from the Programme. The Level I curriculum comprising syllabuses, teaching-learning materials and assessment strategy and instruments has been developed and has the potential for national use. It is already being used in a limited way. Experience has been gained in its application and such experience is transferable. The Certificate of Acquired Competencies (CAC), adopted from the National Training Board, Ministry of Education, has benefitted from considerable simplification and refinement through the joint efforts of YTEPP and the Ministry of Education.

This revised CAC is the instrument of certification being issued by the NEC to graduates of YTEPP starting from Cycle Eleven and is to be the instrument for certifying the Level 1 Programme nationally.

8.2 Some Level II syllabuses have been developed as the first elements of the Level II curricula. These too are intended for wider national use. Also, the literacy and numeracy diagnostic pre-test and post-test developed and administered by YTEPP can find widespread use elsewhere, subject to validation and standardisation.

8.3 YTEPP's products are, of course, the property of the Government and should be available to Ministries and public sector institutions for use in their programmes. If, for instance, the syllabuses used by YTEPP at the Level I are considered to be the best available at this time, they

should be adopted as the national syllabuses and all other public sector programmes be not just allowed, but be required, to use them. To do otherwise will be to forego the opportunity to use the best available, which cannot be prudent. Copyright arrangements should not deprive public institutions of the benefit of materials produced at public expense. Access to the products of the Programme should be formalised and not be left to the discretion of YTEPP policy or personnel.

9. LINKAGES

A network of linkages and valuable synergies have been established between YTEPP and the public school system - the result of the sharing of plant, facilities, equipment and staff. Schools have benefitted from YTEPP's deployment of equipment at schools and, even when YTEPP ceases to operate at a particular school, the "parting" has been cordial and sensitive to their mutual interests, YTEPP often agreeing to defer its removal of equipment to facilitate the school's programmes.

These linkages provide sound bases for continued co-operation and optimal use of resources and personnel. They represent useful models for co-operation among institutions.

10. SPECIAL PROJECTS

YTEPP conducted a project in school furniture repair in some 62 schools for the Ministry of Education, in the process providing work experience for YTEPP graduates and strengthening the relationship with the Ministry.

The Advanced Welding and Fabrication Programme initiated in 1995 by the Ministry of Education, with YTEPP as the implementing agency, is another project that has not only had utility value by way of producing trained practitioners, but has also helped to cement the partnership between the mainstream Ministry of Education and YTEPP.

11. PUBLIC RELATIONS

YTEPP has liberally employed the medium of public relations to promote its image, profile and credibility as a training institution and a player in the fields of unemployment alleviation and continuing education. YTEPP has engaged in career guidance activities, community outreach, exhibitions and displays, development and dissemination of literature. This has served YTEPP well in that it has popularized the Institution, gained support from various interests and attracted contracts for services. To the extent that YTEPP has approximated a

household "word", its public relations has been successful. To some extent the success of its self-promotion may have worked against YTEPP in that it may have raised inflated expectations of YTEPP graduates. As a consequence, their true capability may be under-rated on account of being evaluated against unrealistic standards. That notwithstanding, YTEPP's public relations practice has considerable emulation value.

12. SPIN-OFFS

In addition to the other identified direct benefits to the wider TVET system and the national community, a potentially significant spin-off of YTEPP's operations has resulted from the engagement, from time to time, of the services of educational specialists such as curriculum officers and evaluation personnel. Perhaps unwittingly, the nucleus of an educational services industry has been created and its viability tested, if not demonstrated. This can be interpreted as the beginnings of what can be expected to be a thriving industry of the future, given the gravitation towards contracting expertise or out-sourcing specialists services.

On the other hand, YTEPP has itself developed the capacity to provide contracted services to other agencies. This includes the capacity to source services from other providers and deliver such services to clients, utilising a combination of in-house and external expertise. Strengths exist in areas such as programme planning and implementation, curriculum development, research and evaluation, inventory management and control, documentation, printing and publication, as well as its accustomed areas of practice such as career enhancement, training of trainers and customized training.

Another significant spin-off is the contribution to the entrenchment of the culture of continuing education and lifelong learning and the provision / accessing of opportunities for learning beyond "school". This is undoubtedly the way of the future, and well before it had found its place into the local lexicon of "buzz words", YTEPP was promoting learning in the non-formal, out-of-school, adult setting - yet another transferable to the wider system.

13. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Over the period of the World Bank Loan, the YTEPP "experiment" has employed approaches and practices that were inherited from existing programmes and systems and has adapted, refined and enhanced some of them. In addition, YTEPP has pioneered, popularized, mainstreamed, entrenched and "perfected" a number of approaches and practices that have the potential for useful application system wide. These include: the corporate structure of the organisation; curriculum development and delivery and programming generally; resourcing; selection and treatment of target groups; creation of products and achievement of outcomes; establishment and utilisation of linkages; special projects; public relations.

On these various fronts, YTEPP has been quite successful in establishing systems for the discharge of its responsibilities. In some areas the full potential of these systems has not been realised. In the critical areas of curriculum delivery, continuous assessment and centre-based management there have been shortfalls, which have resulted in some YTEPP graduates not achieving the Programme objectives and not demonstrating the vocational competencies required for participating in a work situation. These areas of deficit can benefit from more effective technical and administrative support and management, including more rigorous accountability of centre to regional office and regional office to head office.

The absence from YTEPP's Implementation Completion Report of commentary on these areas of deficiency may suggest that there is a need to build into the overall system of management the channels and mechanisms to facilitate feedback and other information flow that can inform senior management of strengths and weaknesses on a system wide basis.

If, in addition to the acknowledged merits of the system as designed, the performance of the system is also to be exemplary, it must be ensured that the incumbents in technical management positions bring to bear the expertise, experience and practice required to lead and manage the technical functions at the various levels right down to instructor-trainee interface. This interface, in the final analysis, is where effectiveness matters most. In the context of training, effective delivery of the curriculum to the trainees is the ultimate objective of the various inputs and efforts throughout the system. Deficits at that level are therefore significant and deserving of commensurate intervention. It is believed that if the appropriate interventions are made, YTEPP can significantly improve the cost effectiveness of its programming, for instance, delivering better quality training without increased cost.

Shortfalls in gaining employment on the part of graduates are attributable partly to deficiencies in the vocational skills of some graduates and partly to inadequate support from agencies outside of YTEPP.

Barring the areas identified as requiring attention, significant though they undoubtedly are, YTEPP has been, in many respects, a success story. A tracer study conducted in 1991 by YTEPP indicated that for a particular group of candidates, the employment rate increased by 32.5% after participating in a YTEPP training cycle, while for a control group of similar candidates who were not YTEPP participants, the employment rate increased by 14.3%. A similar study in 1993 indicated 24.3% increase for the YTEPP group and a 12.2% increase for the control group. A 1996 study indicated a 29.7% increase for the YTEPP group and a 27.6% increase for the control group.

YTEPP has given to many hope and employability and, by extension, employment, earnings, survivability, mobility, a career path, a learning culture, motivation to further education and training and higher qualifications. It has empowered many who would otherwise have been social dependents, if not menaces.

There is no doubt that the functions performed by YTEPP need to continue to be performed, the services provided need to continue to be rendered and the clients served must continue to be catered for.

How best to do all this? Is there merit in transferring these responsibilities to another existing institution or distributing them among several other institutions? There is at present no existing institution structured and resourced to carry these responsibilities, and farming them out will severely impair the cohesiveness and holistic nature of programming. What plausibility can there be in establishing a new organisation to carry out the same responsibilities at the expense of existing institutional structure, system organisation and institutional memory as well as a reservoir of acquired expertise and experience?

It would seem that if YTEPP did not exist, something akin to it would have needed to be invented. That YTEPP exists and has, as a whole, performed creditably recommend that a good strategy for continuing to treat with the responsibilities currently carried by YTEPP is to retain YTEPP as an institution, subject to:

- (i) review of the expertise and experience requirements of technical management staff;
- (ii) review of the technical management system with a view to improving effectiveness and internal accountability so as to impact directly on the instructor-trainee interface;
- (iii) establishment in the overall system of management the necessary feedback and other information channels to inform all levels of management regarding need for interventions.

It is recognised that YTEPP has a key responsibility as the major provider of training at the introductory occupational level and that it is this level of training which is most widely demanded, in terms of volume and geographic distribution. In light of these considerations, it may appropriate to review the adequacy of YTEPP's "reach" in relation to the issue of access.

It is recommended, subject to the considerations and proposals contained in this Report, that YTEPP Ltd. be continued as a company to carry out its existing remit and any other responsibilities as may be determined in the future. To this end, continued financial support by the Government will be necessary in the short-to-medium term. During this period YTEPP will be expected to assume increasing responsibility for its own funding and become less dependent on Government funding. This goal should be pursued in a manner compatible with YTEPP's responsibility in relation to target group, access, equity and quality.

It is further recommended that YTEPP be located under the technical purview of the National Training Agency and be given clear responsibilities within that system of governance.

**YOUTH TRAINING AND EMPLOYMENT PARTNERSHIP PROGRAMME
(YTEPP) LIMITED**

**IMPLEMENTATION
COMPLETION REPORT
PROJECT 3328 - TR**

Part One

**Prepared by YOUTH TRAINING AND EMPLOYMENT PARTNERSHIP
PROGRAMME (YTEPP) LIMITED**

DATE: 31/07/98

REPUBLIC OF TRINIDAD AND TOBAGO

Education and Training for Youth Employment Project

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page No.
1. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY.....	2
2. INTRODUCTION.....	7
3. ORIGINAL PROJECT OBJECTIVES.....	7
4. RESTRUCTURING OF YTEPP	10
5. PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION REVIEW/ YTEPP's: MISSION STATEMENT.....	10
6. SUMMARY OF PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION CONSTRAINTS.....	15
7. INITIATIVES FOR PROJECT SUSTAINABILITY.....	16
8. BANK PERFORMANCE.....	17
9. BORROWER'S PERFORMANCE.....	18
10. PROJECT COST AND FINANCING.....	18
11. KEY FINDINGS AND LESSONS LEARNED.....	19
12. FUTURE OPERATIONS	20
13. GENERAL REFERENCES	
PART II: ANNEX (INCLUDING STATISTICAL TABLES)	

1. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

1.1 In 1988, the Government of the Republic of Trinidad and Tobago (GORTT) established the Youth Training and Employment Partnership Programme (YTEPP) as a short-term social intervention to address the increasingly high unemployment rate of youths under the age of twenty-five (25). YTEPP's initial two years of project implementation was funded by the GORTT and was viewed as an important youth project under the auspices of the Ministry of Youth and Sports.

1.2 In August 1991, the GORTT entered a loan agreement with the World Bank to fund the Education and Training for Youth Employment Project for a period of five (5) years (1990-1995). Total funding obtained from the World Bank was US \$ 20.7 million and the GORTT provided co-financing in the tune of US\$ 11.2 million.

1.3 Project Objectives

In the World Bank Staff Appraisal Report (SAR, 1991) the four (4) principal project objectives stated are as follows:

- to improve the quality and relevance of education and training for employment and self-employment provided by YTEPP through the development of curriculum, training of instructors and provision of equipment for training facilities and various training programmes.
- to increase the opportunities offered to youth to acquire work experience in private enterprises or public agencies which will facilitate their first entry into the labour market.
- to promote self-employment and small business training and the linking of a network of credit institutions capable of providing loans for small businesses;
and
- to strengthen the management of the YTEP Programme to enhance the effectiveness of its training activities and capacity to programme, monitor, evaluate training and post-training support operations and their impact on employment.

1.4 Key Lessons and Findings

The YTEP Programme is a unique training programme designed to meet the needs of a specialised target population of unskilled, unemployed youth, under the age of twenty-five (25) years. Designed to address the absence of vocational skills, low self-esteem and poor communication skills of most of its applicants, the Programme provides vocational skills training, counselling support and training in life skills. It attempts to help young people address their

marginalisation by developing their technical, behavioural and entrepreneurial skills. In essence, the programme encourages them to take charge of their lives by developing the relevant skills to effect the transformation.

The Company has conducted an analysis of the impact of its training on the employment status of its graduates through the conduct of a number of tracer studies carried out by an independent research analyst. Data from four tracer studies conducted over a period of four (4) years have revealed significant findings that indicate YTEPP's success in achieving its chief objective.

Its mandate was to develop a training programme to enhance the marketability of unemployed out of school youth. Tracer studies conducted on control groups and graduates of different YTEPP cycles show that the YTEPP Programme has had its most significant impact on that group of young persons whose academic background and job experiences make them unattractive to employers. One notable study¹ conducted in 1994 by officials of the Bank and YTEPP concluded that applicants to YTEPP were not employable. The Study suggested that those underlying factors that could have contributed to individuals participating in YTEPP also restricted the earning potential of the individuals.

Key factors such as the socio-economic background and low academic achievement of these individuals could have put them at a disadvantage when seeking jobs, had they not attended YTEPP. Upon graduating from YTEPP, their subsequent earnings were directly linked to their participation in YTEPP. In comparison with control groups, their comparative, and at times superior, performances in the labour market a major improvement on their pre-YTEPP status.

The authors felt strongly that any evaluation of the effect of YTEPP on the earnings of its graduates must bear in mind the negative effects of these initial attributes. A lack of appreciation of the constraints posed by these factors might lead to a downward bias of the effect of YTEPP on earnings.

¹ The Effect of Trinidad and Tobago's Youth Training and Employment Partnership Programme on Graduates' Earnings 1994, by Arjun Singh Bedi, John Newman, Laura Rawlings (World Bank), Leslie Bowrin (YTEPP)

In hindsight, some of the major findings of the YTEPP programme were:

- The programme has had a significant impact on the two most vulnerable social groups – women and youth. Most of the programme's intake comprised young females (55% - 60%) whose rate of unemployment (32%), after graduation, was more favourable than the rate (39%) of the national female labour force (*see table 2*).
- The focus on vocational skill development along with motivational and communication training has proven attractive to incarcerated young men and women. The YTEPP Programme has already begun to target this group and has introduced training programmes at the Youth Correctional Institutions in collaboration with the Ministry of National Security. This initiative has been successful although there is need to expand this training facility even further.
- The Tracer Studies have clearly demonstrated YTEPP's positive impact on its target groups. Despite their limited academic background and work experience, the YTEPP graduates have experienced significant increases in their employment rates when their absorption rates before and after YTEPP are compared (13.6% in 1989 to 46.1% in 1991; 17.4% in 1991 to 41.7% in 1993). Comparatively, they have also performed better than members of a control group who had a stronger academic background.
- Comparatively the control groups' rates moved from 27.9% in 1989 to 42.3% in 1991; 14.7% in 1991 to 35.3% in 1993.
- Over 40% of the graduates surveyed opted to pursue their studies rather than seek immediate employment.
- Most employed graduates (74%) stated that the training received in the Career Enhancement component was more critical to their gaining employment than that received in the Vocational Skills component. This seemed to re-emphasise the higher priority attributed to communication and life skills for new entrants to the labour market.
- The competencies developed in formulating and managing training and support programmes – curriculum development, supervision, centre management, monitoring and evaluation, networking with industry and other social partners – can be commercially marketed to state, regional, and other private organisations.
- The organisation's greatest asset is its managerial capacity. YTEPP can diversify its training product to cater to market needs without major increases to its recurrent expenditure. Having serviced unemployed youth throughout its existence, the programme can also address a

diversified number of sub-groups comprising youths “at risk” (incarcerated young males and females, single teenage mothers, abandoned or street children, unemployable youths with skills or qualified youths unable to obtain jobs. In addition, the Company can also train unemployed adults, employees needing numeracy, literacy and communication training, employees needing skill upgrade training, and apprentices. The Company has also delivered customised training programmes to state agencies, non-governmental organisations and other similar groups.

- The use of teachers from the secondary school system to deliver technical and vocational training in certain industrial occupations proved ineffective when these teachers did not have a strong industrial background. Use of skilled personnel with industrial experience and exposure to “training of trainers” workshops proved to be more effective for the target group. Use of primary school teachers, however, to deliver modules in communication skills, numeracy and literacy has proven to be quite successful, especially the use of special educators.
- The change from a nine-month part-time programme of 240 contact hours to a six-month part-time training programme of the same duration was successful in reducing overall attrition.
- Shifting to modular based training permitted easier movement from one level of training to the other and exposed participants to a higher level of training than they would have been exposed to had they not attended YTEPP. Two major factors contributed to this: a) the lack of prerequisites for enrolment in basic classes and b) YTEPP’s focus on practical skills training. Because of their poor academic backgrounds, many of the trainees who benefited from the higher levels of training would not have qualified for acceptance in other training programmes.
- Partnerships have been critical to the success of the programme. Collaboration with the Ministry of Education facilitated access to plant, equipment, technical expertise and human resources. Partnerships with the state sector and private enterprise have generated interest free accommodation for training and administrative purposes, hands-on training for participants and instructors, exposure to international standards and procedures, technical expertise and funding.

- **The absence of regular labour market information was a major constraint to more effective course selection.**
- **The lack of any consistent financial and technical assistance for graduates of the business training programmes impacted on the success of the Entrepreneurial Development and Support Services sub-project. Most graduates in business relied on self-financing.**

2. INTRODUCTION

- 2.1 In 1988, the increasingly high unemployment rate of youths under 25 years of age prompted the establishment of the Youth Training and Employment Partnership Programme (YTEPP). During this period of economic and structural adjustment, there were significant barriers that affected the participation of youth in the Labour Force, particularly those students who did not successfully complete their secondary school education and school dropouts. While approximately twenty thousand (20,000) young persons exit the Secondary School System annually, in 1988 almost 100,000 young persons were either unemployed or out of the labour force. With initial government funding for two (2) years, the YTEPP was set up as a short-term social intervention to address the problem of youth unemployment and unemployability among individuals 15-25 years of age.
- 2.2 In August 1991, the Government of the Republic of Trinidad and Tobago (GORTT) entered into a Loan Agreement with the World Bank in the amount of US \$20.7 million to be utilised over a five (5) year period (1990-1995) to develop a more structured YTEPP. Co-financing for the Project was provided by the GORTT in the amount of US\$ 11.2 million, bringing the total funding available for implementation of the Education and Training for Youth Employment Project to US\$ 31.9 million.
- 2.3 The Implementation Agency for the Project was the Youth Training and Employment Partnership Programme Company Limited (YTEPP), established in October 1990 as a Limited Liability Company to function outside the normal administrative and bureaucratic confines and constraints of a government ministry.
- 2.4 The YTEPP Company with its own Board of Directors was mandated to develop a Programme to enhance youth employability and to assist in facilitating the entry of Youths into the Labour Market either through wage or self-employment.
- 2.5 The project duration of the YTEPP was initially for a period of five (5) years (1990-1995) and subsequently in late 1995, the GORTT successfully negotiated with the World Bank for a two-year (2) extension of project implementation (1996-1998). This extension did not involve any additional loan funding but rather utilisation of the remaining unspent balance in the approved project-operating budget.

3. WORLD BANK MID-TERM EVALUATION REVIEW

3.1 At its mid-term Evaluation Review, conducted in November 1994, the World Bank Mission assessed programme progress against the established criteria for success:

3.2 That the number of employed or self-employed graduates would be at least 1.5 times that of a control group, not having graduated from the YTEPP;

(1) That the earnings of the YTEPP graduates would be at least 20% greater than those of the Control group.

3.2 While concluding that the Project did not fully meet its original targets, the Mission acknowledged that the targets were either too ambitious or too stringent. Some of the significant findings it found emerging from the Tracer Study and other sources were:

- Participation in YTEPP increased the income of the lowest decile of income earners by (6%).
- Demand for training exceeded projections. Whereas the SAR projected that 37,000 applicants would have applied to YTEPP at the time of the Review, above 41,000 applicants had attended by that time.
- YTEPP graduates showed significant improvements in morale, motivation, numerical and literary skills.
- The Programme had received greater recognition by the National Examination Council (NEC) for its improvement in the quality of curricula.
- There was more organisational efficiency.
- The Company had developed effective data collection and research systems that provided timely relevant data.
- The Programme had motivated participants to pursue further training.

3.1 Bank Recommendations

3.1.1 In reviewing the key performance indicators of the YTEP Programme, the World Bank Mission identified critical areas that required immediate attention by the YTEPP Management, namely:

- High Trainee Attrition Rate.
- Low percentage of graduates obtaining jobs.
- Low percentage of graduates establishing small and micro- businesses.

- Courses to become more market driven and labour market oriented.
 - YTEPP to consider strategies for future sustainability including the introduction of training fees and the reduction of its trainee population from 10,000 to 5,000 annually.
 - YTEPP should consider the establishment of a Curriculum Unit to further develop and produce curriculum materials for use by and sale to other training organisations with a similar clientele. The quality of the training curricula was also to be reviewed.
 - Trainee-Instructor ratios should be adjusted to reflect the level indicated in the Staff Appraisal Report.
 - YTEPP's RED Unit should review its project activities to have a more strategic focus to provide key information for sound decision-making by YTEPP's Board and Management.
 - Policy issues and consultations with the Ministry of Education should be discussed at the highest level to enable the YTEP Programme to define its role and function within the Educational System of Trinidad and Tobago.
 - There should be greater collaboration between YTEPP and the Private and Public Sectors to forge partnership linkages for possible wage and self-employment opportunities for its graduates.
- 3.1.2 An important part of the conclusion of the Mid-Term-evaluation review Report was that while key pre-established performance targets were not met that this should not be interpreted to mean that there was failure in YTEPP's management of the Project. It was stated in the Review Report that YTEPP had made significant progress in its ability to plan and manage its programmes and that perhaps the performance targets set may have been too ambitious.
- 3.1.3 The most serious problems encountered in the implementation of the YTEP Programme were in the Post Training Assistance Component, namely, the Work Experience and Credit sub-components, administered by the National Training Board (NTB) and the Youth Enterprise Support System administered by the Small Business Development Corporation (SBDC), respectively.
- 3.1.4 The targets established to measure the success of the YTEPP Programme were the number of employed or self-employed graduates. However, the credit support for youth opting for self-employment through the YESS came to a halt in 1992, when YESS was terminated. In addition, the work-experience placement of YTEPP graduates by the NTB accounted for only 18% of the total number of YTEPP graduates who desired wage employment.
- 3.1.5 In light of the qualitative and quantitative benefits of the YTEP Programme, as clearly borne out by the Tracer studies conducted on the YTEPP participants, the Bank decided to continue with its disbursements and to recommend that the project be allowed to continue for another two years.

4 RESTRUCTURING OF YTEPP

- 4.1 In response to the major issues raised in the Mid-Term-Term Review conducted by the World Bank in late 1994, the YTEPP Board of Directors and Senior Management restructured operations to increase focus on quality and levels of curricula, efficiency and greater linkage with Industry.
- 4.2 Board Committees comprising Board members and executive directors revised strategy on programme operations, human resource management, finance and accounting, and public relations. Some of the programme shifts that resulted from these planning sessions were: **validation of training programmes, development of in-house curriculum development capacity, two cycles per annum, full-time training, contract training, greater linkage with Industry.**
- 4.3 As a result, revenue generation has increased as the Programme's services are increasingly sought for training programmes, apprenticeships, and graduates. The strengthening of the Entrepreneurial Development Support Service and Vocational Skills Departments improved the post-training support for the graduate and facilitated contract training.

5 PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION REVIEW

5.1 Original Project Objectives

- 5.1.1 In the World Bank Staff Appraisal Report (SAR, 1991) the four (4) principal project objectives stated are as follows:
 - to improve the quality and relevance of education and training for employment and self-employment provided by YTEPP through the development of curriculum, training of instructors and provision of equipment for training facilities and various training programmes;
 - to increase the opportunities offered to youth to acquire work experience in private enterprises or public agencies which will facilitate their first entry into the labour market;
 - to promote self-employment and small business training and the linking of a network of credit institutions capable of providing loans for small businesses;
and
 - to strengthen the management of the YTEP Programme to enhance the effectiveness of its training activities and capacity to programme, monitor, evaluate training and post-training support operations and their impact on employment.

5.1.2 In addition to the above-cited objectives, the World Bank stated that the specific issues facing the GORTT in implementing the Education and Training for Youth employment Project were namely:

- Improved career guidance and personal counselling for youth.
- Increased training in attitudinal development and basic literacy and numeracy.
- Improved training and support for self-employment.
- Improved quality and relevance of job skill training.
- Overcoming constraints on implementation of work experience and apprenticeships.
- Better labour market information to determine short-term training needs.

5.2 Project Start-up

5.2.1 In the early stages of project implementation, YTEPP experienced project delays as it embarked upon recruitment of suitable managerial staff to implement a more structured Programme. Procurement of equipment for the administrative and financial areas also took longer than expected, as project funding remained uncertain for many months.

5.2.2 Strategic goals and objectives were designed in keeping with the corporate vision of the company to reflect a more restructured and business oriented YTEPP. The Company's Mission Statement reads as follows:

YTEPP'S MISSION STATEMENT

"To excel in the provision of high quality, cost effective Human Resource Development programmes in skills and attitudes through well trained, motivated staff to enhance self esteem of our nation's youth and make them employable."

5.2.3 At the commencement of the Bank's funding programme (1991-1993), the major foci were staff recruitment and procurement of equipment. Other key project activities included strengthening of research and evaluation, development of appropriate curricula and training/instructional materials and development of an appropriate financial system to manage and disburse project funds.

5.2.4 In addition, fostering and developing relationships with private and public sectors and identifying training sites establishment were all necessary, but time consuming and costly.

5.2.5 The establishment of a Public Relations Unit to market and promote YTEPP's image, goals and objectives was deemed a priority issue. The need to market and promote YTEPP increased as the national economy continued to experience persistent negative growth in the early 1990s.

5.2.6 In 1992, there was a change in government during which the project experienced delays in receiving project funding which again affected timely project implementation. Continuous open dialogue with the Ministry of Education and the Ministry of Planning and Development helped to remove some of these constraints and the project regained its momentum.

5.3 Achievement of Project Objectives

YTEPP successfully achieved the two of its principal objectives that fell within its control; it did not fully achieve the other two that were not.

5.3.1 Improvement of Quality and Relevance of Education and Training — Achieved:

The quality and relevance of YTEPP's education and training for wage and self-employment have improved. A wealth of relevant and customised training syllabi and curriculum materials for both instructors and trainees for the three (3) Training Components have been developed and is available for production and sale. These materials were developed in consultation with experts from the industrial, business and other governmental agencies to reflect the changing Labour market trends.

5.3.2 The YTEPP training Package comprised three (3) training Components, each with its own sub-components namely:

1. Career Enhancement Component

- attitudinal development
- basic/remedial education

2. Vocational/Technical Skill Training Component

- fourteen occupational disciplines

3. Post-Training Assistance Component

- Work-Experience (Apprenticeship)
- Entrepreneurship and Micro-Enterprise Development

The integrated training package provided a range of life skills and job skills including preparation for the world of work, on-the job training/apprenticeship, counselling and career guidance, attitudinal development and business skills on

how to establish and manage a micro-enterprise.

- 5.3.3 During the period of World Bank funding YTEPP was able to standardise its curricula through the process described above and develop learning and teaching instruments. The syllabi have been modified and adjusted based on feedback from employers, trainers, and participants. The repeated requests for curricula from the Ministry of Education and other non-governmental training agencies point to the quality and relevance of the Programme's documentation.
- 5.3.4 Continuous upgrading of the technical and training skills of tutors has contributed to the improvement in quality and relevance. While the process is yet to be completed, significant improvements in output and impact have been observed in occupational areas such as secretarial skills, welding and fabrication, fabric design, family services, secretarial support services, numeracy and literacy, information processing, auto and diesel maintenance, electrical installation and food preparation. The development of the Employment Bureau and its expansion to accommodate requests from employers also attest to the Programme's quality and relevance.
- 5.3.5 Since 1988, the Programme has gone through thirteen (13) Cycles. Customised training was introduced in 1995 and was designed to suit the needs of the Employers who had requested this training.
- 5.3.6 The Ministry of Education has identified YTEPP as the premier **level I** (pre-craft) training institution in the country. The training services in Certified Welding and Pipefitting delivered to two Companies in the petrochemical sector also establish the quality and relevance of YTEPP's programmes to the current economic environment.
- 5.3.7 YTEPP training had a positive effect on trainee morale, motivation and attitudinal development. The Tracer Study (1996) revealed that 40% of YTEPP's graduates expressed their intention to pursue studies after YTEPP.
- 5.3.8 YTEPP's training succeeded in raising the literacy and numeracy scores of trainees, who initially scored low in these areas (*see Annex XI - Analysis of Literacy and Numeracy Tests*).

5.4 Strengthening of Management of YTEPP — Achieved

- 5.4.1 The YTEPP Programme commenced in 1988. However, in 1991 the GORTT established YTEPP LTD, with the assistance of loan funds from the World Bank, to develop a more structured organisation. Key managerial staff was recruited so that YTEPP could benefit from their private sector experience in developing its corporate goals and objectives.

- 5.4.2 The Company conducted Strategic Planning Workshops to sensitise managerial staff to the goals and vision of the YTEPP. Senior managers also benefited from management training conducted by Human Resource specialists.
- 5.4.3 A financial management system was developed and staff recruited to provide accounting and auditing functions required in the smooth operations of the YTEPP Programme. The Finance and Accounts Department submitted annual financial reports to the Ministries of Education and Finance and the World Bank on project expenditures and disbursements.
- 5.4.4 Capability in procurement of equipment and consumables and resources to implement training was developed during project implementation.
- 5.4.5 YTEPP has succeeded in strengthening its senior managerial staff in the areas of research and data collection in the management of field operations of large scale centre-based and community-based programmes.

5.5 Work Experience Opportunities for Graduates — *Not Fully Achieved*

- 5.5.1 Originally designed to increase the opportunities offered to youth to acquire work experience or apprenticeships, YTEPP included a Work Experience sub-project that sought to gain placement in industry and other forms of employment. Following discussions with the National Training Board, YTEPP referred its trainees to the latter for job placements.

This objective was not fully met mainly due to the National Training Board's inability to place the number of trainees it agreed to place in the contractual relationship with YTEPP. The period 1988-1993/ 1994, was a period of negative growth (see Figure V in Annex), which probably accounted for the low levels of placements made by the NTB.

- 5.5.2 In response to this low placement, the YTEPP Company established its own Employment Bureau. This Bureau has assisted in securing work experience and job placements for the Programme's graduates through its Partnership linkages with Industry, Commerce and governmental Agencies.

Over the last six (6) years, the Employment Bureau and the Public Relations Department have increased partnership linkages in their efforts to obtain job placements for graduates.

5.6 Self Employment Opportunities for Graduates — *Not Fully Achieved:*

- 5.6.1 Like the Work Experience component discussed above, the micro-entrepreneurial component of the Entrepreneurial Development and Support Services Project underachieved because of the absence of an effective institutional framework. The original programme design included financial and technical support by the

Small Business Development Company (SBDC) for graduates of the Project.

- 5.6.2 The Youth Enterprise and Support Systems (YESS) Project was established within the SBDC to support the efforts of young micro-entrepreneurs through guarantee funding and technical assistance. The early demise of this Project eliminated the only support mechanism specifically set up to address graduates of YTEPP and other programmes.
- 5.6.3 To address this constraint the EDSS department reorganised itself to provide more support for its participants. Three new posts were added to the Department. A **Business Development Officer** assisted graduates in the preparation of business plans for use in seeking credit from a number of credit institutions (Fund-Aid, SBDC, Credit Unions, ADB, Commercial Banking Institutions). A **Support Services Officer** facilitated workshops and lectures on relevant topics and assisted with the mounting of Craft Exhibitions to showcase and promote products and services the graduates. The Company also employed a **Field Project Officer** to visit and monitor the status and progress of graduate entrepreneurs, advising them, wherever and whenever possible, on their needs and deficiencies in operating a viable business.
- 5.6.4 The results of these efforts have been encouraging (see **project results** in Annex), however, many of the successful entrepreneurs have had to rely mainly on self and family financing to survive and grow. While the Fundaid organisation has funded some YTEPP graduates, it does not provide the scope and range of services envisaged for YESS.

6. SUMMARY OF PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION CONSTRAINTS

- 6.1 The discontinuation during project implementation of key governmental support systems designed to assist the YTEPP's graduates seeking wage and self-employment adversely affected the Project's achieving success in the Post-Assistance Training Component. These Agencies have now been discontinued and are presented as follows:
- The Youth Enterprise Support System (YESS), which would have offered a range of business development services, including the extension of credit by the Small Business Development Company (SBDC) to potential entrepreneurs between 15-30 years;
 - The Labour Information System (LMIS), which was designed to collect, analyse and disseminate information needed by both training and employment organisations in planning their education and training activities in light of Labour market conditions and prospects;
 - The Apprenticeship for Industrial Mobilisation (AIM) which was developed to provide immediate short-term employment for substantial numbers of skilled,

trained, unemployed youths (15-25). The AIM Programme was later replaced by the National Apprenticeship Scheme (NAS) under the management of the National Training Board (NTB) of the Ministry of Education.

- 6.2 Use of school plant proved to be both positive and disadvantageous. Access to plant and some equipment reduced capital costs and cost of training; however, the Principals' insistence that teaching staff must come from the school within which the YTEPP centre was located restricted the selection of personnel to available teachers.
- 6.3 Access to plant and equipment in schools also became problematic when Principals, for one reason or the other, restricted YTEPP personnel from workshops, kitchens, or model offices.
- 6.4 An assessment of the problem of attrition revealed that trainee attrition was primarily due to the availability of short-term temporary job opportunities provided by other governmental programmes such as the Unemployment Relief Programme (URP) and the Civilian Conservation Corps (CCC).
- 6.5 The negative growth of the Economy over the life of the project implementation was a critical factor in the low absorption of YTEPP's graduates in the Labour Market.
- 6.6 Changes in the political directorate impacted on the implementation of the Project, as each new administration felt the need to review the Programme.
- 6.7 The intense construction activity in the South/Central areas of the country made it difficult to attract skilled personnel for the construction related areas.

7. INITIATIVES FOR PROJECT SUSTAINABILITY

- 7.1 In 1996, the YTEPP Company Limited launched a new strategic direction to lay the path for sustainability'. Having assessed the changing socio-economic environment, and the need for more revenue creation, the Company introduced fee-based training, initially geared to the Construction sector, to complement its mainstream programmes. Later, customised training, and apprenticeship programmes were offered to both the private and public sectors.
- 7.2 In its strategic plan, the organisation determined that its main target group, unemployed youth, would continue to need subsidised training, and developed strategies to provide this training more effectively and efficiently. It also decided, however, that it could generate revenue by providing fee-based training services to a wider population.

7.3 The following strategies have been implemented during the two-(2) year project extension: (see Figure II in Annex).

- The introduction of modular based training at two levels, namely Level I (pre-craft) which can be described as “supply-driven” and Level II (craft) which can be described as “demand-driven”. The shift to this type of training enabled YTEPP to better respond to the needs of the Private Sector.
- The introduction of two (2) six-month training cycles instead of one nine month cycle achieved stated objective of reducing trainee attrition.
- The establishment of closer links with the private and public sectors enabled YTEPP to more effectively market its services.
- Continuous revision and improvement of curricula and trainers.
- Introduction of full time centres in collaboration with selected industrial and business organisations and NGO’s to produce a more qualified graduate.
- Closer collaboration with other training organisations to identify and reduce areas of duplication of training efforts.
- The validation and certification of all training programmes by the National Examinations Council (NEC) of the Ministry of Education.

8. BANK PERFORMANCE

8.1 The Bank’s performance during the evolution and implementation of the YTEPP Project was satisfactory. The Bank staff members, during their annual supervision missions, provided technical and financial guidance to the GORTT and the Implementing Agency, YTEPP, in a professional and cordial manner. The Bank’s staff members were always willing to share their knowledge and expertise gained from other developing as well as developed countries in an effort to clarify or assist the GORTT in the implementation of the project. They also maintained flexibility when delays were encountered and assisted the project team to get back on track. The technical guidance and assistance provided by the Bank during project implementation assisted the staff’s development of monitoring and project management capabilities. The Borrower and the Implementing Agency enjoyed the cordial and professional relationship of the staff members of the Bank, who remained accessible in providing technical advice, whenever it was needed.

8.2 The Bank’s supervisory missions were adequate and timely and the advice provided was always well considered by the GORTT and implemented, whenever feasible. The Bank also assisted in advising the GORTT and the YTEPP in matters relating to disbursement and procurement.

9. BORROWER'S PERFORMANCE

- 9.1 The GORTT is fully aware of the constraints experienced in the implementation of such a large-scale training project as YTEPP and views the implementation of the programme in light of the overall project results and project achievements, as highly satisfactory. Key project objectives were achieved except for those areas that were affected by external circumstances outside the control of YTEPP.

State institutions such as the NTB, AIM, YESS, and the SBDC which were designed in the original project to provide the necessary support for YTEPP graduates to obtain work experience and access to credit to become self employed did not function as intended. The Ministry of Education assisted in the facilitation of the delivery of the YTEPP programme throughout the country as forty-two (42) of its school physical plants was utilised by YTEPP as training venues, after normal school hours.

During the early stages of project implementation, the YTEPP experienced some delays that were as a result of a change in Government and changes in the Board of Directors. At this same period of change, uncertainty as to the continuation and future of YTEPP adversely affected the credibility of the Company. Funding had to be allocated to mount a widespread promotion of the company's goals, objectives and corporate Mission, which proved effective but expensive.

Throughout the entire project duration, the GORTT remained committed to the funding of the YTEPP programme.

10. PROJECT COST AND FINANCING

- 10.1 Total project cost for project implementation including procurement of equipment and administrative costs amounted to US\$ 31.9 million, of which the World Bank loan was US \$20.7 million (65%) and the GORTT's counterpart funding was US\$ 11.2 million (35%). Further details on the project cost and financing of the various project components are described in *Annexes XIII and XIV*.

11. KEY FINDINGS AND LESSONS LEARNED

- 11.1 Unemployment derived from a lack of skills or inappropriate skills can be reversed for socially vulnerable groups through programmes that combine vocational training, life skill training, self-development training, and entrepreneurial training. YTEPP's tracer studies have demonstrated the Programme's impact on the employment, earnings and behaviour of graduates and their favourable labour market performance, when compared to that of their peers. However, the absence of a well-developed institutional framework reduced the effectiveness of the Programme.
- 11.2 Communication skills seem to be as critical as technical skills for young entrants to the labour market. YTEPP's graduates in the survey indicated that the Career Enhancement training was more influential in their obtaining jobs than their vocational skills. This finding emphasises the wide gap existing between the knowledge and skills of secondary school graduates and the expectations of employers.
- 11.3 While the Programme attracted its stated target group and successfully enhanced its marketability, recruitment, selection and supervision of trainers and supervisors remain major challenges. Training of trainers will continue to be a major cost item for the Programme as it attempts to build its cadre of appropriate personnel.
- 11.4 Research and Evaluation were critical to the success of the Project. The Research and Evaluation Unit throughout the life of the Project provided analyses and information that facilitated decision making.
- 11.5 The socio-economic conditions that gave rise to the establishment of the YTEPP as a social intervention for youth unemployment still persist in 1998. YTEPP has developed significant competencies within the organisation and can now deliver customised training packages to other groups. These may fall within the broad categories of uneducated and skilled, uneducated and unskilled, and educated and unskilled, inclusive of women, retrenched workers, retired workers, prison inmates and workers in need of upgrade training.
- 11.6 The market for training has expanded. Positive economic growth has stimulated demand for skills that are in short supply. Established training institutions have been unable to adjust to satisfy this demand for trained workers. YTEPP is well poised, because of its strong partnership linkages, its flexibility and its autonomy, to take advantage of these opportunities.
- 11.7 YTEPP has emerged as a national leader in the areas of micro-entrepreneurial training, attitudinal development training in life skills and basic/remedial education, curriculum development and the production of learning and

instructional materials.

- 11.8 The decision to set up YTEPP as a Limited Liability Company proved to be an excellent one as it empowered the Board of Directors to focus on its mandate to enhance the employability of out of school, unemployed youth. The structure facilitated quick decision making and accountability.
- 11.9 Originally placed in the Ministry of Youth and Sports, YTEPP's re-location to the Ministry of Education facilitated access to equipment, plant and personnel.
- 11.10 On completion of World Bank funding, the role of the Board of Directors of YTEPP must be clearly defined and agreed upon between YTEPP and the GORTT so that the YTEPP can indeed function as earlier envisaged, outside the constraints and bureaucracy of the public service.
- 11.11 The success of the management of the YTEPP was in large measure due to the commitment and loyalty of its staff and the centralisation of its financial and administrative systems. These systems can be shared with other programmes that will fall under the National Training Agency (NTA), when this institution is created in the near future.

12. FUTURE OPERATIONS

- 12.1 In June 1998, the Cabinet re-assigned YTEPP to the newly created Ministry of Information, Communication, Training, and Distance Learning. This Ministry is now responsible for co-ordinating all training programmes and will also house the National Training Agency when it comes on stream in October 1998.
- 12.2 As it positions itself as the main provider of Level I & II training programmes, YTEPP Ltd has redefined its corporate objectives in its Strategic Plan 1998 – 2000 as follows:

To provide trainees with quality training that will enable them to meet the standards set by their particular trades in the production of goods and services.

- 12.3 In pursuit of these objectives, the company has developed a nineteen (19) point action plan to address specific needs. Some of these activities have already been implemented and some are being implemented in cycle XIV and beyond. Each heading has a number of activities attached. For the purposes of this report only the headings have been included. Further details can be derived from the document cited above.
 - The need to establish reason for YTEPP's continued existence
 - The need to align YTEPP to G.O.T.T. objectives and emerging Labour Market

requirements.

- The need to review the existing target groups
- The need to enhance YTEPP's image and credibility of Programmes
- The need to develop criteria to target and measure YTEPP's success
- The need to maximise performance output of available human resource
- The need to restructure the organisation to pursue emerging strategic direction
- The need to address the issue of the Board's Authority
- The need for structural support for shift towards full time centres
- The need to rationalise location of training venues and nature of course offerings
- The need for enhanced logistics planning and management
- The need for enhanced information, research and evaluation functions
- The need for enhanced support services
- The need for expanded curriculum development unit
- The need to review existing systems and processes to ensure more efficient response to client's needs
- The need to resolve issues impacting on the quality of human resource output
- The need to ensure that technological systems contribute effectively to value added
- The need for more effective management of the use of assets and facilities
- The need to improve the quality of information systems hardware to facilitate effective managerial decision making.

GENERAL REFERENCES

- Assistant Commissioner of Police (Crime): Trinidad and Tobago, Report on Youth Involvement in Crimes (15-25): Minor Offences, Minor Crimes, and Serious Crimes, Commissioner's Office, March 1998.
- Campbell T. Donald, Stanley C. Julian: Experimental and Quasi- Experimental Designs for Research, Houghton Mifflin Company Boston (1963).
- C. S.O. (1993), Continuous Sample Survey of Population: Labour Force Report, Office of the Prime Minister. Central Statistical Office, 1995, pgs. 9, 102-104.
- C. S.O. (1996), Continuous Sample Survey of Population: Labour Force Report, Office of the Prime Minister. Central Statistical Office, (1997), pgs. 1,7, 94-96.
- Ministry of Social Development: The Determination and Measurement of Poverty in Trinidad and Tobago: Indications from the 1992 Survey of Living Conditions, Ministry of Social Development (1996).
- Morris Lyons Lynn: How to communicate Evaluation Findings, Sage Publications 1987.

WORLD BANK DOCUMENTS

- Bedi Singh Arjun, Newman John, Rawlings Laura (The World Bank), Bowrin Leslie (YTEPP), The Effect Of Trinidad and Tobago's Youth Training and Employment Partnership on Graduates Earnings. World Bank /YTEPP, September 1994, pg. 6.
- Newman John, Gertler Paul and Laura Rawlings: Evaluating Social Sector Programs in Developing Countries: A case for Opportunistic Randomization, World Bank (1993).
- World Bank, Trinidad and Tobago Poverty and Unemployment in an Oil Based Economy, World Bank (1995).
- World Bank, Mid Term Review, Republic of Trinidad and Tobago, Education and Training For Youth Employment Project. World Bank Dec. 1994.
- World Bank (1991) Staff Appraisal Report of the Youth Training and Employment Partnership Programme.
- World Bank Supervision Mission Reports (1988-).

YTEPP DOCUMENTS

- Bowrin Leslie Mr. : Report on Tracer Study of YTEPP's Second Cycle Graduates (1989 –1990) Research, Evaluation and Documentation Unit, (Dec. 1993). Pg. 2, 16, 17, 27.
- Bowrin Leslie Mr.: Report on the 1996 Tracer Study, Department of Programme Operations, 1997.
- Brown Deryck : YTEPP Beyond 1998 (A Position Paper)
- Sampson Madonna Ms.: Profile of Applicants and Graduates Cycle IV (1991-1992), Research, Evaluation and Documentation Unit (Feb. 1994), pgs. 8, 31.
- Sampson Madonna Ms.: Profile of Applicants and Graduates Cycle III, (1990-1991), Research Evaluation and Documentation Unit. (March 1993).
- Sampson Madonna Ms.: Feedback Report on Trainees' Perception Cycle IV, (1991-1992) Research Evaluation and Documentation Unit, March 1994.
- Youth Training and Employment Partnership Programme: Proposal For YTEPP To Continue And Utilize "Unused Funds" For A Three (3) Year Period, (1996-1998) June 1995.
- Youth Training and Employment Partnership Programme : Strategic Plan 1998-2000
- Youth Training and Employment Partnership Programme (YTEPP) Limited. 1994, Annual Report. (August 1992- December 1993, Cycle V and Cycle VI- Phase I). Youth Training and Employment Partnership Programme, February 1994.
- Youth Training and Employment Partnership Programme: YTEPP's Mid -Term Report Draft III, Youth Training and Employment Programme, October 1994.
- Youth Training and Employment Partnership Programme (YTEPP) Limited. Statistical Report Cycle XI Phase I- January 1997. Research, Evaluation and Documentation Unit.
- Youth Training and Employment Partnership Programme (YTEPP) Limited. Statistical Report Cycle XI Phase II- June 1997. Research, Evaluation and Documentation Unit.

MAP SECTION

