Document of
The World Bank

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY

Report No: 24023

IMPLEMENTATION COMPLETION REPORT
(SCL-39700; IDA-28040)

ON A

LOAN AND CREDIT

IN THE AMOUNT OF US$7.6 MILLION

TO THE GOVERNMENT OF

GRENADA

FOR A

GD- BASIC EDUCATION REFORM PROJECT

04/18/2002

CURRENCY EQUIVALENTS

(Exchange Rate Effective - March 31, 2002)

Currency Unit = Eastern Caribbean Dollars (EC)
EC 1 = US$ 0.37
US$ 1 = EC 2.70

FISCAL YEAR

January 1 December 31

ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS

BERP	Basic Education Reform Project
CAS	Country Assistance Strategy
CDB	Caribbean Development Bank
CDU	Curriculum Development Unit
CEE	Common Entrance Examination
CXC	Caribbean Examinations Council
DFID	Department for International Development
EMU	Educational Materials Unit
EXT	Educational Testing and Examinations Unit
GOG	Government of Grenada
ICR	Implementation Completion Report
MCT	Minimum Competency Test
MOE	Ministry of Education
OECS	Organization of Easter Caribbean States
PMU	Project Management Unit
SAASS	St. Andrew's Anglican Secondary School
SAR	Staff Appraisal Report
SAMU	School Administration and Management Unit
SDR	Special Drawing Rights
SLE	School Leaving Examination
SPEED	Strategic Plan for Education Enhancement and Development
TAMCC	T.A. Marryshow Community College
UWI	University of West Indies

Vice President:	David de Ferranti
Country Director:	Orsalia Kalantzopoulos
Sector Director:	Ana Maria Arriagada
Task Team Leader/Task Manager:	Cynthia Hobbs

GRENADA
GD- BASIC EDUCATION REFORM PROJECT

CONTENTS

Project ID: P043923	*Project Name:* GD- BASIC EDUCATION REF
Team Leader: Cynthia Hobbs	*TL Unit:* LCSHE
ICR Type: Core ICR	*Report Date: May 1, 2002*

1. Project Data

Name: GD- BASIC EDUCATION REF
L/C/TF Number: SCL-39700; IDA-28040
Country/Department: GRENADA
Region: Latin America and Caribbean Region
Sector/subsector: EP - Primary Education

KEY DATES

			Original	*Revised/Actual*
PCD: 02/23/1994		*Effective:*	05/28/1996	06/13/1996
Appraisal: 06/19/1995		*MTR:*	09/30/1998	11/30/1998
Approval: 12/21/1995		*Closing:*	06/30/2001	12/31/2001

Borrower/Implementing Agency: GOVERNMENT OF GRENADA/MINISTRY OF EDUCATION
Other Partners:

STAFF	Current	At Appraisal
Vice President:	David De Ferranti	Javed Burki
Country Manager:	Orsalia Kalantzopoulos	Paul Iseman
Sector Manager:	Ana-Maria Arriagada	Julian F. Schweitzer
Team Leader at ICR:	Cynthia Hobbs	Ralph Romain
ICR Primary Author:	M. Rosa Puech	

2. Principal Performance Ratings

(HS=Highly Satisfactory, S=Satisfactory, U=Unsatisfactory, HL=Highly Likely, L=Likely, UN=Unlikely, HUN=Highly Unlikely, HU=Highly Unsatisfactory, H=High, SU=Substantial, M=Modest, N=Negligible)

Outcome: S
Sustainability: L
Institutional Development Impact: SU
Bank Performance: S
Borrower Performance: S

	QAG (if available)	ICR
Quality at Entry:		S
Project at Risk at Any Time:	Yes	

3. Assessment of Development Objective and Design, and of Quality at Entry

3.1 Original Objective:

The overall project goal was to accelerate human resource development so that the requisite manpower could be produced to support the sought economic transition. The project objectives were to: (a) strengthen the planning and institutional capacity of the Ministry of Education (MOE) to guide and carry out the long-term development of the sector, while enabling it to initiate urgent measures to address system-wide qualitative problems and expansion needs at the primary and secondary levels; and (ii) serve as a catalyst for a major adjustment process, focused on moving toward more reasonable primary and secondary teacher/student ratios, in line with ratios of countries in similar economic and social circumstances.

The specific project objectives were: (i) to strengthen management in the sector, as well as educational planning and central planning; (ii) to improve the quality of basic education; and (iii) to expand access to secondary education and rehabilitate primary and secondary school facilities.

3.2 Revised Objective:

No revisions were made to project objectives.

3.3 Original Components:

The total project costs were estimated at US$9.9 million equivalent (US$3.8 million loan and SDR2.60 million credit or US$3.80 million equivalent and a Government's contribution of US$2.3 million). The project comprised three main components and several subcomponents:

Component 1: Strengthening Management and Planning (US$1.17 million equivalent or 19 percent of total base cost). This component would support the MOE's efforts to review and rationalize the use of existing human and financial resources and improve the efficiency in guiding the education system by providing fellowships, expert advice, office space, furniture, equipment, supplies, vehicles and policy studies in the areas of: (i) financial management; (ii) educational planning and (iii) project management and development.

Component 2: Qualitative Improvement of Basic Education (US$2.2 million equivalent or 26 percent of total base cost). This component aimed to build permanent institutional capacity to promote quality improvement and to monitor and diagnose problems with regard to education quality by financing investments in the areas of: (i) teacher training; (ii) school supervision; (iii) curriculum development; (iv) educational materials; and (v) educational testing and measurement.

Component 3: Expansion of Access to Schools (US$4.7 million equivalent or 55 percent of total base costs). This component would allow for the expansion of access to basic education by:

1. increasing secondary places in the most under-served districts, by constructing one new secondary school in Westerhall in St. Davis and expanding and improving an existing one, St. Andrew's Anglican Secondary School in Telescope, St. Andrews;
2. replacing two existing primary schools: St. John's R.C. in Gouyave (St. John's) and St. Theresa R.C. in Vincennes (St. Davis);
3. assisting in the rehabilitation of selected primary and secondary schools with urgent needs and provision of furniture and equipment; and
4. training selected school staff in preventive maintenance and mobilization of community support for maintenance.

3.4 Revised Components:

None of the components were revised.

3.5 Quality at Entry:

SATISFACTORY. The BERP responded to a Government request to the Bank to assist Grenada in its efforts to reform the education system. The project benefited from substantial preparation and in-depth discussions on the project development objectives between the Government, the Caribbean Development Bank (CDB) and the World Bank staff. Consistency with regional priorities in education reform strategies was sought during the preparation period as well as alignment with Government priorities. The decision to focus on the basic education cycle (grades 1 to 9) was in accordance with regional discussions in 1992-93. The actual content of the project was designed by the World Bank and the Government during February-October 1995. The project was in accordance with the objectives of the CAS of April 1995.

The project's development objective was relevant, since the project was seen as a first step in the human resource development process in Grenada. The project design was appropriate, though challenging for a Ministry with little experience in implementing a Bank-financed project. This was coupled with the scarcity of specialized human resources qualified to implement the project. These factors impacted heavily on project implementation over the years. In this context, the phasing of project activities was too front-loaded, especially in the fellowship and civil works components. As indicated in the SAR, around 62% of project expenditures were scheduled for the first eighteen months of the project. This was unrealistic, since a PMU had to be created and trained.

4. Achievement of Objective and Outputs

4.1 Outcome/achievement of objective:

The achievement of the project's objectives is rated **Satisfactory** based on the following outcomes:

- Strengthened management in the education sector to improve efficiency, measured by the reorganization of the MOE; improved teacher/student ratios in primary and secondary; reduction in the percentage of budgetary resources used for salary expenditure and reductions in repetition and drop-out rates;

- Improved education quality, measured by increments in the passing scores in the regional standardized tests in the four core areas (Mathematics, Language Arts, Social Studies and Science); availability of textbooks and learning materials; and the use of new teaching techniques; and

- Greater access to education as measured by increased enrollment in secondary education.

Strengthening Management in the Education Sector

By improving the planning and institutional capacity of the MOE, the project had a significant impact on the efficiency of the education sector.

Reorganization of the MOE: The MOE created and/or strengthened several units in key areas: materials production, project management, educational testing and exams, educational planning and statistics, and curriculum. With the exception of the Educational Planning Unit (EPU), these units were adequately staffed and operational by project closing. The MOE has made the necessary representation with the Public Service Commission to identify and hire appropriate candidates by the first quarter of 2002 to fill the vacant positions in the EPU. Senior personnel of the MOE have been trained in educational planning, statistics and educational policy, three people in the Ministry of Finance have been trained in social sector planning. In addition, the PMU has been fully institutionalized within the MOE. During the last five years, in the education system there have been more structured policy formulation and increased participatory approaches in policy development.

The main achievements in planning are: (i) the successful completion by the MOE of a long term development plan for the education sector (Strategic Plan for Education Enhancement and Development - SPEED), which will be the backbone for the preparation of a follow-up project supported by the Bank and the Department for International Development (DFID); (ii) the production of a Statistical Digest (1998-2001); and (iii) initiation of the development of an integrated data system (not fully completed by project closing).

Efficiency: Some indicators selected to measure efficiency (teacher/student ratio and percentage of budget used for salary expenditure) point to a slower than projected improvement in this area. The teacher/student ratio at primary level went from 1:27 in 1994/95 to 1:25 in 2000/01, falling short of the target (1:29). This could be explained by a faster than expected reduction in the primary school population across all parishes (total enrollment in primary schools was 22,600 students in 1994/95 as per SAR, versus 19,134 in 2000/01). The reduction in the number of teachers (from 837 at project start to 765 at project closing) was not as fast, falling short of the target (688 teachers in primary). Only 12 percent of the primary schools had reached the 1:29 target, while in the others it ranged from 1:16 to 1:28. The teacher/student ratio in secondary went from 1:19 in 1994/95 to 1:23 in 2001, slightly lower than targeted in the SAR (1:23.5). Around 11 percent of secondary schools achieved the target, while in 50 percent of them, the ratio is between 1:16 to 1:22 and in 39 percent, it varies from 1:24 to 1:28. The teacher/student ratios seem to be the result of the evolution of enrollment rather than a deliberate action by the MOE. Only recently has the MOE initiated a policy to reach the desired targets, including mechanisms to ensure that the principals are taking the necessary actions at school level.

The project intended to have a catalytic role in the reallocation of resources towards more resources for management strengthening, educational materials and maintenance. At present, the data for school maintenance and instructional materials are not calculated. It is expected that in the coming months, the Financial Management analyst will address these information needs to inform policy decisions. The available data on expenditure on salaries and related expenditures indicate that the target of 90 percent of total expenditure has been reached for secondary (only 88.50 percent now spent on salaries) but not for primary (94.83 percent) *(see Annex 1)*.

School efficiency indicators have improved since 1995, as shown in Table 1 below:

Table 1 - School Efficiency Indicators for 1994/5 and 2000/01 (in percent)

Efficiency Indicators	Base Line Year	Target	End of Project Year (2000/01)
Primary Repetition rates	11.2%	8.96%	5.2%
Secondary Repetition rates	11.6%	9.28%	1.3%
Primary Drop out rates	n.a.	n.a	0.7%
Secondary Drop out rates	n.a.	n.a	1.1%

Qualitative Improvement of Basic Education

To measure the improvement in quality, the project selected the Common Entrance Exam (CEE) and Caribbean Examination Council (CXC) exam results as indicators. It is important to highlight that these exams traditionally have been used for selection purposes and were not analyzed to assess learning achievements. During the project, efforts were made to start using these exams as a diagnostic tool to monitor learning and to improve quality. In addition, the MOE administered, for the first time, in 1999, a Minimum Competency Test (MCT) for Grade 4 students in Language Arts and Mathematics. The test was designed to determine whether the students at that grade level had acquired the necessary knowledge and skills as outlined in the prescribed curriculum. Overall the test scores have been poor, indicating that the majority of students have not acquired an acceptable level of knowledge and skills as outlined in the curriculum.

The CEE is administered at the end of Grade 6. Eligibility for the CEE is based on age and grade level attained rather than on performance or achievement in class administered tests. Before 1997, the test's purpose was to act as a selection mechanism to allocate places in secondary schools to students 11 to 13 years of age. Since 1997, it is being used as a quality assessment mechanism as well. The test covers four core areas: Mathematics, Language Arts, Social Studies and Science. The results are not conclusive. The mean CEE scores for English and Mathematics worsened in 1999 and 2000 from their 1998 level, improving in the year 2001. The percentage of students assigned to secondary schools in relation to the number of students who sat for the examination increased from 44 percent in 1996 to 50 percent in 2001.

The CXC examination is regional and is applied at the end of secondary school (Form 5). Generally, performance has improved, measured by the percentage of passes (52.5 percent in 1995; 62.7 in 1998 and 66 percent in 2001). The percentage of students who obtained four passes increased from 35 percent in 1998 to nearly 51 percent in 2001. There are significant differences between subjects (while over 90 percent passed integrated science and information technology, only 23 percent passed Mathematics and 32 percent passed Chemistry). As shown in the table below, the percentage of students who passed four subjects in 2001, including English and Mathematics (12.3 percent) was significantly less than the percentage who passed four subjects in general (50.4 percent).

Table 2 - CXC Examination Results – Percentage of Students

	1995	1998	2001
Percentage of students passing at least 4 subjects.	n.a	n.a	50.4
Percentage of students passing at least 4 subjects, including English	n.a	35	41.8
Percentage of students passing at least 4 subjects, including English and Mathematics	n.a	n.a	12.3

Table 3 - CXC Examination Subjects Ranked according to Pass Percentages in Public Secondary Schools

Subject Passes	1996	2001
Integrated Science	92.5	90.2
Information Technology	42.9	92.3
Social Studies	87.7	80.4
English	44.2	56.9
Mathematics	39.5	23.7
Chemistry	35.4	32.8

There is greater availability of textbooks and instructional materials in the schools. Improvements were perceived in teachers' knowledge of the curriculum and the use of different teaching techniques. More work needs to be done to broaden and deepen these incipient achievemens through hands-on training and technical assistance in the classroom to help teachers translate the new skills acquired through training.

Expansion of Access to Schools

Increase in enrollment at the secondary level: At the primary school level, absolute enrollment numbers have decreased, in line with a decrease of population in primary school-age children over the last few years. Net enrollment rates have remained at the same levels during the life of the project (94-96%). Absolute enrollment numbers in secondary schools have gone from 7,417 in 1995 to 9,699 in 2000, an increment of over 6 percent per year. Gross enrollment rates have increased from 67 percent in 1995 to 88 percent in 2001. Transition rates have improved from 41 percent in 1996 to 46 percent in 2001. The project aimed at increasing access for secondary level outside of Saint Georges (in St. Davis and in St. Andrews). The project created 315 new enrollment spaces with construction of the new Westerhall school in St Davis. Due to delays in start up and higher than expected costs, the actual number of places was lower than the 525 projected, though it laid the infrastructure for future expansion.

Improved learning environments: Learning environments have improved in the two replaced primary schools. Classes have separate classrooms, the physical environment is safe and clean, there is less noise in the school compound, there are facilities for the staff, and the general environment is more sanitary than in the old buildings. In the refurbished schools, the works made a positive impact, but the extent of this impact varied depending upon the quality and the scope of the work.

Maintenance policy: The project fell short in this particular activity. A draft maintenance policy has been completed and it is pending approval.

4.2 Outputs by components:

Component 1. Strengthening management and planning
ICR Rating: **Satisfactory**

After some delays in execution, this component was successful in strengthening key areas in the MOE, laying the ground to improve management, planning and productivity.

Analysis by sub-component:

1.1 Senior Management: This subcomponent achieved its targets as indicated in the SAR *(see Annex 1)*. It supported the MOE's efforts to reorganize the Ministry, train its key senior managers, provide expert services, carry out study tours and build new facilities. An audit of the organization and management of the MOE was finalized by August 2000 and the MOE has been adopting some of the main recommendations. As foreseen in the SAR, study tours for two senior staff (Permanent Secretary and the Chief Education Officer at the time) were carried out. However, these persons are no longer working at the MOE.

A new building for the Ministry of Education to accommodate its staff was completed in the second half of 2001, and all staff, including the new units, had moved in by project completion. The new building has had a positive impact on staff morale and productivity. It has provided the necessary infrastructure for the new units to work more effectively and use the equipment and resources provided under the project; such is the case for the Education Materials Unit. Nevertheless, the construction of the new building was seriously delayed, causing significant cost overruns that were met by the Government (see section 5.4). The delays and cost overruns were due to a site change, significant changes in structural design as a result of this and unanticipated excavation work to prepare the site for construction.

1.2 Financial Management: The project provided support to train a financial analyst to improve efficiency in the education sector. The MOE staff member undertook a one year fellowship to receive advanced training in financial management and analysis and efficiency studies. However she took the training much later than planned, due to her responsibilities in the Planning Unit, and assumed her position as financial analyst just six months before the project closing. As a result, there was little progress in establishing a system for collection and analysis of data on allocation of resources. Improvements in the budget format to track expenditures and allocation of resources to schools or others did not materialize before project closing. So, too, was the case for incorporating financial analysis to the MOE operations.

1.3 Planning: The project partially met the targets established in the SAR. The project successfully created a new Education Planning and Statistics Unit within the MOE. A long term education sector plan (SPEED) was finalized just before project completion and now provides the Government of Grenada (GOG) with the basis for seeking support from the international donor community to carry out the objectives of the sector reform plan. It will lay the groundwork for the preparation of the new education project with the Bank and DFID. Though its preparation took much longer than projected in the SAR (the long term development plan was supposed to cover 1996-2000, while it was actually concluded in December 2001 for 2002-2010), the preparation process was participatory. The project also succeeded in establishing the foundation for an integrated education data system. A first Statistical Digest was produced in 1997, and upgraded later to correct some data. A new version for 1998-2001 was finalized just after project closing. Additionally, all the Unit's staff were trained in data management. A new statistician was hired during the last year of the project, and significant progress was made during that time to improve data collection, processing and analysis. However, the statistician still requires training in statistics and the use of appropriate software.

The project provided three fellowships for Ministry of Finance personnel (one in economic planning and two in social sector planning) to strengthen the national macro-economic planning capacity to improve the linkage with the between national and education planning. All three fellows now occupy senior positions in the Ministry of Finance (Permanent Secretary, Head of the Project Development and Cooperation Unit and Project Officer in the European Development Fund). Despite improvements, there is a need to further strengthen the linkages between national and sectoral planning through deeper and closer involvement of the fellows into daily issues relevant to the education sector. Under the project, school management personnel received training on educational planning principles. The training was highly valued and there is need for more.

One of the main concerns is that the senior planner was promoted to the position of acting Chief Education Officer (CEO), and a new planner had not been hired by project closing. The absence of this key figure has seriously hampered the effectiveness of the unit's work and its leadership. The MOE requested the expedient approval of the CEO in order to be able to advertise the senior planning position. The position should be filled during the first quarter of 2002.

1.4 Project Management and Development: Under the project, a PMU was created to coordinate project implementation, monitoring and evaluation, prepare progress reports and implement the MOE's development program. It incorporated preexisting units for school maintenance and the procurement and distribution of school equipment, furniture, materials and supplies. The PMU was adequately staffed by project closing, with a full time accountant and procurement experts, support staff and a PMU manager. The PMU experts received training abroad in the relevant areas of their responsibilities. The PMU is currently preparing the new project to be presented to the Bank and it is managing other projects with international financial support.

As detailed in section 5.3, for nearly two years, the PMU manager was simultaneously responsible for his full-time position and that of the Permanent Secretary of the MOE. This caused delays in project implementation. In February 2001, a new acting project manager was appointed. She has been very influential in achieving a successful project closing.

Component 2. Qualitative Improvement of Basic Education
ICR Rating: **Satisfactory**

The project was successful in: (i) improving the quality of teacher training through training interventions and the provision of appropriate teaching materials and facilities; (ii) improving the relevance of the curriculum through training interventions and the provision of appropriate teaching and learning materials; (iii) strengthening the capacity of the MOE to produce and procure educational materials through training interventions, the supply of basic textbooks and provision of appropriate equipment; and (iv) strengthening the capacity of the MOE to develop and administer exams and assess student achievements. The project had little impact in improving the quality of school supervision. All of these activities were undertaken with delays, which limited the impact on the daily activities of the MOE and had limited time to trickle down to the schools.

Analysis by sub-component:

2.1 Teacher training: The project was successful in improving teacher training at the basic and in-service level. By project completion, the project had financed five fellowships (five staff years) for teachers to be trained as teacher educators in the four core areas (social studies, sciences, mathematics and language) at the University of the West Indies (UWI). These teacher educators then went to teach at the Teacher Training Institute of the TA Marryshow Community College (TAMCC). The project financed seven fellowships (seven staff years) for secondary teachers to acquire pedagogical training at UWI. The project also financed equipment for the language and science laboratories and equipment for the resource center at TAMCC. The language lab was timely equipped and its resources were highly valued by teachers. In the case of the science lab, there were termite problems that delayed the timely use of the new equipment, shortly before project closing. These problems had been partially resolved by project closing. TAMCC expanded its core of tutors to 17 including the Dean of Professional Studies and the Head of the Teacher Training Department.

The project financed in-service training programs for primary school teachers in the four subject areas on pedagogical skills, organization of curriculum at school level, use of staff and facilities, etc. up to 1997. The program was then replaced with a secondary teacher training program at TAMCC. A total of 33 teachers completed the TAMCC program and 24 passed UWI Certificate Exams. A total of 60 students enrolled in 2002.

The ICR mission met with the direct beneficiaries of the fellowships, who assessed the training received as appropriate. They felt that their pedagogical and theoretical knowledge was enhanced and they were empowered to better perform their tasks as teacher trainers. They brought up some shortcomings such as the difficulties to receive the fellowship funds, which forced some fellows to seek outside financial assistance. Other stakeholders (at TAMCC) expressed their disappointment for their lack of participation in the design and implementation of the training program. Assessors' reports of the trainees' practical teaching indicated an increase in the use of creative and interactive methods during lesson presentation.

The studies on teacher attrition and effectiveness and the impact of training of teachers were not done before project completion.

2.2 School supervision : This subcomponent has fallen short of the objectives envisaged, not having the expected impact in strengthening the school supervisory service to assist the schools in key areas (assessment of teachers' performance, school management, effective school operations). The project financed two fellowships for school supervisors in school supervision (who are at present working in the School Administration and Management Unit (SAMU) of the MOE) and provided new accommodations as well as supplies and equipment for the supervision team in the MOE's new building. Project activities have resulted in some new approaches at school level but it has not been widespread and institutionalized. Also, the school supervision unit, the curriculum development unit and TAMCC did not develop a cohesive and fluent working relationship during the life of the project.

Under this sub-component, local training for supervisors, principals and other relevant school staff was provided on school management concepts and effective school operations. Principals who had received such training expressed their satisfaction to the ICR mission and felt it had substantially helped them in their management of the school. Need for further training was expressed during the school visits.

The MOE is currently reviewing the school supervision service.

2.3 Curriculum development: The project successfully strengthened the Curriculum Development Unit (CDU) of the MOE. CDU staff benefited from fellowships in the core subject areas (English, Mathematics, Social Studies and Science). The returned fellows are at present engaged in reviewing and developing the new curricula, training the teachers in the application of the curricular changes and monitoring and supervising the implementation of the curriculum at school level. Since the completion of their fellowships (1999-2001), they have provided training workshops to over 1,300 primary and secondary teachers, principals, curriculum and education officers and other MOE staff (see Annex 10).

During interviews with the beneficiaries, they highly valued the content of the workshops but acknowledged they had translated little of the content or of the new teaching methods to the classroom, due to scarcity of instructional materials and equipment and lack of hands-on technical assistance in the classroom.

The CDU has been restructured and its staff increased from five to eighteen to assume all curriculum-related responsibility, previously shared with the School Supervision Unit. Since 1997, the CDU has developed a new lower secondary curricula for Forms 1 to 3 for Science, Mathematics and Social Studies. It has participated in regional CXC curricula. School visits and interviews confirmed that the new curricular changes at secondary level have filled a vacuum and recommended that a new curriculum for the other subject areas would be very beneficial as well.

The project met its targets in providing mathematics and science kits, teaching aids and textbooks to 58 primary schools, and textbooks for all secondary schools. It supplied equipment for woodwork and metal work to Boca Secondary School. During the ICR mission, it was observed that the kits and teaching aids had been put to use in a significant number of schools, but its substantial integration in the teaching was uneven among the schools, depending upon the attitude and commitment of the teachers and principals. Impact on learning will be appreciated in the future since the materials were distributed in the second half of 2001. Greater coordination between the PMU and the CDU could make an impact on how effectively these resources are used at school level.

Studies on the effectiveness of syllabi and curriculum were not undertaken before project closing.

2.4 Educational materials: This sub-component met its targets and has had one of the most positive impacts on the education system. Two fellowships (equivalent to two staff years) were taken by the staff in the Materials Production Unit (MPU). Expert services were hired to assist the MOE to design its policy for preparing, publishing and distributing educational materials. With the construction of the new MOE building, the unit's location improved significantly, allowing for the installation and use of equipment that had been impossible to use due to lack of infrastructure capacity. Local training was provided by the returned fellows to 20 curriculum officers and teachers in writing, illustrating and design of educational aides.

The MPU successfully coordinated its work with other units within the MOE. MPU staff worked closely with other units in the production of: (i) the statistical digest and the SPEED; (ii) a manual on test-taking skills; (iii) flash cards for mathematics and a handbook for students and teachers on test taking techniques; (iv) the production of the MOE Corporate Plan; (vi) the curriculum guides; (vii) a newsletter EDUVISION to inform on developments in the education sector; and (v) the identification cards for MOE personnel.

Though training through the fellowships was highly valued, lack of consultation with the direct beneficiaries meant that the content of one of the fellowships was redundant and lacked the complementarities sought in the SAR. The work of the MPU has been hampered by: (i) delays in the construction of the MOE's building that prevented the MPU staff from installing the equipment necessary to produce the educational materials; (ii) lack of additional personnel to function effectively and (iii) delays in hiring the expert services to support policy development in this area (the study was produced before project closing).

Under the project, 45,086 texts were distributed to schools. Although there were delays in procurement, all primary schools had received science kits and social science kits by project closing. They now are being used, and schools have made additional requests for more kits. A new procurement policy for educational materials has been developed and approved but is not yet under implementation.

2.5 Educational testing and measurement: The project successfully created a new Educational Testing and Examinations Unit (ETX) and financed a series of activities and goods to support its development. By project completion, two staff had benefited from fellowships in testing and measurement, though the projected additional training for staff could not be taken before project completion. The unit has been producing test results since 1998, and teachers have used these evaluations at the schools to assess and address teachers' and students' weaknesses.

During the life of the project, a Minimum Competency Test (MCT) was piloted. The test was an important part of the overall education reform effort to assess to what degree students have achieved the minimum knowledge and skills stipulated by the curriculum. Its minimum mastery level is set at 50%. The MCT was administered for the first time in 1999 to 2,023 (or 81%) Grade 4 students in Language Arts and Mathematics. The test was administered to Form 3 in 2000. Its preparation was very participatory, drawing on teachers for inputs and marking of the exams. The resulting test scores were very poor. Two explanations can be offered. First, students have not been motivated to participate or do well on this test because it does not have a selective purpose. Second, the results of the test revealed that the quality of basic education is not as good as other indicators (repetition or drop out rates) would infer. The MCT have resulted in reviews of the curriculum and the teaching content in many schools and in better coordination between grades.

In 1997, the CEE was improved to add a diagnostic aspect to its traditionally selective character. A written part was added to the multiple choice part. These changes allowed the MOE to have a deeper knowledge of the skills acquired by primary school students. The ETX prepared a report that was distributed to the schools, presenting the results and offering some degree of analysis of the students' answers on the written report. Seminars were held with teachers and directors to discuss the results. The reports have been seen to have great impact on teachers.

The School Leaving Examination (SLE) was improved as well, expanding the contents (introduction of social studies) and giving students more opportunities to take the test and get a certificate before entering the labor market.

The ETX aimed to train one person per school to take responsibility for testing aspects, but in reality schools sent different people to each training session, so the objective of the training was not accomplished. Training on testing has taken place in the schools upon demand. Most of the schools have requested this training. Finally, the consultant's report was done fairly late in time.

Component 3. Expansion of Access to Schools.
ICR rating: **Satisfactory**

A new secondary school in Westerhall was constructed, furnished and equipped, and had enrolled 211 students in 2000. But to complete the school within budgetary allocations, the number of available spaces was reduced to 315 from the 525 initial target. The Government has committed to expand the total number of spaces and it has included the necessary provisions in the 2002 budget. The expansion of 140 places at the existing secondary school (SAASS) was not undertaken under the project, though the Government has indicated its intention to continue on with the expansion plans. The two primary schools, St. Theresa's RC School in St. Davis and St. John's RC in Gouyave, were replaced and supplementary furniture and equipment was provided. The principals of these schools have been very successful in collaborating with the community and fund raising to build additional classrooms for preschoolers. During the project, rehabilitations took place in ten primary and secondary schools.

Construction activities were seriously delayed, since it was the first project with the Bank and preparation of bidding documents and other procurement activities took more time and effort than foreseen. Start-up delays were significant (two years in the case of Westerhall and one year in the case of SAASS, which was ultimately not included under the project). The principal factor that prevented SAASS from being financed under the project was the lack of timeliness in preparation of the bidding documents by the external consultants who were hired to prepare them. Delays of several months precluded the inclusion of this expansion in a timely manner.

In general, schools have been acceptable and satisfactory to end users. The impact of the new buildings on staff morale has been significant. Teachers have been motivated by more resources and cleaner, larger spaces. In the case of the primary schools, the impact on the quality of the learning environment was significant. Before the new building was constructed, the primary school was divided between three buildings. In some, classrooms were just divided by blackboards, making teaching and student participation more difficult. There were a number of issues raised about the adequacy of the design, the quality of the work and its timeliness in the new and replacement schools and in the refurbished ones (in St. Theresa, they were already experiencing classroom shortages; there were no dining room facilities and there were problems with rain and the color of the vinyl chosen for the floors in a muddy area). There was a lack of beneficiary involvement in the design and implementation of these activities. During the school visits, most principals indicated they had provided information to the MOE on the schools' needs but had not been involved in the final selection of improvements to be done at the schools, nor in its supervision and certification of works completion. For instance, in BOCA secondary school, the project built a new welding room to house new machinery. The teacher in charge indicated that the design of the new room did not include space to house the old welding equipment needed to finish up some of the tasks done with the new machinery.

Maintenance

The MOE has drafted a maintenance policy but it has not yet been approved. So there is no maintenance capacity inside of any of the new or rehabilitated schools. Communities have mobilized to support the schools' effort in maintenance (i.e. in Westerhall, where the local community was helping the school with the creation of a vegetable garden, clearing surroundings, etc).

4.3 Net Present Value/Economic rate of return:
N/A

4.4 Financial rate of return:
N/A

4.5 Institutional development impact:

The project has significantly contributed to institutional development in the education sector, though some of the achievements are still fragile. The numerous fellowships financed under the project have enhanced capacity in the MOE in planning, testing and measurement, curriculum development, materials production, data and project management. The local training given by the returned fellows had a positive impact and spill over to the system of the knowledge and enhanced skills acquired abroad.

Evidence of the achievements are the improvements in the standardized tests, the production of Statistical Digests, the work of the Materials Production Unit and a good quality long term sectoral development plan. There has been a strengthening in the capacity to manage and develop projects financed by and in collaboration with other institutions. Greater coordination among the MOE units (through regular meetings of the Heads of Office with the Minister of Education) and between the MOE and the Ministry of Finance has been achieved in the last few years.

The MOE has started to implement some of the recommendations of the Audit document in several areas. This has been done mainly by the: (i) development of an effective filing policy; (ii) more frequent meetings organized within departments, especially among the units that have undergone a reorganization; (iii) efforts to disseminate information more effectively to the schools and to analyze the information; (iv) improvement of the Ministry's public image, starting with the publication of a newsletter; (v) concentration of the collection of the statistical information in the Statistics Unit of the MOE; (vi) incipient development of an education management information system; (vii) enhanced efficiency and greater coordination in the management of foreign assisted-projects by entrusting this responsibility to the PMU; and (viii) reinforcement of participatory processes for the preparation of strategic policies and projects for education.

5. Major Factors Affecting Implementation and Outcome

5.1 Factors outside the control of government or implementing agency:

- **Construction bidding delays.** The principal external factor that prevented the expansion of SAASS from being financed under the project was the lack of timeliness in preparation of the bidding documents. The PMU hired a firm of architects, among the best in the region, to prepare the bidding documents but they were over committed and did not respond quickly. Delays of several months precluded the inclusion of this expansion under the project. Unfortunately, the architects did not let the

GOG know of the delays in time to achieve a successful outcome before project closing.

- **Infrastructure costs.** The rising costs of inputs for construction and the underestimation of civil works costs during project preparation had an impact on the achievements of the civil works of the project. Scope had to be limited to meet the approved budget and the achievement of expansion of access for secondary places has been slowed.

- **Poor fit of fellows' programs.** Another factor perceived to have affected project implementation was the discrepancy between the advertising, information and actual content of the academic programs for fellowships. This fact forced the fellows, in some cases, to take additional training in the form of attachments and delayed the positive impact of the training.

5.2 Factors generally subject to government control:

- **Appointment of senior staff.** The MOE is dependent on the Public Service Commission to appoint senior MOE staff. This creates serious delays in achieving permanent staff appointments. Such was the case for the Permanent Secretary's position, for the PMU's manager and for other education officers at lower levels.

- **Appointment and placement of fellows.** The Government took too long to designate and place the fellow to benefit from the financial management training. As a result, the returned fellow has only recently started to provide key support to strengthen financial analysis and monitoring. This, combined with delays in appointing key personnel for some units of the MOE (such as planning), has significantly slowed the actual changes in the structure and management in the MOE.

- **Availability of sites for civil works.** The site originally planned for the new MOE building was changed. Delays in procuring a new space and the natural difficulties of the new terrain significantly pushed back the beginning of the works. In the case of the primary schools, there were delays in providing land for their location, since it was not Government owned.

5.3 Factors generally subject to implementing agency control:

- **Dual role of project manager.** One of the main factors that slowed project implementation was the dual role that the first project manager had with his Permanent Secretary position over a period of two years. The burden of responsibilities he carried caused delays in project implementation. Fortunately, a PMU manager was appointed a year before project closing. Her capacity and the strong Government commitment made it possible to substantially speed the implementation.

- **Continuity of MOE staff.** One positive factor for project implementation was that key staff in the MOE, including the procurement and accounting officers, remained in their positions during the life of the project. They received relevant training and returned to the MOE to apply their acquired knowledge and skills. This had a positive impact on the project and will be a key factor in assuring quality design and implementation of the project under preparation.

- **Importance of communications.** A lack of fluid communication among different units of the MOE, relevant for project implementation (example of CDU and School supervision or the EMU), affected a substantial part of project implementation. Aware of this, the Heads of Department now hold fort nightly meetings with the Minister of Education, and as a result, collaboration has improved. Better communication or more proactive information sharing from top management at the MOE to stakeholders in the education sector would have encouraged wider ownership and awareness of the project, as well as of the ongoing education reform efforts.

5.4 Costs and financing:

Initially, the SAR foresaw a total project cost of US$9.9 million with a contribution by the Bank of US$7.6 million and US$2.3 million by the Borrower. By project closing, the Bank contribution amounted to US$6.9 million and the Borrower's to US$3.66 million. The project disbursement schedule was affected by the substantially slow project start. Once project implementation accelerated, the disbursement pace increased. The cost of civil works was substantially higher than projected in the SAR. This fact was repeatedly pointed out by Bank supervision. Cost over runs were shown in Component 1 - Strengthening of management and planning capacity of the MOE, and in Component 3 - Expansion of access to schools *(see Annex 2)*. In the case of Component 3, the cost increases were due to late start-up and under-estimation of the cost of civil works. Cost was based on preliminary drawings, not on actual site-specific construction designs. In the case of Component 1, a difficulty arose when the initial site projected for the MOE building was given an alternative use. The new site required additional work to level the ground, an issue not taken into account at the time of project design.

The Borrower requested an extension of six months to finish execution of project actions. Project execution and the use of funds accelerated during the last year of the project. Nevertheless, approximately US$131,661 remained undisbursed at loan closing and is expected to be cancelled.

6. Sustainability

6.1 Rationale for sustainability rating:
ICR Rating: Likely

It is **likely** that the achievements reached during project implementation will be maintained for the following reasons:

- The Ministry of Education has created four new units which are currently functional and staffed with trained personnel. The MOE has committed to take the necessary steps to adequately fill those key positions in the units that are understaffed.
- The curriculum revisions have been brought to the schools and beneficiaries have deeply appreciated the guidance and resulting improvements in quality.
- A long-term development plan for the education sector - SPEED - has been developed to guide future actions and investment undertaken by the MOE, including in its future collaboration with external partners.
- The Minimum Competency Test was initiated several years before project closing and it is used as a tool to address deficiencies in teaching and learning in earlier stages, before selection examinations.
- The capacity to produce learning materials and textbooks within the MOE is installed and it has fostered closer collaboration among the different core units of the Ministry.
- The Ministry has committed itself to provide the number of spaces for universal secondary enrollment that could not be covered under the project (both for cost and timing reasons), and it has made the necessary budgetary provisions.

The lack of an approved maintenance policy for school buildings could hamper the efforts to improve school infrastructure in the long run.

6.2 Transition arrangement to regular operations:

The project financed a large number of fellowships and training which has had a positive impact on capacity building. Most of the fellows went back to their positions, streamlining into daily operations, to some extent, the knowledge acquired. The units created under the project are an integral part of the project. This has not meant an increase in the total number of professional personnel in the MOE, but rather a reorganization to transition to a better managed organization that provides policy guidance and support to the schools.

7. Bank and Borrower Performance

Bank

7.1 Lending:

Satisfactory. The Bank's performance during preparation was satisfactory. The Bank engaged in a fruitful dialogue with the MOE to jointly define the project objectives and actions to achieve them. The project design was in accordance with country and regional objectives. The Bank made an effort to consult with a wider representation of stakeholders from the education sector (principals and TAMCC) as well as other ministries. One of the reasons for not giving a highly satisfactory rating is that the Bank was influenced by the previously prepared project for St. Lucia, not totally tailoring the project to Grenada's particularities. The other reason is the inadequate costing of the civil works component, based on drawings and not actual construction sites, which resulted in a problem of funding during project implementation.

7.2 Supervision:

Satisfactory. Bank supervision is rated satisfactory with some qualifications. On the positive side, the Bank worked closely with the Borrower to support its efforts to successfully implement the project. Despite having several task managers as project leaders, the dialogue during implementation was fluid and both parts sought and found solutions to implementation bottlenecks (i.e. inclusion of one secondary school not initially included in the SAR, changes in the profiles of the fellowships in the Ministry of Finance, etc.).

The Bank supervised the project regularly and this monitoring was perceived as one of the major factors that helped achieve its targets and impact. Despite these, the Bank failed to provide stronger support in procurement areas in the earlier years of the project. More technical assistance should have been given to prevent the civil works from stalling, when the borrower's lack of experience with Bank procedures caused delays in implementation.

The Bank agreed to a request for an extension to the closing date, supporting the Government's efforts to achieve as much as possible after appointing a full time project coordinator who effectively speeded project implementation.

7.3 Overall Bank performance:

Satisfactory. Overall Bank performance is rated satisfactory for:

- Good team work and good communications with the Government.
- Flexible response to the country's needs
- Fairly good supervision and extension of the life of the loan.
- Close support in filing and financial aspects of the project.
- Field visits and meetings with stakeholders and beneficiaries.

All of these elements created a positive relationship between the Bank and the Borrower that led to successful project implementation.

Borrower
7.4 Preparation:

Satisfactory. The Ministry of Education and other ministries and actors involved in the preparation phase actively collaborated with the Bank to define the project. They provided background studies and active inputs to prepare the project. The Borrower failed to prepare a Statement of Policy before the end of the preparation stage. It also fell short in more closely involving the final beneficiaries of project actions, which would have reinforced the reform efforts undertaken by the Government and helped guarantee the quality of project actions (i.e. school construction and renovation).

7.5 Government implementation performance:

Satisfactory. The Borrower regularly provided counterpart funds and, in addition, increased the Borrower's contribution when the civil works activities in Components 1 and 3 incurred cost overruns. Nevertheless, the Government adopted some actions that negatively affected project implementation: (i) changing the location of the new MOE building; (ii) delaying grant approval for the surveys that allowed construction of two of the schools; and (iii) delaying official appointment of MOE staff trained under the project.

7.6 Implementing Agency:

Satisfactory. The MOE showed strong commitment throughout project implementation. The Project Management Unit took some time to reach an effective level of functioning. Lack of familiarity with Bank's procedures and procurement rules prevented the PMU from complying with the schedule set in the SAR. Though it took longer than planned, the PMU built institutional capacity to manage the project properly.

During the life of the project, a factor that affected the PMU's performance was the lack of a full time Project Manager for a significant time. The Project Manager was appointed Acting Permanent Secretary and this delayed day to day project activities. Nevertheless, a new Project Manager was appointed for the last year of project implementation. This appointment and strong MOE commitment allowed for a successful last year of project implementation.

7.7 Overall Borrower performance:

Satisfactory. The overall performance is rated satisfactory for the following reasons:

- Overall Government's commitment to the education sector and the project as a pillar to support the education reform efforts;
- Continuity of the core personnel in the PMU during the life of the project;
- Creation of key units in the MOE, fully institutionalized within the ministry's structure;
- Efforts to undertake organizational and management changes;
- Continuous steps to improve the quality of education and improve student achievements;
- Achievement of project targets and objectives in almost all sub-components, despite slow project start and difficulties with the continuity of the project manager.

8. Lessons Learned

Participation of stakeholders in project design is important. The people who will participate in project implementation should be involved in the analysis of issues and provide inputs for project design. This is key to promote ownership of project activities and gain support for project interventions. It helps tailor design and provide a source of quality control of project outputs. Bringing teachers on board early is key for the success of education reforms. This was especially felt with the introduction of the new MCT and the changes made to the CEE. Involvement of teachers during the planning stage ensures their support during implementation and minimizes potential resistance.

Consultation to beneficiaries regarding the content of training is key. During the interviews with the direct training beneficiaries, they unanimously highly valued the opportunity to be trained. Nevertheless, a high number of the trained MOE staff and teachers felt they were not sufficiently consulted (sometimes not at all) regarding selection of their training. In some cases, the training received was redundant for the unit where the staff would work or it was not the most suitable training course, in the eyes of the trainees.

Provision of training is not sufficient to guarantee changes in behaviour. Training needs to be accompanied by more technical assistance and hands-on work in the classroom to help translate the skills acquired by teachers.

Better assessment of the Borrower's implementation capacity can prevent disappointments and help design actions to reduce risks. An assessment of the implementation capacity of the Borrower to implement project activities and to use Bank's procurement and financial reporting guidelines would allow for a proper design of initial phases of project implementation and a realistic schedule. It would allow for provision of start-up support before project effectiveness or at the very early stages of project implementation.

Communication is paramount, especially when trans-unit tasks are involved. Promoting greater internal communication among the different units involved in an education reform program is crucial to reinforce the work individually done by each unit and to avoid situations where units are unaware of activities underway that should be complementary. A communications strategy is relevant to convey the overall efforts in education reform. Lack of such a deliberate effort might produce ignorance of the global efforts to promote changes in culture, in accountability and to disseminate project results.

Cost of civil works should be based on site-specific construction designs and not preliminary drawings or prototypes. When possible, the use of site-specific construction designs can prevent major cost underestimates. If detailed construction designs are not available, sufficient physical and price contingencies should be built into the cost estimates to minimize cost underestimates.

9. Partner Comments

(a) Borrower/implementing agency:
The Ministry of Education contributed with an Evaluation Report, assessing the impact and the implementation of the project, from the Borrower's perspective. Prior to the final version, the MOE held a consultation with project beneficiaries and stakeholders that had participated in project implementation, incorporating their comments into the final evaluation report. A summary of the report is included in Annex 8.

(b) Cofinanciers:
N/A

(c) Other partners (NGOs/private sector):
N/A

10. Additional Information

None.

Annex 1. Key Performance Indicators/Log Frame Matrix

Indicator	Target in SAR/Mid term review	Actual/latest Estimate
Improved management and planning capacity of the MOE.		
- MOE reorganized	Creation of 4 new units which will be fully operative by 2001	Four new units established: Project Management Unit (PMU), Educational Planning and Statistical Unit (EPU), Educational Testing and Exams Unit (ETX), and Educational Materials Unit (EMU)
- Adjust teacher/student ratio (baseline 1995)		
Primary: 1/27	Primary: 1/29	Primary: 1/25 (2000)
Secondary: 1/10	Secondary: 1/23.5	Secondary: 1/23
- Decrease in the proportion of total budget used for salary expenditure (baseline: 1997)		
Primary: 94.6 %	Primary: 90%	Primary: 94.83%
Secondary: 93%	Secondary: 89%	Secondary: 88.5%
Improved quality of secondary education		
- Common Entrance Examination 1995		2001
Highest score n.a.		134.68
Mean score n.a.		n.a
% of placements 44		50.3
- Reduction of repetition rates: 1995		
Primary 11.2%	Primary: 8.9%	Primary: 5.2%
Secondary 11.6%	Secondary: 9.3%	Secondary: 1.3%
- Availability of appropriate textbooks (Baseline: 75% of the school population)	95% of school population	Survey not done
- Availability of instructional materials and equipment	Improved	Improved
- Teachers knowledge of appropriate curriculum and design of lessons plans at each stage of child's development	Improved	Improved
- Teachers use a variety of teaching techniques (from chalkboard to class discussion, individual assignments and group work)	Improved	Improved
Expansion of Access to Schools		
Increase gross enrollment in secondary schools (base year 1995-96: 63% of the 12-16 age cohort)	66%	88%

Output Indicators:

Indicator	End of Project Target in SAR/Mid term review	Actual Output
1. Strengthening Management Capacity and Planning		
New Ministry of Education constructed and occupied	Construction completed by project closing.	The new MOE was finished in the second semester of 2001. It was in use by mid November, 2001.
MOE reorganized: establishment of 4 units, fully operational by project closing	Units established and fully operational.	Units established and fully operational.
Senior Staff at the MOE trained	Permanent Secretary and Chief Education Officer trained	Permanent Secretary and Chief Education Officer trained
Staff trained in key MOE units	Fellowships for 30 staff	All fellowships concluded
Long term development plan for the education sector completed	Strategic Plan finished by 1996	A Strategic Plan for Educational Enhancement and Development (SPEED) finished and published in January 2002
Integrated educational data system developed	First phase of the data system launched.	Not concluded
Local staff trained by beneficiaries of fellowships	Training of local staff	Training successfully carried out
2. Qualitative Improvement of Basic Education		
Four teacher educators trained	4 teachers trained.	5 teachers successfully trained and teaching at TAMCC
Equipment for teacher training department of TAMCC science and language laboratories procured and distributed	Equipment provided	Equipment provided. Progress done to resolve the existing problems at the science laboratory.
Staff at TAMCC training department expanded	12 new staff incorporated	15 new full time staff in the teacher training department.
Fellowships on school supervision carried out	2 fellowships completed	2 fellowships completed
Fellowships completed on curriculum design in core areas.	4 fellowships completed	4 fellowships successfully completed
Science Kits and social studies for up to 60 primary schools procured and distributed	Kits provided to the schools	Science and social studies kits provided to all primary schools
Supplementary instructional supplies provided to selected primary schools	Materials supplied to about ten schools	Supplementary materials and books provided to selected primary and secondary schools
Fellowships for staff in the EMU and EXT carried out	2 fellowships completed	Fellowships completed
Minimum Competency Test piloted	Piloting new tests	Tests successfully carried out in 1999 and 2001.
CEE improved	n.a.	Improvements in the test to use it as a student assessment tool.
3. Expand Access to Schools		
New secondary school constructed and another one extended	Construction finished by project closing.	New school fully operational and no expansion of the other secondary school
Replacement of two primary schools	Two new buildings completed	Works successfully concluded.
Rehabilitations in selected primary and secondary schools	Selected schools rehabilitated	11 schools rehabilitated

Annex 2. Project Costs and Financing

Project Cost by Component (in US$ million equivalent)

Project Cost By Component	Appraisal Estimate US$ million	Actual/Latest Estimate US$ million	Percentage of Appraisal
Component A. Strengthening Management and Planning			
A.1. Senior Management	0.92	1.63	177
A.2. Planning and Development	0.41	0.33	80
A.3. Project Management	0.45	0.60	133
A.4. Financial Management	0.07	0.04	57
Component B. Improving Educational Quality			
B.1 Teacher Training	0.60	0.30	50
B.2 School Supervision	0.37	0.45	121
B.3 Curriculum Development	0.40	0.62	152
B.4 Educational Materials	0.60	0.96	160
B.5 Testing and Measurements	0.45	0.34	74
Component C. Expansion and Rehabilitation of School Places			
Primary and Secondary Schools	4.52	4.67	103
Primary and Secondary School Maintenance	1.13	1.22	107
Total Baseline Cost	9.92	11.16	
Total Project Costs	9.92	11.16	
Total Financing Required	9.92	11.16	

Project Costs by Procurement Arrangement
(Appraisal Estimate and Actual) US$ million equivalent

	ICB		NCB		Other		Total	
Category	**SAR**	**Actual**	**SAR**	**Actual**	**SAR**	**Actual**	**SAR**	**Total**
Civil Works	4.00	5.20	1.00	1.60	1.00		6.00	6.80
Goods Equipment and Furniture		0.16			0.2	0.07	0.2	0.23
Other Goods Other equipment, books, educational materials, etc.	0.2	1.3			1.2	0.29	1.4	1.59
Technical Assistance								
Works/Design					0.6	0.59	0.6	0.59
Expert Services					0.5	0.37	0.5	0.37
Fellowships					0.8	0.61	0.8	0.61
Local Studies					0.1	0.85	0.1	0.85
Training					0.3	0.12	0.3	0. 12
Maintenance								
					0 1			
Total	**4.20**	**6.66**	1.00	**1.60**	**4.7**	**2.9**	**9.9**	**11.16**

Project Financing by Component (in US$ million equivalent)

Component	Appraisal Estimate			Actual/Latest Estimate			Percentage of Appraisal		
	Bank	**Govt.**	**CoF.**	**Bank.**	**Govt.**	**CoF.**	**Bank**	**Govt.**	**CoF.**
Component A. Strengthening Management and Planning	1.52	0.34		1.32	1.28		86.8	376.5	
A.1 Senior Management	0.70	0.22		0.72	0.91		102.9	413.6	
A.2 Planning and Development	0.36	0.05		0.21	0.11		58.3	220.0	
A.3 Project Management	0.39	0.06		0.37	0.22		94.9	366.7	
A.4 Financial Management	0.06	0.01		0.02	0.02		33.3	200.0	
Component B. Improving Educational Quality	2.02	0.39		1.84	0.80		91.1	205.1	
B.1 Teacher Training	0.48	0.12		0.25	0.04		52.1	33.3	
B.2 School Supervision	0.28	0.09		0.20	0.25		71.4	277.8	
B.3 Curriculum Development	0.34	0.06		0.46	0.16		135.3	266.7	
B.4 Educational Materials	0.53	0.06		0.78	0.18		147.2	300.0	
B.5 Testing and Measurements	0.37	0.07		0.15	0.18		40.5	257.1	
C. Expansion and Rehabilitation of School Places	4.11	1.53		3.80	2.06		92.5	134.6	
C.1 Primary and	3.30	1.21		2.96	1.69		89.7	139.7	

Secondary Schools C. 2 Primary and Secondary School Maintenance	0.82	0.32		0.84	0.37		102.4	115.6	

Annex 3. Economic Costs and Benefits

N/A

Annex 4. Bank Inputs

(a) Missions:

Stage of Project Cycle	No. of Persons and Specialty (e.g. 2 Economists, 1 FMS, etc.)		Performance Rating	
Month/Year	Count	Specialty	Implementation Progress	Development Objective
Identification/Preparation				
January 1994	*n.a*	n.a		
Appraisal/Negotiation				
February 1995	*1*	Team Leader		
April 1995	*2*	Team Leader, 1 Ed. Specialist		
Supervision				
March, 1996	*2*	Team Leader, 1 Ed. Specialist	S	S
Dec. 1996	*3*	Team Leader, 1 Ed. Spec., 1 FMS	S	S
May 1997	*2*	Team Leader, 1 Ed. Consultant	S	S
October 1997	*3*	Team Leader, 1FMS, 1 Ed. Consultant	U	S
May 1998			U	S
November 1998	*5*	Team Leader, 2 Ed. Specialists, 1 Procurement Spec., 1 FMS, 1 Project Advisor	U	S
May 1999	*3*	Team Leader, 2 Educ. Specialists	S	S
October 1999	*4*	Team Leader, 1 Ed. Specialist, 1 Project Assistant, 1 Architect.	S	S
April 2000	*3*	Team Leader, 1 FMS, 1 Assistant	S	S
December 2000	*2*	Team Leader, 1 Ed. Specialist	S	S
June 2001	*2*	Team Leader, 1 Ed. Specialist	S	S
ICR				
June 2001	*1*	Mission Leader	S	S
December 2001	*1*	Education/Operations Consultant	S	S
February 2002	*2*	Mission Leader, procurement analyst	S	S

(b) Staff:

Stage of Project Cycle	Actual/Latest Estimate	
	No. Staff weeks	US$ ('000)
Identification/Preparation	n.a.	12,000.00
Appraisal/Negotiation	n.a.	16,615.52
Supervision	n.a.	234,211.11
ICR	8	28,000.00
Total	n.a.	292,826.63

This table is based on the information currently available on SAP. The figures for identification/preparation and appraisal/ negotiation are an estimate. The information system provides a total amount for these categories. Amounts are not disagregated before FY98.

Annex 5. Ratings for Achievement of Objectives/Outputs of Components

(H=High, SU=Substantial, M=Modest, N=Negligible, NA=Not Applicable)

	Rating
☐ *Macro policies*	○ *H* ○ *SU* ○ *M* ○ *N* ● *NA*
☐ *Sector Policies*	○ *H* ● *SU* ○ *M* ○ *N* ○ *NA*
☐ *Physical*	○ *H* ● *SU* ○ *M* ○ *N* ○ *NA*
☐ *Financial*	○ *H* ○ *SU* ● *M* ○ *N* ○ *NA*
☐ *Institutional Development*	○ *H* ● *SU* ○ *M* ○ *N* ○ *NA*
☐ *Environmental*	○ *H* ○ *SU* ○ *M* ○ *N* ● *NA*
Social	
☐ *Poverty Reduction*	○ *H* ○ *SU* ○ *M* ○ *N* ● *NA*
☐ *Gender*	○ *H* ○ *SU* ○ *M* ○ *N* ● *NA*
☐ *Other (Please specify)*	○ *H* ○ *SU* ○ *M* ○ *N* ● *NA*
☐ *Private sector development*	○ *H* ○ *SU* ○ *M* ○ *N* ● *NA*
☐ *Public sector management*	○ *H* ○ *SU* ○ *M* ○ *N* ● *NA*
☐ *Other (Please specify)*	○ *H* ○ *SU* ○ *M* ○ *N* ● *NA*

Annex 6. Ratings of Bank and Borrower Performance

(HS=Highly Satisfactory, S=Satisfactory, U=Unsatisfactory, HU=Highly Unsatisfactory)

6.1 Bank performance	*Rating*
☐ *Lending*	○ *HS* ● *S* ○ *U* ○ *HU*
☐ *Supervision*	○ *HS* ● *S* ○ *U* ○ *HU*
☐ *Overall*	○ *HS* ● *S* ○ *U* ○ *HU*

6.2 Borrower performance	*Rating*
☐ *Preparation*	○ *HS* ● *S* ○ *U* ○ *HU*
☐ *Government implementation performance*	○ *HS* ● *S* ○ *U* ○ *HU*
☐ *Implementation agency performance*	○ *HS* ● *S* ○ *U* ○ *HU*
☐ *Overall*	○ *HS* ● *S* ○ *U* ○ *HU*

The implementation agency performance is rated satisfactory, despite this project having been rated unsatisfactory for project management for a year. The Government and the implementation agency made strong efforts to correct this weakness, appointing a full time Project Manager, and project implementation peaked during the last year of the project. The rating on the last PSR for project management was satisfactory.

Annex 7. List of Supporting Documents

Bank preparation documents

- Pre-Appraisal mission terms of reference, Aide-Memoire and Back to Office report. World Bank. 1995.
- Appraisal mission terms of reference, Aide-Memoire and Back to Office report. World Bank. 1995.
- Staff Appraisal Report. World Bank. November 1995.

Bank project implementation documents

- Project Status Reports (PSR). World Bank. 1996-2002
- Aide-Memoires of Supervision missions. World Bank. 1996-2001

Main documents prepared by the borrower during implementation

- "The Uses and Management of Fees Collected at Secondary Schools in Grenada". MOE. August 2001.
- "Audit of the Management and Administration of the Education System". MOE. December 2000.
- "Education Sector Diagnosis". MOE, September 2000.
- "Educational Costs and Financing". MOE. October 1999-2000.
- "External Efficiency of the Education System. MOE. August 2000.
- "Education and Training Implications of Economic and Social Development and Labour Market Demands". MOE. July 2000.
- "School Management". MOE. March 2000.
- "Access to Secondary Education". MOE. Feb. 2000
- "Teacher Effectiveness". MOE. December 1999.
- "Quality and Internal Efficiency of the Education System". MOE. December 1999.

Additional Annex 8. Borrower's Contribution

1. INTRODUCTION

This final Evaluation Report on the Basic Education * Reform Project (BERP) was prepared in fulfilment of the Government of Grenada's (the Borrower) responsibility towards the preparation of the project's Implementation Completion Report (ICR).

Consistent with the Guidelines for completing ICR's, the report includes an assessment of project objectives, design and implementation, and an evaluation of the Borrower's and Financiers' performance in the development and implementation of the Project. Lessons learnt that may be relevant for the future, are also included.

*(Defined as "... the primary grades and the lower cycle of secondary education (Grades 1– 9)" – Staff Appraisal Report No. 14945/ GRD, pg. 4)

1.1. PROJECT PURPOSE AND OBJECTIVES

The BERP was designed as "...the first stage (Emphasis added) of a major reform of basic education aimed at improved efficiency and effectiveness of the education system and at enhancing the quality of, and equity of access to, basic education" (Staff Appraisal Report No. 14945 - GRD, pg. 18.)

The overall *development* objective of the project was defined as *"... to accelerate human resource development so that the requisite manpower can be produced to support the desired national economic transition"* (Staff Appraisal Report, pg. 18)

The project was aimed at strengthening the planning and institutional capacity of the Ministry of Education (MOE) to guide and carry out long-term development of the sector, while enabling it to initiate urgent measures to address system-wide qualitative problems and expansion needs at the primary and secondary levels.

The *specific* project objectives were to strengthen management in the sector; to improve the quality of basic education; to expand access to secondary education; and to rehabilitate primary and secondary school facilities.

The project objectives were also expected to serve as a catalyst for a major adjustment process, focused on moving toward more reasonable primary and secondary teacher to student ratios, in line with ratios of countries in similar economic and social circumstances. Such adjustment was deemed critical to ensure that the resource allocations to public education responded more effectively to current and projected needs including increased financing for system management and planning; more instructional equipment and supplies; and proper maintenance of school facilities.

1.2. PROJECT COMPONENTS

The project had three (3) components, viz:

(a) Strengthening Management and Planning of the Ministry of Education.

This component was intended to help to reorganise the management of the school system, upgrade staff and improve coordination among key MOE operating units; build capacity in sector planning and analysis and formulate a long term sector development plan; strengthen central planning so that it could better assist and support educational planning; Develop an integrated education data system comprising student, school, financial and personnel information to facilitate improved sector analysis, administration and management and policy making; establish a permanent project development and management capacity within the MOE; including increased capacity at procuring school supplies and maintenance of physical plant; strengthen financial management; and finance special studies to assist in formulating future policy and program developments.

(b) Improving the Quality of Basic Education.

This component was intended to enhance the quality of teaching and learning, through upgrading basic teacher training and strengthening in-service training for teachers (with special attention to science, mathematics and language arts) and, concurrently ensuring their more appropriate utilisation and productivity through improved supervision and management; providing a better supply of instructional materials and improved curricula (especially in core subjects); establishing an educational testing and measurement capacity to monitor student and system performance; and building capacity in cost-effective methods of preparing, selecting, producing, procuring and distributing educational materials.

(c) Expansion of Access to Schools.

This component was intended to increase secondary school places in the most under-served districts to reduce overcrowding and long distance travel and facilitate access to educational opportunities; replace primary schools that are now housed in unsatisfactory buildings; and provide funding for urgently needed rehabilitation of selected schools.

1.3. FINANCING

The project was to be financed by a Credit of US$3.80 million from the International Development Association (CR 2804 – GRD), a loan of US$3.80 million from the International Bank for Reconstruction and Development (World Bank) (LN 3970 – GRD) and a contribution of US$2.3 million from the Government of Grenada.

The respective agreements were signed on February 28, 1996 and became effective on June 13, 1996.

2. QUALITY AT ENTRY

Overall quality at entry was satisfactory.

The *development objective* was relevant and appropriate to Grenada's needs and the *specific objectives* were consistent with the identified needs of Grenada's education sector and with the sectoral development strategy being pursued by the Government.

The *project components* were also generally consistent with the identified priorities and needs of the educational sector, although there could have been a stronger emphasis on technical and vocational skills, especially at the senior primary level. This had been raised by the Grenada delegations during project development, but had not been included in the project, due in part to the "prescriptive" approach used by the Bank.

The *phasing of project activities* was ambitious, given the limited expertise in project management and procurement matters within the MOE and the fact that the Project Management Unit (PMU) was a new Unit that was being established by the project.

The project was designed with a very heavy "front-loading" of project activities – especially in the fellowship and civil works components. 62.31% of the expenditures were scheduled for the first eighteen (18) months of the project, including the completion of the MOE offices by December 1997. The ambitious nature of this project design had been identified at project appraisal and a Project Management consultant to assist at start-up was provided for in the project design. However, the PMU was expected to use the procurement procedures that they were not familiar with, to recruit the Project Management consultant.

The net result was that the rate of project implementation was the opposite to that planned – low in the early years and increasing during the second half of the project cycle. It reflected, in part, the initial lack of experience of the PMU and their subsequent increases in effectiveness and efficiency over the life of the project.

The relative *allocation of the finances* among the project components was deemed appropriate, given the outputs defined for each component – 57% Civil Works; 24% -Improving Educational Quality; and 19% - Strengthening Management and Planning.

However, *the initial costing of the civil works* component was inadequate. These costings were developed on the basis of prototype designs and not on the basis of actual designs relevant to the sites to be used. As a result, the scope of civil works had to be reduced significantly, as the actual site-based drawings for the original scope of work were estimated to cost 40% - 60% higher than that provided for in the project. While some of these increases were due to price increases as a result of delays in project implementation, some were also due to inadequate estimates during project design.

Overall quality at entry was therefore rated as SATISFACTORY.

3. IMPLEMENTATION EXPERIENCE

3.1. STRENGTHEN MANAGEMENT AND PLANNING CAPACITY

Most of the activities targeted under this component were started and completed with the exception of the development of the integrated data system, the development of the long term sector plan, a training attachment for one of the officers in the Examinations and Testing Unit and the development of policies on Maintenance and Procurement. The MOE is committed to completing them during 2002.

The Ministry was also unable to retain three (3) of the Fellows that were trained – the Permanent Secretary retired during the project, the Chief Education Officer was transferred to another Ministry and the Statistician had to be transferred out of the Department.

The impact of the various activities under this component has had a positive impact on the management of the MOE. This is evident in the more structured and participatory approaches been used in policy development as evidenced by the process of background studies and stakeholder consultation used in the development of the Strategic Plan for Educational Enhancement and Development (SPEED), the Master Plan on Drugs 1998 – 2002, the development of the Early Childhood Policy and other sectoral initiatives. The institutionalisation of fortnightly Heads of Department meetings, with ministerial attendance, is another example of the strengthening of the management systems that has taken place.

The positive impact is also evident in the significant improvement in the capacity of the PMU as evidenced by its ability to accelerate project completion during the second half of the project, while undertaking responsibilities outside of the BERP, including the management of the Republic of China (ROC)-financed Schools Rehabilitation Project and the European Development Fund (EDF)-financed expansion to the Hospitality Arts Department of the TAMCC.

There were two (2) areas in which the strengthening of the policy formulation process did not have the anticipated impact - the incorporation of more structured financial analyses into policy making and the development of an integrated data system to inform decision-making. In the former, the Fellow completed training in June 2001 and in the case of the latter the Fellow who had been trained had to be replaced due to poor job performance. A new Statistical Officer was appointed in March 2001 and an Educational Digest covering the period 1997 - 2001 was produced in February 2002 with Consultant support.

The commissioning of the MOE offices in November 2001 has had a positive impact on the MOE staff, despite complaints from some departments concerning the space allotted and the location of the assigned offices.

The MOE has also initiated deliberate policy action aimed at achieving the targeted teacher-student ratios. The targeted national ratio of 1:23 had been achieved in the case of the secondary schools, but the ratio in the primary schools was 1:25, compared with a target of 1:29. The data on salaries indicate that the proportions of the recurrent budget that were expended to meet salary and other personal emoluments in 2000/01 have been reduced to 88.5% for the secondary schools compared with a target of 89%, but that the proportion at the primary school level was 94.83% compared with the target of 90%.

The project also provided three (3) Fellowships to personnel from the Ministry of Finance – one in the Economic Planning and two (2) in Social Sector Planning **. The Ministry of Finance has benefited from these Fellowships with all three Fellows now occupying senior positions in the Ministry, including that of Permanent Secretary. However, there is still a need to strengthen the operational linkages between sectoral and national planning as the senior positions of the returned Fellows have meant that they are not in a position to handle the day-to-day issues that arise. This has been acknowledged by the Ministry of Finance and a decision has been taken to assign a specific officer to work on issues related to the Ministry of Education.

The rating for this component is SATISFACTORY.

** (The original project provided for one social sector Fellowship. This was increased to two at the request of the Ministry of Finance which substituted the second Fellowship in place of the provision of Expert Services in Economic Planning. Alternative arrangements had been made for the provision of the expert services.)

3.2. IMPROVING THE QUALITY OF BASIC EDUCATION

Most of the planned interventions for this component were implemented during the life of the project – although there were delays in implementation in some instances.

The project has strengthened the teaching capacity of the Teacher Education Department of the T.A. Marryshow Community College (TAMCC) through the training of five specialist teachers in the core subject areas of English, Mathematics, Social Studies and science, and the provision of a Language laboratory, equipment for a science laboratory and audio-visual equipment for teaching.

The impact of this increase in capacity has been mixed. There has been an increase in the use of creative and interactive methods during lesson presentation at practice teaching but the actual pass rates of the students in the UWI Certificate examinations show that the results for English and Mathematics have been declining since 1999. Despite these results, the percentage of trained teacher at the primary level had increased from 62% in 1997/98 to 70% in 2000/2001. The College has also initiated a secondary school training program in 1999 and one batch of 33 students has already graduated. Of these, 24 were successful at the UWI Certificate examinations.

The data on the other projected impacts on the educational system shows that repetition rates (5.2% primary; 1.3% secondary) and dropout rates (0.7% primary; 1.1% secondary) have improved, and that Common Entrance Examinations (CEE) performance in English and Mathematics has also improved in 2001. It is significant to note that the 2001 CEE students were those who participated in the first Minimum Competency Tests (MCT) in 1999.

The project has increased the capacity of the Curriculum Development Unit by training four (4) Fellows in this area, one (1) in each of the core subject areas. Since 1997, the Unit has developed new lower secondary school curricula (forms 1 – 3) for science, mathematics and social studies and has participated in regional reviews of the CXC curricula. The Unit has also been restructured, with all curriculum-related responsibilities now being placed under the responsibility of the Unit.

The project also trained two Fellows in school supervision, one of whom is on the staff of the School Administration and Management Unit (SAMU) of the MOE.

The impact of these interventions at the school level has been mixed. There is still a general absence of effort to make classroom instruction more relevant, with the standard reason advanced being lack of instructional materials and equipment. However, the lower secondary curricula for mathematics, science and social studies that had recently been introduced have been described as "very useful". It provided guidance in content for the lower secondary school in a situation where such had been lacking and teachers had resorted to teaching from the textbook. It was recommended that lower secondary curricula for the other subject areas would be just as beneficial.

The project has provided mathematics kits, science kits, teaching aids and textbooks to 58 primary schools, equipment for woodwork and metalwork to Boca Secondary school, and textbooks to all secondary schools. All of the support material provided has been put into use, but it is still too early to assess their impact as they were only delivered in the second half of 2001.

The project initiated the establishment of a Materials Production Unit and trained two Fellows in the requisite skills. The Unit has not had the initial impact envisaged due to space and equipment constraints in the original MOE building. Despite this, it has already proven its usefulness and has provided a number of services to the MOE including support to the Curriculum Division in the production of training materials, support to the Examinations and Testing Unit in the production of tests and the production and publication of a quarterly MOE newsletter, the MOE 2002 Calendar and the Corporate Plan.

The project initiated the establishment of and Educational and Testing Unit and trained two (2) Fellows in the requisite skills. This Unit has already had a significant impact on the educational system. It has redesigned the content of the Common Entrance Examinations and the School Leaving Examinations and has produced evaluations of results since 1998. These evaluations have been used by teachers at the school level to assess student and teaching weaknesses and to make necessary changes. It has also pioneered the introduction of Minimum Competency Tests (MCT) in English and Mathematics for the Grade 4 primary students in 1999 and Form 3 secondary students in 2000. All of the schools interviewed reported that the test content and feedback provided were very useful in assessing the development of their students at a sufficiently early stage to enable them to make meaningful interventions. All of the schools also reported having increased the coordination of the teaching in their lower classes, to ensure that students were better prepared by the time they were eligible for the MCT's.

The overall rating for this component is SATISFACTORY. The project has achieved its basic objective of increasing the capacity of the relevant departments to intervene positively at the school level and the interventions have been initiated.

3.3. EXPAND ACCESS TO SECONDARY SCHOOLS AND REFURBISHMENT OF PRIMARY AND SECONDARY SCHOOLS

After significant delays, the project completed the construction of the Westerhall Secondary School (WSS), although the number of places provided had to be reduced from the targeted 525 to 315. This reduction was required to ensure that the school was constructed within the budgetary allocations contained in the project. The Government has committed itself to expanding the school to the original designed capacity and has made the requisite provisions in the 2002 Budget. The replacement of the primary schools – St. Theresa's and St. John's R.C. - was also completed after significant delay and the refurbishment of the primary and secondary schools were completed during the period, although the process was initiated later than originally scheduled. In all of the civil works at the school level, there were many complaints over the adequacy of the design and the quality of work.

The expansion of SAASS and the enhancement of maintenance skills were not done. The Government has committed to completing the SAASS expansion during 2002 and the relevant provisions have been made in the Annual Estimates of Revenue and Expenditure.

A significant issue related to the civil works was the lack of beneficiary involvement in the design and implementation of these projects. Such involvement may have reduced the design and quality problems that occurred through this aspect of the civil works component.

Despite the shortcomings in design and quality, the learning environments in the two (2) primary schools have been significantly improved – all classes have separate classrooms, there is less disruption of classes as a result of activities in nearby classes, the physical environment is clean and safe, there is less noise within the school compound, there are facilities for staff, and the general environment is much more sanitary than that which obtained in the original buildings. The impact of the refurbishments on the learning environments in the refurbished schools varied with the scope of work, the objectives that were targeted and the quality of work done.

The sustainability of the physical facilities provided in the new secondary school, the replaced primary schools and the refurbished primary and secondary schools would depend on the extent to which appropriate maintenance practices are implemented at these facilities. At present, there are no systematic maintenance practices in place.

The rating for this component is SATISFACTORY. This is based on a satisfactory rating for three of the four sub-components, which together constituted the major proportion of project activity under this component.

4. BORROWER'S PERFORMANCE

The Government of Grenada fulfilled most of its responsibilities as required by the project in a satisfactory manner including the provision of US$1.39M more than originally committed to offset some of the cost over-runs.

However, there were delays in some areas that facilitated project implementation e.g. granting approval for the topographical surveys at St. John's R.C. and Westerhall Secondary, and the decision to change the original location of the MOE building to accommodate the Ministerial Complex. The failure to appoint a Clerk of Works to assist with civil works supervision as agreed during the mid-term review contributed to the poor quality of work received on many of the refurbishment projects.

The Ministry of Education also fulfilled its responsibilities although there were there were delays experienced in assigning the Project Manager, the Procurement Officer and Art Editor to their respective duties on a full time basis. These were not effected until the second half of the project cycle.

The PMU took some time to operate at the levels of efficiency and effectiveness envisioned by the Project. This was evidenced in the delays in initiating the civil works in the first two years of the project cycle, problems with financial reporting, utilisation of the procurement guidelines and the like. By the end of the project, the Unit had developed its expertise, as evidenced in it ability to successfully accelerate project implementation in the second half of the project cycle while managing other projects.

The Project Advisory Committee (PAC) was appointed but did not function effectively.

5. FINANCIER'S PERFORMANCE

The Financier fulfilled most of its responsibilities in a timely manner and was very flexible in its approach to project implementation as evidenced by the decision to provide retroactive financing for the activities implemented before the project became fully effective; the decision to include Boca Secondary School in the project despite the significant costs that was being incurred for this school; the decision to reallocate funds from expert services in economic planning at MOF to a second fellowship on social sector planning at the request of the Ministry of Finance and the decision to finance new expert services in curriculum when such a need was identified at the mid-term review.

The Financier was diligent in the monitoring of project implementation with all half-yearly visits being done on schedule. This proved to be a very important component of project implementation and is probably one of the major factors that influenced the ability of the project to achieve as much as it has. The Aide Memoires prepared at the end of each visit were very useful in identifying tasks that had to be accomplished to facilitate smooth project implementation. They proved very useful in assisting the Borrower to plan priority activities for the upcoming periods.

The impact of this monitoring activity has raised the question of whether or not more frequent monitoring (quarterly) may not have assisted during the first half of the project life cycle, given the relative inexperience of the PMU at that time.

6. FACTORS AFFECTING IMPLEMENTATION AND OUTCOME

A number of factors affected project implementation and outcome. Those within the control of the Borrower included:

- *Differences between content of advertised academic programs and actual content, which* resulted in Fellows not acquiring the desired skills and thus having to undergo further training. This delayed the achievement of the positive impact which these newly acquired skills were expected to have on the sector and hence the achievement of some of the developmental objectives.

- *Increases in market costs of project inputs.* This, combined with initial under-budgeting of the cost of civil works, resulted in the need to reduce the scope of works in the civil works component of the project. This had negative implications for the achievement of the full impacts that had been targeted for this component of the project.

There were also a number of factors which were subject to Borrower control including:

- *Provision of Project Manager, Procurement Officer and Art Editor on a dedicated basis and a Clerk of Civil Works for duration of civil works.* The failure to ensure that the Project Manager, Procurement Officer and Art Editor were available to the project on a full time basis resulted in delays in project implementation during the first half of the project cycle. The failure to ensure that a Clerk Of Civil Works was appointed, resulted in inadequate supervision of the civil works component, and consequent poor quality work on some of the buildings.
- *Site selection and availability for civil works components.* The delays in finalising the site for the MOE offices and in ensuring the availability of the sites that were not owned by the Government for the construction of the two new primary schools also contributed to the delays experienced in the civil works component.
- *Internal arrangements to utilise trained Fellows upon their return.* The fact that administrative arrangements were not always in place for the returned Fellows to conduct the training that had been envisaged compromised the achievement of the developmental impact that had been envisaged.
- *Late placement of Fellow in financial management.* The late placement of this Fellow meant that the strengthening of the financial analysis and monitoring that had been targeted was not realised.
- *Institutionalisation of planning function and capacity by appointment of relevant staff.* The delay in appointing the relevant personnel is slowing down the rate at the new management structures become fully operational.
- *Provision of adequate working environment and supporting materials to adequately capitalise on training of returned Fellows.* This is especially true at TAMCC, where the returned Fellows have indicated constraints of space and supportive materials and equipment.
- *Delays in processing payments by the Ministry of Finance* sometimes created delays in the expeditious implementation of project activities.

The factors that were subject to the control of the PMU included:

- *Beneficiary involvement in the planning stages.* The failure to involve beneficiaries in the planning and implementation compromised the quality and adequacy of some of the civil works done under the project.
- *Better communication of project objectives and interventions.* The availability of more information about the project and its objectives at the school level could have created a more conducive atmosphere at the school level for participation in project activities, especially in terms of making class room teaching more interactive and creative.
- *Better coordination and communication within the MOE management team.* The need for improved communication and coordination was illustrated by the lack of knowledge of the CDU of fact that the textbooks and instructional material that had been distributed. The institutionalisation of the reform process needs mutually reinforcing inputs from all departments and such lack of coordination is detrimental to such reinforcement.

7. KEY LESSONS LEARNT

The key lessons learnt during project preparation were:

- *The need for the project implementation schedule to be based on the capacity of the implementing institution.* This was highlighted by the slow initial pace of project implementation and the subsequent improvements in the rate of implementation as the PMU gained more experience in project management.
- *The provision of start-up technical support may be useful in compensating for weak start-up capacity.*
- *The costing of civil works should be based on the actual situation and not on generic prototypes.* This would prevent the types of budget over-runs which were experienced and which resulted in the need to significantly reduce the scope of the civil works.

The key lessons learnt during project implementation were:

- *The need to involve beneficiaries in project design and implementation.* This could have prevented many of the problems that were experienced with the adequacy of some of the civil works undertaken under the project.
- *The need to adequately research academic program content before sending Fellows off on training*, especially where specific skill sets are being targeted.
- *The need to adequately orient Fellows prior to departure* to ensure that they know what they are being trained for and the expectations regarding the utilisation of their newly acquired skills upon their return.
- *The need for internal communication and coordination between the various departments implementing the project.* This would prevent situations developing where one unit that was expected to reinforce the work of another unit could not do so, as the former was unaware of the actions that had been taken by the latter.
- *The necessity for strong quality assurance provisions in civil works contracts.*
- *The need to support reform activities with a strong marketing and communication effort* aimed at creating a reform culture or climate within the sector in order to ensure that the changes being initiated will be sustained after project completion. A project launch workshop would be a useful component of such an effort, as would mechanisms for the dissemination of project information throughout the life of the project.
- *The need for more appropriate models for transfer of skills learnt* e.g. school management, teacher training.
- *The need for better matching of expert services provision with the requirements of the recipients* e.g. ETX, procurement for civil works.
- *The need for rigorous selection procedures for Fellowships* to ensure that candidates have appropriate attitudes and have the potential to remain with the institution long enough for the latter to reap the benefits of the training.
- *The provision of training is not sufficient to ensure changes in behavior.* Systems and strategies have to be in place to ensure incorporation of the new skills into the Ministry's operations on a sustainable basis and their transfer to the school level, where appropriate.
- *The scope of civil works that is done in a rehabilitation project should be sufficient to make a positive impact on the learning environment in the schools.* Some of the school indicated that while the work done was useful, it did not impact significantly on the learning environment. This was relevant in situations where the condition of the school had deteriorated to such a poor state that much more work needed to be done to qualitatively improve the learning environment.
- *Project design should include a contingency to accommodate cost over-runs incurred as a result*

of under-budgeting by the project. This would reduce the need for one party (in this case the Government of Grenada) to have the bear the burden of such over-runs.

Additional Annex 9. Fellowship Progam and Expert Services.

Table I - Fellowship Program

PROJECT SUB-COMPONENT	PLANNED NO.OF PERSONS	SCHEDULED PLACEMENT	ACTUAL NO.OF PERSONS	ACTUAL PLACE-MENT	COMMENTS
Planning and Statistics					
Senior Management	2	June 1996	2	1996	PS and CEO undertook training at Harvard University
Financial Analysis	1	Sept 1996	1	Sept 00-01	
Education Planning	1	Sept 1996	–	–	*Was funded outside of the Project*
Education Statistics	1	Sept 1996	1	Sept 1997	
Economic Planning	1	Sept 1996	1	Sept 96-97	Resumed duties as the Head of research Economic Affairs Division on completion
Social Sector Planning	1	Sept 1996	2	(1) 97-98 (1) 98-99	Resumed duties as Permanent Secretary of Finance Resumed duties as Head of Project and Development Corporation
Project Management					
Project Manager	1	Feb-Jun 96	1	Nov-Dec 96	Now PS MOE Attended 2 WB training workshops and attended training in New Mexico University in Project management
Project Accountant	1	Feb-Jun 96	1	Nov-Dec 96	Still at PMU Attended 2 WB training workshops, workshop in Microsoft project, and was attached to Dominica PMU
Procurement Officer	1	Feb-Jun 96	1	Nov-Dec 96	Still at PMU Attended 2 WB training workshops, workshop, Three days attachment in Dominica PMU
<u>Teacher Educator</u>	4	Sept 96 (2) Sept 97 (1) Sept 98 (1)	5	(3) 96-97 (1) 97-98 (1) 98-99	Presently at Teachers College TAMCC
<u>Secondary school Teachers</u>	6	Sept 97- 98 (6) Sept 98-99 (1)	7	Sept 97- (6) Sept 98 (1)	All are School Principals with the exception of Ms Simon who is now EO for Carriacou.
School Supervision	2	Sept 96 (1) Sept 97 (1)	2	99-00	Presently in MOE
Curriculum Development	4	Sept 96 (2) Sept 97 (2)	4	96-97	Presently in MOE
Production and Procurement of Education Materials	2	Sept 96	2	96-97	Presently in MOE
Education Testing and Measurement	2	Sept 96	2	96-97	Presently in MOE

Table 2– Expert Services

PROJECT SUB-COMPONENT	PLANNED NO. OF PERSON	SCHEDULED PERIOD OF SERVICE	PLANNED DURATION DURATION	ACTUAL PERIOD OF SERVICE	DURATION	COMMENTS
Management & Administration/ Audit of the MOE	1	Jun – Aug 1996 Jun – Aug 1997	6 months	6 months	Jan-Aug 2000	Final report on the Min has been handed in
Educational Planning	1	June – Aug 1996 June – Aug 1997	6 months	6 months	Aug-Dec 1999	At the end of this consultancy the final long range plan was not accomplished
Project Management	1	May – Dec 1996	8 months	4 months	July-Nov 1998	Well executed and final Project Document was submitted
Procurement Specialist	1	Mar – Apr 1996	2 months	3 months	Feb-may 1998	Contract was well executed
General Editing	1	Jun – Aug 1996 Jun – Aug 1997	6 months	N/A	N/A	Fellows were trained in this area.
Production of Reading Materials	1	Aug – Sep 1997	6 months	4 months	Sept 2001- Jan 2002	Draft reports have been handed in. The Min has since submitted comments to Consultant for follow up.
Educational Testing and Measurement	1	Jan – Mar 1997 Jan – Mar 1998	6 months	Three (3) months	Oct-Dec 2001	Final reports handed in. This consultancy has been well executed
Economic Planning	1	Jun – Aug 1996 Jun – Aug 1997	6 months	N/A	N/A	N/A
Auditing of Project Accounts	Gov't Dept	Annually	Annually	Annually		Consultancy has been well executed
Education Statistics	1		2 months	Three (3) months		Consultancy has been well executed
School Plant Survey	1	N/A	N/A	8 months	Jun 2000-March 2001	Consultancy has been well executed
Curriculum Development	1	N/A	4 months	Two years	Oct 1999	All reports except the final report have been handed in

Additional Annex 10. Training Workshops Conducted Under the Project

WORKSHOP THEME	TARGET GROUP	COMMENTS
Professional Development Workshop	Teachers of Primary School	Participants 120 Held 8th- 12th June 1999and July 13-27 1998
Development in Maths, Science & Social Studies	Teachers of Primary School	63 Participants Held 7th – 17th Dec. 1998
Curriculum Development – Science Syllabus	Lower Secondary school	16th & 17th Mar. 1999
Workshop for teachers of French	Secondary School Teachers	Participants 28 Mar. 10, 1999
Workshop in Remedial Teaching		200 Participants 20 training days August 2000
Teaching of Social Studies	Lower Secondary Teachers	20 Participants 25 – 31 Aug., 2000
Teachers of Spanish	Secondary School Teachers	35 Participants 31st Oct., 2000
Strategic Corporate Planning	MOE Staff	9-19 Oct. 2000
Information Technology	Primary School Principals	25 participants 30 Oct., 2000– 28 Feb., 2001
Teaching of Social Studies in Carriacou	Lower Secondary Teachers	25 Participants 28-30 Nov., & 1 Dec. 2000
Teaching of Social Studies	Lower Secondary Teachers	35 Participants Nov.1,2,8,9,1516,22,23; 2000
Teaching of Language Arts	Primary School Teachers	60 Participants Jan. 17,18,24, 25 & Feb.1; 2001
Language Arts Workshop	Primary School Teachers	40 Participants 14-16 Feb. 2001
Teaching Language & Literacy – Policies & Procedures for Vernacular Situations	Primary and Secondary School Teachers	43 Participants 21-23 Feb. 2001
Teaching of English	Secondary Teachers	40 Participants 14-16 Mar. 2001
Testing & Measurement Workshop	Grade 4 Primary Teachers	52 Participants 4&5 Apr. 2001
Maintenance Workshop	School Maintenance Officers	25 Participants 18-19 Apr. 2001
Principals & Education Officers workshop		29 Participants 23-27 Apr. 2001
Testing & Measurement Workshop		34 participants 7&8 June, 2001
Mathematics Workshop	Secondary School Teachers	35 Participants 9-13 July, 2001
Diffusion & Implementation of Curriculum Innovations	Curriculum and Education Officers	30 Participants 3-7 Dec. 2001
Writing & Designing Instructional Materials		20 Participants 18-20 July, 2001
Teaching & Writing the MCT Exams		40 Participants 16-18 July, 2001
T&M Workshop C'cou		12 participants 30-31 Aug. 2001
School Mgt	Primary School Teachers	83 Participants 14,18,19,20,21 Sept. 2001
Cur. Dev. & Education Officers		34 Participants 25 Sept. 2001
School Management	Secondary School Teachers	18 Participants 4,6,18 Oct. 2001
T&M Item Writers	Secondary School Teachers	50 Participants Oct. 29&30; 2001
Item Writers	Secondary School Teachers	50 Participants Nov. 7-8; 2001

Additional Annex 11. School Visits - Issues Raised on Civil Works in Primary and Secondary Schools

SCHOOL	WORK DONE	ISSUES RAISED	IMPACT OF WORK DONE
1. Westerhall Secondary	New secondary school	. Reduction in scope creating space problems e.g. inadequate space to hold assembly . Defects in plumbing, electrical works, locks, drainage, cracks in building.	New school with design capacity to accommodate 315 students
2. St. Theresa's R.C.	Replacement of primary school	. No input into design . Insufficient number of classrooms - 7 provided when school has 8 classes. Had to use staff room for additional class . No space for preschool department which was left in old building . Poor external drainage . A few cracks in building	Improved learning environment for children and working environment for teachers
3. St. John's R.C.	Replacement of primary school	. No input into design – never saw the plan. . Poor design – leaking walkway, no auditorium or space to hold assembly; no provisions for kitchen, lunch area (had to be donated by private person); no accommodation for pre primary school . Poor quality work – defective lights, cracks in walls; poor locks; plumbing – were rectified during the defective liability period	Improved learning environment for children and working environment for teachers
4. Anglican High School	Repairs to roof and ceiling of and redesign of cookery room and science lab	. Poor quality work – leaking roof; sinks in cookery room blocked up; reduced accommodation in science lab; termites on one side of repaired roof.	Cookery room easier to work in
5. Bishop's College	Not Visited		
6. Boca Secondary	Construction of new wing – 3 additional classrooms, Woodwork and metal labs with equipment; 2 science labs	. Poor location of technical rooms given need to bring in heavy equipment and supplies; leaking roofs in both labs; faulty plumbing; leaks in gas pipes in metal-works lab; electrical problems; small labs	Increased capacity and facilities
7. Grenville Secondary	Repairs to windows, roof, screens, banister in corridor, washrooms	. Roof still leaking . Poor quality locks, screens, plumbing . Bannister not durable	Improvement in physical condition of areas where work was done
8. Mc Donald College	Not Visited		

SCHOOL	WORK DONE	ISSUES RAISED	IMPACT OF WORK DONE
9. Mt. Rose SDA	Replace roof, cupboards in laboratory, screens and minor work in toilets	Initial leaks in roof that was rectified. Work in laboratory insufficient to have made an impact	
10. St. Dominic's R.C.	Not Visited		
11. St. John's Christian Secondary	. New Principal's office, secretary's office, staff room. . Refurbished science lab . Replace wooden floors . Replace zinc roofing	. Satisfied with quality of work done	Significant improvement in physical condition of school, working condition of staff and learning environment of teachers
12. St. Mary's R.C.	Repairs to roof of Junior and Senior departments and toilets; repairs to internal and external walls	. Roof still leaking . Timing inappropriate and disrupted classes . No involvement in final decision	. Improvement in physical condition of areas where work was done. Entire school in need of repairs
13. St. George's Methodist	Roof of 3 buildings replaces; and replace metal bottom wall panels with concrete	Poor quality work – roof still leaking, poor quality locks, metal side panels not bolted back in place, poor quality paint job.	Safety issues resulting from loose metal parts addressed. Entire school in need of repairs
14. Woburn R.C.	New office, staff room, additional classroom and kitchen	. Poor quality work – electrical problems which resulted in loss of photocopier; initial leaks in roof; initial water seepage; no guttering on side and front of roof. . Inappropriate timing which disrupted classes and required temporary relocation	Significant improvement in learning environment and working conditions

IMAGING

Report No.: 24023
Type: ICR